

**The New Order in the New World:
A Comparison of the Catholic Corporatist Movements in Brazil and Quebec
(1931-1945)**

Clélio Ayrton de Lima Pontes

**A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
MA degree in History**

**Department of History
Faculty of Arts
University of Ottawa**

© Clélio Ayrton de Lima Pontes, Ottawa, Canada, 2017

ABSTRACT	III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	V
INTRODUCTION	1
1. THE CATHOLIC SOCIAL DOCTRINE.....	9
2. A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CATHOLIC CORPORATISM IN BRAZIL AND QUEBEC.....	12
3. PRIMARY SOURCES.....	14
4. METHODOLOGY	18
5. THE CATHOLIC CHURCH IN BRAZIL AND QUEBEC – EARLY XX TH CENTURY	21
6. HISTORIOGRAPHY	28
CHAPTER I: INFLUENCES	47
1. THE PAPAL ENCYCLICALS.....	50
2. CATHOLIC INTELLECTUAL INFLUENCES.....	55
3. ITALIAN CORPORATISM.....	67
4. PORTUGUESE CORPORATISM	72
CHAPTER II: THE INSTITUTIONS OF CATHOLIC CORPORATISM.....	81
1. THE CATHOLIC ACTION.....	84
2. THE CATHOLIC YOUTH MOVEMENTS	89
3. CATHOLIC ACTION AND POLITICS	96
4. UNIONS.....	101
4. THE STATE	115
5. AUTHORITARIAN AND DEMOCRATIC RULE	125
CHAPTER III: IDEOLOGIES	133
1. COMMUNISM	135
2. LIBERALISM.....	143
3. NATIONALISM AND THE CATHOLIC CHURCH	152
CONCLUSION.....	162
1. THE LEGACY OF CORPORATISM	165
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	171

ABSTRACT

This thesis is a comparative study of the Catholic corporatist movement in Brazil and Quebec between 1931 and 1945. It analyses how Catholic intellectuals in these countries adapted the Catholic social doctrine and Catholic corporatism to their distinct realities. The methodology pursued relies on contrasting the ideas expressed in the publications of the two main institutions to profess the Catholic corporatism in their societies, namely the Dom Vital Center (DVC) in Brazil and the École Sociale Populaire (ESP) in Quebec.

This thesis begins by demonstrating that even before the publication of the encyclical *Quadragesimo Anno*, the ESP and of the DVC had already established a tradition of thought that relied on the influences of distinct Catholic intellectuals. Such influences are fundamental to understand how French Canadian Catholic corporatists developed a corporatist thought directed towards the development of union movements, while their Brazilian counterparts saw corporatism as a new form of state that would replace the institutions of the Old Republic.

Furthermore, this thesis also aims to demonstrate how the distinct social and economic contexts of Brazil and Quebec influenced the Catholic corporatist models proposed by the ESP and the DVC. While the industrial context of Quebec led the ESP to focus on solving the issues related to the “social question”, the rural characteristics of Brazilian society led the DVC to dedicate their attention to countering the advances of political secularism. As a result, while Catholic corporatists in Brazil and Quebec followed the directives of the same papal encyclicals, they developed their corporatist ideas as solutions to distinct problems.

Finally, this thesis also analyses how the ESP and the DVC adapted the Catholic criticisms of communism and liberalism to their realities and studies the roles that the Catholic right placed on corporatism in the development of their national identities.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to first express my gratitude towards Professor Damien-Claude Bélanger, who in addition to providing patient guidance throughout this study, was also responsible for opening the doors that allowed my journey from Rio de Janeiro to Canada's Capital. He was always there to help me and provide me with invaluable insight that urged me to push my limits. I would also like to thank the University of Ottawa for providing me with the resources and the financial assistance that permitted me to pursue this endeavour.

I am particularly indebted to my parents, Mauro and Andrea, whose unwavering support and encouragement has inspired me to pursue my dreams. I would equally like to thank all of my family and friends who gracefully listened to me go on and on about something called 'corporatism'. I am also extremely grateful for the time dedicated by good friend, Daniel Meltzer, to assist me with his acute editing skills.

Lastly, I would like to thank my fiancée, Sarah De Rose, who was by my side every step of this journey. Without the love and comfort you provided me during the most challenging of times, this thesis would never have been possible.

INTRODUCTION

This comparison of the Catholic corporatist movements in Brazil and Quebec was undertaken with three objectives in mind: first, to understand the ideas defended by Catholic corporatists between 1931 and 1945; second, to demonstrate that the Catholic Church was an independent institution that followed its own objectives based on a spiritual view of society which included political objectives; and third, to expose the Catholic social doctrine's malleability and adaptability to distinct societies by focusing on how varying economic and social contexts led Catholics in Brazil and Quebec to support the instauration of different corporatist institutions. I believe that pursuing a comparative approach with Brazil and Quebec will help to promote these three objectives by demonstrating the international popularity of this doctrine and by creating an novel bridge between two very distinct historiographies.

This thesis does not aim to describe the entirety of the corporatist movement in Brazil or Quebec nor does it attempt to analyse all of the Catholic initiatives in these societies. Instead this thesis compares the ideas of the two most important institutions with regards to Catholic corporatism in Brazil and in Quebec: the Centro Dom Vital (DVC) and the École Sociale Populaire (ESP). While these institutions were not the only corporatist movement to attract the support of Catholics in their societies, the ESP and the DVC were the only sources of corporatist propaganda to have direct relationship with Rome, rendering them the primary connection between the Papal ideologies and local intellectuals. However, before a comparison can be drawn, it is

vital to define the concepts that are fundamental to this discussion, such as the corporatist movement itself.

Since the 1930s, the meaning of corporatism has experienced numerous transformations. Today, if one disregards historically driven studies, the term “corporation” is more likely to be understood as a profit driven legal entity comprised of stakeholders as opposed to its pre-World War II meaning of a union-based organization representing an economic sector. Historian Pierre Trepanier argues that the term corporatism began to lose its original meaning as a result of political theorists rejecting the word due to its correlation with the Nazi and Fascist regimes, a phenomena that was considerably intensified as World War II drew to an end.¹ After 1945, some of those who had openly supported corporatism during the war either began to use different terminology to explain the same ideas, or entirely withdrew themselves from the movement.²

In the Cold War, the antagonism that emerged between the United States and the Soviet Union further complicated corporatist political studies. According to the political scientist Howard Wiarda, as Western society became preoccupied with defending the rights of individuals, arguments for a system which diminished individualism in exchange for social interests was likely to be generalized as communism.³ Wiarda’s argument can be exemplified in a quote by the liberation

¹ Pierre Trépagnier, “Quel corporatisme? (1820-1965)”, *Les Cahier des dix*, n 49, 1994

² *ibid.*

³ Howard Wiarda. *Corporatism and comparative politics: the other great "ism"*. (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe 1997).

theologist Father Dom Helder Camara, who once stated “when I give food to the poor, they call me a saint. When I ask why they are poor, they call me a communist.”⁴

Therefore, in surprising conceptual fluctuations, corporatist ideas have been generalized as pertaining to both the far right and the far left of the political spectrum. Such conceptual turbulence is symptomatic of a lack of a proper understanding of the movement. However, despite the fact that the use of the term “corporatism” diminished overtime, according to the French economist Alain Cotta, corporatist policies never ceased to be applied and the movement was able to achieve a “silent victory.”⁵

While the movement is largely unknown today, corporatism was widely discussed in the 1930s, and many agreed with Mihail Manoilescu’s prediction that the twentieth century would be “the century of corporatism.”⁶ The popularity of the movement at the time produced a large number of novel ideas which have been the focus of a number of academic studies. While these studies have contributed to clarifying the movement, corporatism remains an unsettled concept particularly due to the remarkable variations that corporatist institutions can adopt. Such diversity has been noticed since the 1930s, as demonstrated in a statement by a French student quoted by Philippe C. Schmitter:

The army of corporatists is so disparate that one is led to think that the word corporation itself is like a label placed on a whole batch of bottles which are then distributed among diverse producers each of whom fills them with the drink of his choice. The consumer has to look carefully.⁷

⁴ “Quando dou comida aos pobres chamam-me de santo. Quando pergunto por que eles são pobres chamam-me de comunista.” Zildo Rocha, *Helder, o dom: uma vida que marcou os rumos da Igreja no Brasil*. Petrópolis: Editora Vozes. 1999, 53.

⁵ Pierre Trépanier, “Quel corporatisme? (1820-1965)”, 159

⁶ Philippe Schmitter. . “Still the Century of Corporatism?”. *The Review of Politics* 36 (1). [University of Notre Dame du lac, Cambridge University Press, 1974], 85.

⁷ *ibid*, 88.

However, before analyzing the many variations that corporatist regimes can adopt, a definition of the movement ought to begin by establishing the main characteristics that are common to all of corporatist experiences. To do so we turn to Clinton Archibald, who stated:

Un postulat commun à tous les corporatistes, veut donc que l'harmonie des classes sociales et l'unité organique de la société, bien qu'étant intrinsèques à la société elle-même, ne puissent être maintenues que par un système de droits égaux et d'obligations semblables unissant les divers groupes fonctionnels, et surtout le capital et le travail. À partir de ce schéma, les programmes corporatistes préconisent un idéal collectif du maintien de la hiérarchie fonctionnelle et de la discipline sociale qui, bien sûr, converge avec les besoins de l'État dans son ensemble.⁸

In this definition, Archibald touches on two aspects that are central to all corporatist movements: first, the belief that society is not simply a collection of individuals, but organically structured into different groups that possess common interests. Corporatists of the early twentieth century were influenced by intellectuals that were fierce critics of the French Revolution, and this aspect of corporatism was a direct challenge to the ideas of individualism ushered in by the liberal philosophers of the French Revolution.

The second characteristic proposed by Archibald situates the corporatist movement in a historical context, defining corporatism as a direct reaction to the industrial revolution and the new interactions between social classes. As demonstrated by Howard Wiarda, ideas that denounce individualism can be traced as far back as Aristotle. In fact, the very name of the movement makes reference to the medieval corporations or guilds, which many early twentieth century corporatists idealized as an

⁸ Clinton Archibald: *Un Québec corporatiste?: corporatisme et néo-corporatisme, du passage d'une idéologie corporatiste sociale à une idéologie corporatiste politique : le Québec de 1930 à nos jours*. Hull, Québec: Editions Asticou 1983, 16.

organic fraternal organization for the benefit of a professional sector.⁹ However, the medieval corporations were not part of a “corporatist system”¹⁰, because differently from the modern corporation, their objective was not to solve conflicts between the working class and the capital markets. Therefore, to classify medieval corporations as an early corporatist movement would be an anachronistic error.

These two characteristics proposed by Archibald are vital to comprehend other common components of the corporatist theory, such as the focus that the movement placed on professional organizations. According to corporatists, unions were the industrial world’s adaptation of organically structured social groups and the natural representatives of the different social classes. All forms of corporatism believed that the social classes could congregate and decide together the economic and social policies of their nation through professional representation in the form of union-based corporations. For this reason, most forms of corporatism relied on the creation of a corporative chamber¹¹ where such discussions could take place.

Despite agreeing on these general principles, corporatists were not always in accordance with the details of how the social classes ought to be represented. Such discord resulted in a great number of variations with regards to the institutions proposed by different corporatist intellectuals. In order to better understand their differences, authors such as Clinton Archibald and Pierre Trepagnier classified the corporatist movement in different branches, namely, state corporatism, social corporatism and neo-corporatism.

⁹ Howard Wiarda. *Corporatism and comparative politics: the other great "ism"*, 28-29.

¹⁰ *ibid.*

¹¹ Not all forms of corporatism refer to such institution as the “corporative chamber”. Regardless of the different names, its purpose of congregating the different social classes to jointly decided on economic and social aspects of society remains a constant factor.

According to these authors, state-corporatists argued that the organic groups of society ought to have direct representation in the State. To do this, professional associations had to receive legitimate forms of political representation. Unions were to be organized in a hierarchical system in which union leaders would congregate into corporations and represent the classes in a legislative corporative chamber.

A prime example of state corporatism was the Italian regime under the command of Benito Mussolini. The Fascist political system organized its corporative chamber within the State where state-controlled unions, the *Fascio*, became the sole form of political representation, following *Il Duce*'s famous motto, "all within the State, nothing outside the State, nothing against the State".¹² This example was the most debated corporatist regime at the time, and its state-focused approach was both praised and criticised by many corporatists.

Another notable example was the Portuguese regime established by Oliveira Salazar. Differently from the Italian model, the Portuguese *Estado Novo* still relied on individual votes reserved for certain political positions. Nonetheless, its main legislative institution was the corporative chamber, where the most influential groups of society congregated, including corporations for the sectors of agriculture, industry, commerce, and others. According to Clinton Archibald, the Portuguese corporative chamber was based on the principles of "restrained representation, reduced specialization and hierarchisation" in which "l'État contrôlerait les mécanismes corporatistes."¹³

¹² Clinton Archibald: *Un Québec Corporatiste?*, 21-26.

¹³ *ibid*, 28.

Many other nations experienced or had supporters of state corporatism, including Brazil and Quebec. In Brazil, two main political movements carried this label: the Integralist Action led by Plínio Salgado and the corporatist project of Oliveira Vianna, carried out by Getúlio Vargas with the establishment of the Brazilian *Estado Novo* in 1937. However, support for state corporatism in Brazil can be found even before this time, as the Brazilian constitution of 1934 already granted corporations seats in the national congress.

As for Quebec, state corporatism found its basis in the followers of Adrien Arcand. Arcand's corporatism relied on the demise of political parties, with partisan representation being completely substituted by professional representation. However, Arcand's ideas remained at the margins of the corporatist movement in Quebec, mostly overshadowed by the ideas of the majority of Quebec corporatists, who preferred not to change the parliamentary system of political representation.

While Mussolini and Salazar referred to their regimes simply as "corporatism", those who disagreed with a state focused model of corporatism and wished to distinguish themselves from it labeled themselves "social corporatists." While state and social corporatists both believed that a hierarchical institution based on unions was necessary for social harmony, social-corporatists were against the attachment of corporations as part of the State, fearing that such attachment would limit the corporations' freedom. Social corporatists believed that to properly represent societal groups, the corporative chamber ought to work in conjunction with the State yet remain an independent body. Under this model, corporations would eventually acquire all

authority over social and economic policies, thus allowing for a smaller and more efficient State.

Both state and social corporatist projects coexisted before the Cold War. While their supporters disagreed over the role of the State, both were considered to be part of a reactionary movement that promoted an anti-liberal agenda. Years after World War II, corporatism would once again emerge as a new area of political interest, but re-characterized as a policy of the left. Referred to as neo-corporatism, this model was based on a tripartite theory in which labour, capital and the State would work together to develop the economic and social policies of a country. This redefinition of corporatism was adopted by social democrats around the world and led to the development of a number of national welfare policies once the needs of the working class were taken into consideration.¹⁴ While we shall not dwell too long on Neo-Corporatism, since it surpasses the period analysed in this thesis, it is worth noting how this re-characterization of corporatism illustrates the malleability of the corporatist movement and its continued relevance in ongoing discussions on present-day class relations.

The definition of corporatism and its different models as illustrated above were drawn from Clinton Archibald's book and Pierre Trépanier's article. Though these classifications provide an excellent introduction to the subject, as we delve into the focus of this thesis, namely Catholic corporatism, we notice that Archibald and Trépanier's approach of characterizing corporatist movements by the institutions they defended is insufficient. As argued by historian Jesse Jane Vieira, the Catholic Church is, in its essence, a mystical institution whose logic can only be fully understood if

¹⁴ Howard Wiarda. *Corporatism and comparative politics: the other great "ism"*, 118-120.

considered within the Catholic spiritual mindframe.¹⁵ Therefore, a further factor must be considered when studying the corporatism proposed by Catholics. While the study of institutions is required, so is the relationship between corporatism and the larger movement of the Catholic social doctrine. As it will be illustrated, for Catholics, the establishment of corporatist institutions was not the objective itself, but rather a means to a higher spiritual end.

1. The Catholic Social Doctrine

The Catholic social doctrine was the Church's response to social problems that developed due to the industrial revolution, also referred to as the social question. It became the official doctrine of the Church with the publication of the Encyclical *Rerum Novarum* by Leo XII in 1891. Amongst the most notable affirmations of the encyclical was the inclusion of the Catholic Church in social and economic matters, which until then were mostly considered to pertain solely to the temporal sphere. *Rerum Novarum* also affirmed that the working class had natural rights, including the right of organization, notably in unions or corporations. However, the encyclical also reinforced that the working class organizations had to remain obedient to their patrons, and specially refrain from adopting socialist ideas. These directions, amongst others that will be better analysed later in this thesis, became the basis for the development of the Catholic thought in the twentieth century.

But the Catholic social doctrine was far from the first answer to the class conflicts generated by the industrial revolution. By the time that Pope Leo XIII

¹⁵ Jessie Jane Vieira de Souza, *Círculos Operários: a Igreja Católica e o mundo do trabalho no Brasil*, (Rio de Janeiro: FAPERJ, Editora UFRJ, 2002).

publicized the doctrine in 1891, the Second International had already begun and Karl Marx's Communist Manifesto was almost half a century old. Many historians interpret the Catholic Church's late response as a demonstration that their social doctrine was less concerned with solving the social question, and more preoccupied with keeping the communist movement under control. Another common interpretation is that this delayed reaction reflected the institution's inherent elitism, which led the clergy to turn a blind eye to the social issues in order to defend a traditional social hierarchy.

However, these interpretations fail to recognize the Catholic Church as an institution that had long seen itself as the lasting symbol of the *ancien régime* and hence faced many difficulties in adapting its philosophy to modern realities. It is true that until the end of the nineteenth century, the majority of Catholics refused to admit that institutional change was necessary to resolve the issues brought about by the industrial world. However, as argued by Roger Aubert:

[The Church's delay] is less due to selfishness or to ignorance of the actual situation than it is to a lack of understanding of the new problems posed by the industrial revolution. Many are indeed aware of the lamentable conditions of the workers, but the only solution they can think of proposing is private charity.¹⁶

While the increase of communist activity undoubtedly influenced Catholics by casting a sense of urgency for action, the Catholic social doctrine was not an impulsive response, but the result of long and careful studying, testing and debate. In 1891, Pope Leo XIII published *Rerum Novarum*, the first papal encyclical detailing the Catholic social doctrine. However, as early as 1865, pioneer social Catholics such as Monsignor Ketteler, Frédéric Le Play and René de La Tour du Pin, had already argued that the social question was more than just a matter of private charity and that the answer to the

¹⁶ Roger Aubert, and David A. Boileau: *Catholic social teaching: an historical perspective*. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press 2003, 75

social problem was linked to the development of Catholic working associations. A notable example was *L'oeuvre des cercles catholique d'ouvriers* founded by La Tour du Pin and Albert de Mun, which by 1881 was comprised of 550 Catholic working associations, totalling approximately 5000 workers in France.¹⁷

Despite this lengthy debate, the spirit of traditionalism within the Catholic Church remained strong and even in 1930s social Catholics still encountered resistance from conservative members of the institution. This refusal to accept the social question as a spiritual matter reflects the impact that the industrial world had on the Catholic thought. The Catholic social doctrine was not only a recognition of the industrial social problems, but also a transformation of the Catholic worldview. Without denying the supremacy of spirituality, the new doctrine acknowledged the importance of temporal institutions, urging Catholics to act in order to guarantee that all could achieve the material necessities required for the completion of one's mission on earth.

An analysis of the papal encyclicals and its spiritual objectives confirms the argument that corporatist institutions were, in fact, only one part of the larger Catholic social doctrine. By arguing that the lack of spirituality was the main cause for increasing class conflict, Pope Leo XIII popularized the belief that the source of the social question was spiritual, and that only a restoration of Christian values could fully solve the social question. This fundamental belief was a denial not only of socialism, but of any secular solution that focused solely on the material aspect of the social question.¹⁸

¹⁷ Christopher Blum. 2003. *Critics of the enlightenment: readings in the French counter-revolutionary tradition*. (Wilmington, Del: ISI Books 2003), xlvi

¹⁸ Leo XIII, *Rerum Novarum*.

The focus on a spiritual solution for the social question remained a central part of the Catholic social doctrine even after 1931, when Pius XI proposed a more detailed institutional reform with the encyclical *Quadragesimo Anno*. In this encyclical, which many consider as the birth of Catholic corporatism, the Pope stated that none of his proposed institutions would have the desired effect, unless they were also accompanied by a reintroduction of Catholic morals:

Yet, if we look into the matter more carefully and more thoroughly, we shall clearly perceive that, preceding this ardently desired social restoration, there must be a renewal of the Christian spirit, from which so many immersed in economic life have, far and wide, unhappily fallen away, lest all our efforts be wasted and our house be built not on a rock but on shifting sand.¹⁹

The prevalence of spiritual over an institutional reform allowed for the directives set by the Popes to be interpreted by Catholics with institutional variations. The Church was willing to support these institutional discrepancies amongst Catholics worldwide, as long as Catholic corporatist remained focused on what was considered to be the most important mission: the restoration of Catholic values to society. It was by being part of this Catholic social doctrine aimed at spiritual reform, that we can begin to situate Catholic corporatists in Quebec and in Brazil as part of the same movement, despite the fact that they defended the establishment of different institutions.

2. A Comparative Study of Catholic Corporatism in Brazil and Quebec

There are important advantages to the comparative approach in the study of corporatism. By comparing the details belonging to the distinct corporative models, it becomes clearer at which points these models diverged and in which points they converged and influenced one another. Such benefits led corporatists of the twentieth

¹⁹ Pius XI, *Quadragesimo Anno*, paragraph 127

century to utilize a comparative approach to demonstrate the details of their own ideas. Furthermore, historians such as Olivier Dart and Didier Musiedlak also recognized the importance of comparisons by publishing books that reunited articles describing side by side the corporative ideas of distinct countries.²⁰

However, a second question that must also be addressed is why Brazil and Quebec have been selected as the subjects of this study given that the differences in their demography, historical formation, geography, etc, pose significant challenges when attempting to compare the corporatist structures of these two societies. Despite such differences, Brazil and Quebec have a few points of convergences that benefit this comparison: First, both societies experienced strong corporatist movements. Even if corporatism never became a reality in Quebec as it did in Brazil, between 1931 and 1945, the ideology achieved great popularity amongst the intellectuals of both societies. Second, Brazil and Quebec are examples of cultures that evolved under great influence of Catholicism. This second characteristic, in addition to the popularity of corporatism in both places, ultimately rendered these two contrasting societies fertile breeding grounds for the development of Catholic corporatist ideas. Lastly, while Catholic corporatists in both Brazil and Quebec were attentive to the same European corporatist examples, they developed their own ideas independently from each other. The fact that there was little to no connection between the intellectuals in Brazil and Quebec allows us to better understand how, despite analysing the same European examples and drawing their inspirations from the same papal encyclicals, Catholic corporatist could support the development of distinct corporatist institutions.

²⁰ Olivier Dart, *Le corporatisme dans l'aire francophone au XXe siècle*. (Berne: Lang, 2011) and Didier Musiedlak, *Les expériences corporatives dans l'aire latine*. (Bern: Lang, 2010).

Most corporatist studies rely on a comparison with European regimes. Therefore, contrasting the state-focused corporatism developed by Brazilian Catholics with the union-focused corporatism of French Canadian Traditionalists represents a new approach to understanding corporatism in the New World. As it will be demonstrated throughout this thesis, by undertaking a parallel analysis of the adaptations made by two expressive examples of Catholic corporatism, we can understand how distinct socio/economic factors were vital in adapting European ideas to the Americas.

3. Primary Sources

Between 1931 and 1945, both Brazil and Quebec each had their own vanguard institutions to promote Catholic corporatism. In Brazil, this institution was the Dom Vital Center (DVC), founded in 1922 by Jackson de Figueiredo. While guided by Cardinal Dom Sebastião Leme, the DVC was composed and managed in great part by lay Catholics who undertook the responsibility of spreading the Catholic social doctrine amongst the Brazilian elites.²¹ Following Figueiredo's untimely death, Alceu Amoroso Lima, also known by his pseudonym Tristão de Athayde,²² assumed the leadership of the Center from 1928 until 1968, becoming the DVC's longest standing and most iconic leader. During the Vargas era (1930-1945), the center witnessed its most significant period of expansion, increasing the number of publications sold, founding branches in other cities and acquiring considerable political influence.

²¹ An important exception was that of the Jesuit priest Father Leonel Franca, who had been appointed by Cardinal Sebastião Leme as the center's spiritual guide. Franca was particularly important to the development of the Brazilian Catholic University (today known as Pontifícia Universidade Católica), where he also became the first dean.

²² In order to avoid any confusion, I have chosen to refer to Alceu Amoroso Lima only by his name and not his pseudonym, Tristão de Athaíde.

Their main ideological outlet was the monthly journal *A Ordem*, where members of the clergy, religious intellectuals and other prominent members of society sought to develop a Brazilian Catholic thought. The circulation of the journal was very limited, due to the fact that its articles required from the reader a high level of education. The focus on advanced themes such as philosophy, politics and literature, in addition to the use of sophisticated language that included many untranslated quotes in French had little penetration in the Brazilian population that was still largely illiterate.²³

However, the importance of the DVC did not come from the number of journals they sold, but from the influence that its members and readers were able to exert in the high escalons of the political class. DVC members such as Alceu Lima, Sobral Pinto and Jonathas Serrano all had acquired considerable fame even before becoming part of the Center and they were able to use their social capital to influence Vargas' government, notably in the 1934 Constitutional assembly.²⁴ Furthermore, many of its readers had important roles in Vargas' administration and were also able to carry the Catholic social doctrine to central governmental institutions such as the ministry of Labour and the ministry of education.²⁵

²³ According to *A Ordem*, the amount of subscribers in 1930 never surpassed 570, though this number tripled by 1934.

²⁴ From a young age, Alceu Lima had taken part in a number of literature circles where he was introduced to a number of important members of the *Carioca* cultural elite, including Jackson de Figueiredo. He was also famous for his works as a journalist (under the pseudonym of Tristão de Athayde). Sobral Pinto, on the other hand, was a renowned lawyer who had worked on a number of important cases in the 1920s. He also gained notoriety for participating in the famous presidential campaign of Rui Barbosa, which became known as the *Campanha Civilista*. Jonathas Serrano's family was well known in Rio thanks to his father who had been a member of the military and senator in the early days of the Republic. Serrano also created a number of Catholic groups, such as the *União Católica Brasileira*, and occupied a leadership position as the secretary of education in the capital. These three men are great examples of a pattern that follows through most of the members of the DVC: Devoted Catholics with superior education, considerable social and economic capital, and professional experience within the State.

²⁵ The DVC was able to acquire allies in the ministry of labour, which was the most important government branch with regards to the implementation of corporatist institutions: Two of the three first

With the objective of “Christianizing Brazilian intellectuality”²⁶, the articles in *A Ordem* served as a guide for all Catholic movements in Brazil and represented the main voice of the Catholic Church during the politically unstable period that followed the 1930 Revolution. The social and political importance of the journal, recognized by the majority of historians of the Vargas era, explains the fact that its journal, *A Ordem*, has become the most important primary source of historical studies to analyse the Brazilian Catholic movement of the 1930’s.²⁷

In Quebec, the institution that ignited the discussion of Catholic Corporatism was the École Sociale Populaire (ESP) founded in 1911. When explaining the purpose for establishing this institution, the Archbishop of Montreal Msgr. Bruchési declared: “Les oeuvres sociales ont besoin d’une élite. L’École Sociale Populaire la formera pour organiser ensuite avec son concours des institutions économiques et sociales, des groupements professionnels catholiques.”²⁸

While at first the ESP was led by the layman Arthur Saint-Pierre, as of 1914 it found itself under the direct control of the Jesuits with father Joseph-Papin Archambault as its new leader. This direct control of the ESP by the clergy contrasts with the lay direction of the Dom Vital Center. In another contrast with its Brazilian

ministers of Labour were readers of *A Ordem* and declared themselves as defenders of the ideas of the DVC. Agamenon Magalhães, minister from 1933-37, was a personal friend of Jackson de Figueiredo, and continued to support the DVC after his passing. Furthermore, after Magalhães was appointed the interventor of the State of Pernambuco, he invited members of Pernambuco’s DVC branch to form part in his government. His successor, the minister Waldemar Falcão was also an open defender of the ideas of the DVC. He had been part of the Catholic Electoral League as a delegate in the constitutional assembly of 1934. Together with Luís Augusto do Rego Monteiro, a recurrent author in *A Ordem*, Falcão was responsible for allowing the Labour Circles to promote the Catholic social doctrine amongst the state-controlled unions. For more: Jesse Jane, Anduini

²⁶ Tristão de Athayde: “Colligação Catholica Brasileira”, *A Ordem* n.58 (May 1935), 349

²⁷ Angela de Castro Gomes, *Burguesia e trabalho no Brasil: política e legislação social no Brasil, 1917-1937*, (Rio de Janeiro: Campus, 1979); Jesse Jane Vieira de Souza, *Círculos Operários: a Igreja Católica e o mundo do trabalho no Brasil*, (Rio de Janeiro: FAPERJ Editora UFRJ, 2002).

²⁸ Mgr Bruchési: *L’École sociale populaire : son but, son organisation, son programme*, L’École sociale populaire 1 (Montréal: Imprimerie du Messenger, 1911), 5

counterpart, the ESP undertook extensive efforts to assure that its message was received by a wider number of people. Apart from the journal *L'Ordre Nouveau* (1936-1940) and its successor *Rérelations* (1941 - today), the ESP also published monthly brochures, pamphlets and organized yearly public lectures called the Semaines Sociales, whose attendance could vary from 300 to 2000.²⁹ It is important to note that despite the variety of mediums used, the ideas found in these publications did not differ significantly. While there were differences in the language used and the depth of the discussion, the institution's opinions remained essentially the same, and thus, there is no reason to treat them differently.³⁰

It is also important to note that most of the actions of the École were organized by Archambault, who was also the most recurrent author in the ESP's publications. In order to keep up the constant stream of publications of the École, Archambault often resorted to republishing international works. In this manner, European corporatists such as the Belgian priest Albert Muller, the Portuguese dictator Salazar and Swiss corporatist Julien Lescaze had their work published by the École. Furthermore, the ESP was also able to amass a great deal of French Canadian collaborators, who not only took part in writing articles but also gave speeches during the Semaine Sociale. Some notable examples are the members of the *Action Nationale* Esdras Minville and Maximilien Caron, who were responsible for developing most of the corporatist institutions defended by the ESP.³¹

²⁹ These were the number of attendees presented for the years 1920 and 1937 respectively. For more: Jean-Claude St-Amant: "La propagande de l'École sociale populaire en faveur du syndicalisme catholique 1911-1949", *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, vol. 32, n2 1978, 211.

³⁰ *ibid*, 209-213

³¹ Archambault had a long history of collaborating with Esdras Minville, where he worked with in Lionel Groulx's *L'Action Française*. Archambault was also a founding member of *L'Action Nationale*, which Minville was a director. This close collaboration led the ESP to adopt the corporatist institutions

The members of the ESP and the DVC had almost no direct contact with one another. Even if the ESP's journal *Relations* presented occasional mentions of Brazil in its publications, such mentions were isolated to one author, Isaac Tapajós,³² and had no interaction with the rest of the institution. As for the DVC, not only was there no mention of the situation in Quebec, but all of Canada as a whole was largely neglected.

Neither the ESP nor the DVC were the only movements to support corporatism in Brazil and Quebec. Nor they were the only corporatist movements to assume a Catholic characteristic. However, even if they worked together with other movements, such as *L'Action Nationale* or the *Ação Integralista Brasileira* and Getulio Vargas, the ESP and the DVC were the only corporatist institutions to have a direct connection with the hierarchy of the Church. This put them in a position of authority, as both institutions saw themselves as the main link between the teachings from Rome and their respective societies. In this sense, the ESP and the DVC were the most important institutions in Brazil and in Quebec when it came to developing a corporatist projects that were coherent with the Catholic social doctrine.

4. Methodology

In order to guarantee that the ideas analysed would represent solely those of the ESP and the DVC, this work relies exclusively on the publications that were directly produced by these institutions. In many instances, members of the ESP and the DVC

designed by Minville. For more : Michel Bock, "Le rapport des groulxistes au politique", *Vingtième siècle*, n.129 (jan-mar, 2016), 27-42.

³² Isaac Tapajós (referenced in the review *Relations* as Isaac Tabajos) was a Brazilian correspondent in the journal *Relations*. He was presented as: "un des journalistes catholiques les plus en vue du Brésil; rédacteur au *Courrier du Soir* et à l'*Union* de Rio-de-Janeiro, collaborateur à diverses revues catholiques comme *Excelsior*, il dirige le bulletin de combat *Por Cristo* et le secrétariat de Cinéma et de Presse Pour L'Action catholique"

made use of other independent institutions to publish their ideas, such as the newspapers *L'Action Catholique* in Quebec, and *Vozes de Petrópolis* in Brazil. In addition, Joseph-Papin Archambault and Alceu Amoroso Lima also wrote books and articles that were independent from these institutions. However, in order to maintain a strict institutional approach, publications that did not carry the name of the ESP and the DVC have not been considered in this study.

In the case of the DVC, the primary source that has been analyzed is the journal *A Ordem*, which was founded in 1921. In 1930, *A Ordem* became a monthly publication, and continued with this format throughout the entire period studied. Each edition of *A Ordem* began with an editorial section, often written by Alceu Lima himself. The journal then included articles written by prominent Brazilian Catholic intellectuals, such as Father Leonel Franca, Hamilton Nogueira, Dom Sebastião Leme, and many others. The last pages of the journal were usually written by Perillo Gomes, and included a political section named *Chronica Politica* followed by the final section, *Registro*, where Gomes discussed national and international news that were considered relevant to the Catholic cause. Because the editions of *A Ordem* were not separated thematically, this study required that all the articles of the entire period analysed were read and catalogued in a spreadsheet, which contained the name of the author, the title of the article, the theme addressed and the general conclusion. It is important to note that, due to the fact that Portuguese was the main language utilized in *A Ordem*, I have personally translated all of the quotes utilized in this thesis. Nonetheless, all the original portuguese content can be found in the footnotes, with no changes or corrections to modern grammatical rules.

The ESP made more efforts to diversify its publications and as a result, this study analysed more sources pertaining to the French Canadian institution. This included the bi-monthly newspaper, *L'Ordre Nouveau*, the monthly journal *Rélations*, the pamphlets of the *l'Oeuvre des tracts*, the transcribed speeches of the yearly seminars of the Semaines Sociales and finally the monthly brochures of the ESP. With regards to *L'Ordre Nouveau* and *Rélations*, it was necessary to pursue the same thematic cataloguing process of *A Ordem*, as these publications were also not separated by themes. However, the brochures, the Semaines Sociales and the *l'Oeuvre des tracts*, were consulted whenever their themes were considered relevant to the discussion undertaken in this thesis. Examples of themes that were considered important were those related to corporatism, such as union movements, political ideas, the Catholic Action, anti-communist propaganda, and others. Conversely, those that were of a purely religious or technical themes, such as a detailed description of the canalisation of the St-Lawrence River or the Communion of Saints, were mostly disregarded.

It is important to note that the publications of both the ESP and the DVC contained articles written by foreign individuals that had no direct relation with these institutions. Articles authored by the American Bishop Fulton Sheen, the French philosopher Jacques Maritain, the Belgian Jesuit Albert Muller, and many others all were considered as parts of the institutional thought of the ESP and the DVC, since its directors made the conscious choice of publishing them, demonstrating the desire to spread these ideas to their readers.

The analysis of these sources was also limited to the years between 1931 and 1945 as they represent important landmarks in the corporatist movement worldwide.

Quadragesimo Anno was published in 1931 marking what many argued to be the beginning of a worldwide Catholic corporatist movement. Furthermore, 1945 marked the end of the Second World War which, as previously mentioned, caused a shift not only in the use of the word “corporatism” but also in the ideologies of Brazilian and French Canadian Catholic movements.

5. The Catholic Church in Brazil and Quebec – Early XXth Century

One of the factors that influenced the institutional discrepancies that existed between the corporatist projects proposed by the ESP and the DVC was the contrasting contexts in which their respective Churches found themselves at the beginning of the twentieth century. While the second half of the nineteenth century Europe is marked by the decline of religious political influence and the increase of secularism, in Quebec this was a period of considerable expansion for the Catholic Church, to the point of becoming arguably the most powerful institution in the province. In fact, based on the calculations of Nive Voisine, by the beginning of the twentieth century, Quebec’s Catholic Church possessed more financial resources than the provincial State.³³

The growth of the Catholic Church in Quebec is illustrated by the increase of personnel and religious initiatives in the province. Between 1901 and 1931 not only did the regular clergy experience an increase of 145%, but similar growth can also be observed in the religious orders.³⁴ The orders had become increasingly important during this time, creating new initiatives that helped to spread the influence of the Church. Amongst the most important of these were the Jesuits, who focused on the

³³ Nicole Gagnon, Jean Hamelin, and Nive Voisine. *Histoire du catholicisme québécois*. (Montréal: Boréal Express, 1984), 46.

³⁴ *ibid*, 141.

education of a Catholic elite and social action, the Sulpicians, who focused on education of the clergy, and the Oblates, who directed their actions towards the evangelization of the poor and indigenous.³⁵

As a result of Quebec's Church becoming more influential, institutional changes that increased the institution's ties to Rome also occurred. This process began with the establishment of a permanent papal delegation in 1899, and culminated with the elevation of Msgr Bégin, Archbishop of Quebec, as Cardinal in 1914.³⁶

Better structured and with far more resources, Quebec's Catholic Church was able to extend its influence in many sectors of the province, avoiding the secularization of sectors that had traditionally been under Catholic control, such as education, healthcare and social assistance. In fact, as stated by Nicole Gagnon, in the early twentieth century, very little happened in Quebec's society that was not somehow influenced by the Catholic Church.³⁷ It is not surprising, then, that such influence would be felt by the emerging working class movement.

The main way in which the Church tried to influence Quebec's working class movement was by creating a network of Catholic unions. This movement was spearheaded in 1900, when Msgr Bégin demanded changes in the constitution of a number of unions connected to the shoemaking industry. These were the first working associations in Quebec to have clergy members, the *aumoniers*, as supervisors over their meetings.³⁸ Both by "converting" existent unions and by encouraging new Catholic ones to be created, the Church was able to establish the Confédération des

³⁵ *ibid.*

³⁶ *ibid.*, 60-86.

³⁷ *ibid.*, 46.

³⁸ Jacques Rouillard, *Le Syndicalisme Québécois: Deux siècles d'histoire*, (Montréal: Boréal, 2004), 49-50.

Travailleurs Catholiques du Canada, founded in 1931 with 220 delegates from 80 Catholic unions across the province.³⁹

In the rare cases of societies such as Quebec, where the Church was able to gain an incredible amount of influence, it is important to point out the characteristics that this institution acquired throughout its history. Firstly, until the second half of the twentieth century, Quebec's Church was marked by an orthodox character, with its ideas closely tied to Roman directives. Such characteristic was the result of the ultramontane spirit that dominated French Canadian Catholics in the nineteenth century. Most of the contents in ceremonial rites and pastoral letters of French Canadian bishops strictly followed the Roman directives. According to Voisine, this fidelity stemmed from the necessity for French Canadians to base their arguments in an international authoritative source in order to counter British and North-American influences. Furthermore, the close ties between French Canadian Catholicism and Rome was also the product of the widespread belief in ultramontanism and the infallibility of the Pope.⁴⁰

A second characteristic that marked Catholicism in Quebec was its national character, as the Catholic Church became national symbol and an integral part of the French Canadian identity. As stated by Nive Voisine:

L'Église est le lieu naturel où la société québécoise se donne une représentation d'elle même. Une société catholique, française et rurale, dont la vocation est de répandre le catholicisme en terre d'Amérique. La frontière qui sépare le Nous de l'Altérité est une frontière religieuse, non pas politique, linguistique ou simplement ethnique.(...) Le vouloir-vivre collectif diffus dans la conscience du peuple s'est incarné dans un Nous religieux.⁴¹

³⁹ *ibid*, 56.

⁴⁰ Nive Voisine, *Histoire du Catholicisme Québécois*, 42.

⁴¹ *ibid*, 48,

This strong link between Catholicism and French Canadian nationality was not only promoted by the general public, but Quebec's Church also became a surrogate for promoting the French Canadian identity. A number of different events illustrate how members of the Church believed that it was their duty to guarantee the survival of French culture and language. Perhaps the most significant of them occurred during a number of educational disputes, where other Canadian provinces sought to limit the use of the French language in public schools. In this scenario, Quebec Catholics both from the clergy, such as Msgr Bégin, and lay intellectuals, such as Henri Bourassa, fought against these decisions, arguing that limiting French education was a *de facto* restriction on Catholic teaching. It was during these disputes that Bourassa made his famous statement that "*La langue est gardienne de la foi*", connecting the survival of the Catholic Church in North America with the survival of French culture.⁴²

While the French Canadian Church saw its influence in Quebec to grow steadily as an independent institution, the Brazilian Catholic Church faced a much different trajectory. Historically, the Church in Brazil developed little connection to Rome but strong ties to the Brazilian State. As heir to the Portuguese dynasty, the Brazilian royal family inherited the Portuguese right of *Padroado*, in which the Emperor would have the right to choose the members of the Brazilian clergy at his will. In practice, any bishop or Archbishop that went against the will of the monarch could be easily removed from his position. Therefore, while Catholicism was recognized as the official religion in Brazil, the Brazilian Church grew dependent on state authority.

This situation was particularly damaging in the reign of the last monarch, Dom Pedro II. Pedro II was not a devout catholic and practiced the religion solely for

⁴² *ibid*, 87-100.

ceremonial purposes.⁴³ During his long reign of 49 years, the clergy declined considerably in both numbers and quality. This is especially true after 1855 when he prohibited new admissions to religious orders. As a result of these factors, the Brazilian Church became the weakest of all Churches in Latin America.⁴⁴ However, as the nineteenth century drew to an end, the considerable influence of the ultramontane thought spread to important members of the Brazilian clergy. This led the Catholic Church in Brazil to find itself in conflict with the crown, with important members of the high clergy, notably Dom Vital, fighting against the use of *Padroado*, and advocating for a stronger connection to Rome and the Pope.⁴⁵

Regardless of these initial calls for larger independence of the Church, the separation of Church and State in Brazil did not come from Catholics, but rather from the State, with the establishment of the First Republic in 1889. The Republican Party of São Paulo (PRP), the leading republican force, was very strong in its secularist stance. Therefore, the Republican constitution of 1891 removed all reference to God, banned religious education in public schools and removed the requirement of religious duty in the National army.

Historian José Murilo de Carvalho demonstrates how little the declaration of the Republic impacted the daily life in the general Brazilian society.⁴⁶ However, from the

⁴³ Scott Mainwaring, *The Catholic Church and Politics in Brazil 1916-1985*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1986), 24; Antonio Carlos Villaça, *O Pensamento Católico no Brasil*, (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2006), 88.

⁴⁴ *ibid*, 25.

⁴⁵ Following the directives from Rome, Dom Vital, Archbishop of Olinda, sought to excommunicate important members of the State that participated in maçonic rites. He proceeded to do so even after direct prohibition from Pedro II, leading to an open conflict between the Brazilian Church and the State. These events are known in Brazilian historiography as the “religious question”, and are often presented by historians as one of the factors that led to the end of the Brazilian Empire. For more: Antônio Carlos Villaça, *O Pensamento Católico no Brasil*, (Rio de Janeiro: Boreal, 2006), 84-97.

⁴⁶ José Murilo de Carvalho, *A formação das almas: o imaginário da república no Brasil*. (São Paulo: Cia. das Letras, 1990)

perspective of the clergy and the elites connected to the Catholic Church, this abrupt separation was a traumatic event in which the religious institution suddenly lost its traditional structure, causing an institutional disorganization that would take decades to rearrange.⁴⁷ Immediately after the declaration of the Republic, the separation between Church and State instigated two main responses amongst Catholics. The most traditional Catholics continued to argue that the Church and State should not be separate, and created initiatives that aimed to reintroduce Catholicism in the State. An example of such movement was the creation of the Catholic Party in the state of Goiás in 1890.⁴⁸

On the other hand, more progressive Catholics, following the guidance of the encyclicals *Rerum Novarum* and *Immortale Dei*, saw the separation as an opportunity to rebuild a more independent Catholic Church in Brazil. The latter group is best represented by Father Júlio Maria, who was amongst the first members of the Brazilian clergy to prioritize the message promulgated by the Catholic social doctrine. Maria argued that the modern duty of the Church was more than just “organizing the rites, devotions and festivities”, but “to make ours the social cause and unite the two great powers of the world: The Church and the People.”⁴⁹ However, even though Maria’s ideas would serve as inspiration for future Catholic initiatives, his messages did little in terms immediate change.

The most important initiative inspired by Maria came from Dom Sebastião Leme in 1916, at the moment of his appointment as the Archbishop of Olinda. In a

⁴⁷ Mainwaring, *The Catholic Church and Politics in Brazil*, 89.

⁴⁸ Ireni Soares da Mota and Eduardo Gusmão de Quadros, “Deus, Pátria e Liberdade: um estudo sobre o Partido Católico em Goiás (1881-1909)”, *Ciberteologia*, year VII, n.35, 33-44.

⁴⁹ Villaça, *O Pensamento Católico no Brasil*, 117.

famous pastoral letter, Leme stated that the main problems in Brazil were not political in nature, but moral, and that they could only be solved with a Catholic reaction. He argued that such action was necessary so Catholics, who comprised the majority of the population in Brazil, could reverse the lay policies of the Republic.⁵⁰

This document is presented by many historians as a watershed moment in the history of the Catholic Church in Brazil, as it led to a greater reorganization of both lay and clergy groups in the country. An example of this transformation was the conversion of Jackson de Figueiredo to Catholicism, and the eventual creation of the Dom Vital Center in 1922.

Catholic corporatism in Brazil and Quebec was developed by two institutions that faced very distinct contexts. These contexts are vital to understand the distinct goals of Catholics in both regions. Corporatism was developed in Quebec as part of a strong independent Church, that sought to use its growing influence and resources to resolve the social question and empower the influence of French Canadians in the socio-economic policies of the province. Furthermore, as it is demonstrated in this thesis, they also aimed to preserve the French Canadian culture and its close connection to the Catholic Church. On the other hand, Brazilian Catholics looked to corporatism as way to reorganize their institution and restore their authority. However, this time, they would not act as a submissive institution to the State, but rather as an independent Church that influenced political decisions by spreading the Catholic social doctrine and ensuring that the Catholic character of the majority of Brazilians was reflected amongst the highest levels of the State.

⁵⁰ *ibid*, 133.

6. Historiography

The relationship between the Catholic social doctrine and corporatism has been treated very differently by Brazilian and French Canadian historiography. This is primarily a reflection of the distinct experiences, or lack thereof, that these societies had with corporatist regimes. Brazil's main corporatist experience occurred during the fifteen years of the Vargas era, between 1930 and 1945. This period had long term impacts in Brazilian society and its lasting influences produced an abundant number of studies.⁵¹ The strong link between corporatism and Vargas' legacy led many of these studies to link the Brazilian corporatist movement to other political theories, such as *varguismo*, *trabalhismo* but more often that of *populismo*. For this reason, the study of corporatism in Brazil has been traditionally connected with the concept of populism, which characterized it as a tool used by the State to control working class movements. However, for some time now, most Brazilian historians agree that utilizing populism to explain the corporatist experience in Brazil creates more problems than it solves.

The concept of populism, as stated by historian Jorge Ferreira, is “one of the most successful images to last in Brazilian social sciences.”⁵² The term became famous only after the end of the Estado Novo and was not used by its contemporaries. Populism was also not initially created by academics seeking to study the legacy of Vargas. Instead, it was initially used by opposers of Vargas and the Brazilian Labour Party (PTB), who sought to answer a troubling question: “Why did the majority of the

⁵¹ While the Vargas Era marks the birth of corporatist policies in Brazil, the study of corporatist institutions in the country is much larger. Many corporatist institutions survived the end of the Vargas Era and its influences continue even in modern days. For more on the legacy of corporatism: Ângela de Castro Gomes, “Autoritarismo e corporativismo no Brasil: o Legado de Vargas, *Revista USP* n.65 (São Paulo - Mar-May 2005) 105-199.

⁵² Jorge Ferreira, *O populismo e sua história: debate e crítica*. (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2001). p.7

working class movement support Vargas' regime during the Estado Novo and what reasons led them to support the labour party (PTB) between 1945 and 1964?"⁵³ Intending to diminish the appeal of *trabalhismo*⁵⁴, populist theories answer this question by portraying Vargas as a manipulator of the masses. Eventually this answer was transformed into an academic explanation, which was applied to more than just the Brazilian example and included most of Latin America.

One of the first academic studies to utilize the expression of populism to explain the Vargas Era was that of the intellectuals associated with the Brazilian Institute of Economics, Sociology and Politics (IBESP) in the 1950s.⁵⁵ These intellectuals, guided by a marxist framework, described populism and its focus on charismatic leaders as a problem of national importance which needed to be addressed. According to their work, populist policies were a form of control over the working class that hindered their movements from achieving true class consciousness. While these studies, and particularly the article "O Que é Ademarismo" garnered fame for being one of the first texts to utilize the concept of populism in an academic setting, they were far from the last.

One of the most well known authors to utilize the term as an academic explanation was Gino Germani and his theory of modernization. Gino Germani argues that Latin American populism was as a result of the different socio-economic conditions that its societies faced during the industrialization process. In his reasoning,

⁵³ *ibid*, 8.

⁵⁴ *Trabalhismo* makes reference to the policies defended by the politicians of the Brazilian Labour Party (PTB). This party was the political heir of Getulio Vargas after the end of the Estado Novo in 1945. For more information: Angela Maria de Castro Gomes. *A invenção do trabalhismo*. (Rio de Janeiro: FGV Editora 2005).

⁵⁵ Instituto Brasileiro de Economia, Sociologia e Política. "O Que é o ademarismo?" *Cadernos de Nosso Tempo*, v.2, n.2, (Rio de Janeiro - jan/jun 1954) 139-149. in Simon Schwartzman: *O Pensamento nacionalista e os "Cadernos de Nosso Tempo"*, UnB; Câmara dos Deputados, (Brasília), 9-21.

in comparison with the European example, the much faster industrialization and urbanization of Latin America led the masses to become impatient and to demand for greater political participation, notably by overcoming their traditional institutions.⁵⁶

Unfortunately, we do not dispose of enough space to discuss the many interesting ideas that came from utilizing populism as an explanation to the social movements around charismatic leaders in Latin America.⁵⁷ However, until the 1980s, with a few exceptions, the answer to the question of how Vargas was able to acquire the support of the working class was by explained by two factors: 1) The repression imposed by the Vargas Regime on dissident political and working class movements through the establishment of a dictatorship and a corporatist organization of unions; and 2) by manipulating the working class through state propaganda focused on a charismatic leadership.

While there is no denying the popularity of the concept of populism, there are important problems with its use. Ultimately, this has pushed recent Brazilian historiography away from utilizing the term. Firstly, this concept creates the image of society that falls victim to a dominating State. This hostage society is presented as being incapable of making its own choices, as the State constantly manipulates dissident movements and opinions. This view has a clear objective of denigrating the popularity of a politician or their ideas.

⁵⁶ Gino Germani. *Política y sociedad en una época de transición: de la sociedad tradicional a la sociedad de masas*. (Buenos Aires: Paidós, 1968).

⁵⁷ The influence of Gino Germani in Brazil is best represented in the ideas of Francisco Weffort. In a very summarized version, Weffort argues that the success of Getúlio Vargas's manipulation over the masses is connected with the urbanization of the rural worker, who carried a paternalistic culture to the city. For more on Weffort and a larger historiography of populism: Francisco Weffort, *O populismo na política brasileira*, Paz e Terra, (Rio de Janeiro - 1980); Ângela de Castro Gomes: "O populismo e as ciências sociais no Brasil: notas sobre a trajetória de um conceito" in Jorge Ferreira, *O Populismo e sua história*, 17-58.

Secondly, populism has been used as a formula to group together international movements and political forces that, in fact, had little in common. This not only creates a false correlation between historical events, but also spreads the definition of populism so thin, that the concept can barely provide any concrete explanation. This argument is well articulated by Maria Helena Capelato, who compared the two classic populist examples of Péron and Cardenas and concluded that any comparison through populist theories would overshadow the fundamental details that separate these two experiences.⁵⁸

Lastly, and more importantly for the purposes of this thesis, the concept of populism overstates the role of the State as the manipulator, or even as the sole historical actor in society. While it is undeniable that the State played a major role in the development of many aspects of Brazilian society during the Vargas Era, inflating its role underestimates the autonomy of the different societal sectors, including the Catholic Church, and their ability to make their own decisions.

This damaging aspect of the populist theories was well demonstrated by Angela de Castro Gomes in her book entitled *A Invenção do Trabalhismo*.⁵⁹ This work was one of the first major historiographical studies in Brazil to refute the concept of populism and represents a watershed in how Brazilian historians view the term. Inspired by the

⁵⁸ Maria Capelato does not deny the existence of similar questions to be resolved by Mexican and Argentine societies. However, she argues that when such questions are analysed via populist explanations, important details that profoundly differentiate the Argentine and Mexican examples tend to be overshadowed. Furthermore, the author states that for populism to have any utility in the comparison between Peronism and Cardenism, we must consider that social classes were incorporated into the populist coalition in a heteronomous manner. Otherwise, the movement cannot be considered populism, but simply alliances between social classes. In the case of both Peronism and Cardenism, evidence from a number of historians such as Ian Roxborough and Daniel James, suggests that their regimes were supported by independent working class movements and that only at a later moment did these movements lose their autonomy. For more information: Maria Helena Rolim Capelato, "Populismo Latino-Americano em discussão" in Jorge Ferreira, *O Populismo e sua História*, 125-166.

⁵⁹ Angela de Castro Gomes, *A Invenção do trabalhismo*.

works of E.P. Thompson, Gomes argues against the existence of an ideal model of working class movement, and does not agree that these movements, as developed in Brazil, were deviations or failed to represent true class consciousness. She demonstrates how the many working class groups during the Vargas era were active historical actors, capable of making their own choices. Gomes demonstrates how the labour laws⁶⁰ approved by the Vargas administration were not simply a tool for manipulation, but a historical achievement of working class movements. Furthermore, Gomes argues that the choice of the majority of the Brazilian working class to take part in Vargas' corporative project and to support the ideology of the Brazilian Labour Party (PTB) were conscious decisions that involved making alliances with the political forces that could bring them closer to their objectives, even if this came with the cost of accepting a corporatist organization that limited their freedom.

While Castro's work was initially received with some criticism at the time of its publishing, today, most Brazilian historians agree with her conclusions. Since the publication of her work a number of historical studies have been focusing on the independent goals of historical actors that were overshadowed by the populist explanation. The Catholic Church too began to be studied as an independent institution, rather than simply a doctrinal tool used by Vargas and the bourgeoisie to ideologically dominate the popular sectors.⁶¹ The specific objectives of the Catholic Church started to

⁶⁰ The labour laws (*Consolidação das Leis de Trabalho*, or CLT) approved during the *Estado Novo* are one of the biggest symbols of Vargas' regime. Approved in 1943, it established many of the rights that Brazilian workers still enjoy today, such as minimum wage, annual vacations, limited working hours, social insurance, etc...

⁶¹ Two examples of work that explain the Catholic Church as a tool of Vargas' populist State are: José Oscar Beozzo, *A Igreja entre a revolução de 1930, o Estado Novo e a redemocratização*, in Fausto Bóris, *O Brasil republicano*. 2 (São Paulo: Difel 1983); Paulo Kriscke, "O nacionalismo e a Igreja Católica a preparação para a democracia no Brasil - 1930-19405", *Revista de Cultura Contemporânea*, Vol 2. N.1 (São Paulo: Cedec/Paz e Terra, 1979)

be more deeply analysed, notably those connected with the Catholic social doctrine. Two historians were key in demonstrating the independence of the Catholic thought during the Vargas era: Roberto Romano and Alcir Lenharo. Despite working with the concept of populism, they were pioneers in demonstrating that the policies of the different movements within the Catholic Church functioned within their own spiritual rationale. Therefore, both of these authors argue that these objectives of the Church should not be analysed in the same way as those of political movements, given the fact that Church was not an institution subordinated to the State.⁶²

In spite of these these advances, the historiography of the Catholic Church in Brazil still has some challenges to overcome. Most studies in Brazil focus on the Catholic movements post Vatican-II, and only a handful have been able to show the effort undertaken by Catholics to apply the Catholic social doctrine in the Vargas Era.⁶³ Amongst them, two important works must be mentioned: That of Astor Antônio Diehl,⁶⁴ who demonstrated the importance of the Catholic labour circles in the state of Rio Grande do Sul. But most importantly that of Jesse Jane Vieira⁶⁵, who expanded Diehl's work in the Catholic circles to the national context and created one of the best explanations of the relationship between Church and the Estado Novo in Brazil. Demonstrating a solid understanding of the Catholic social doctrine, Vieira shows how the labour circles symbolised a mutual agreement between the Church and State. While

⁶² Roberto Romano, *Brasil: Igreja contra Estado*. Kaiarós (São Paulo - 1979); and Alcir Lenharo, *A Sacralização da Política*, Papirus (Campinas - 1986)

⁶³ This conclusion was taken not only by personal research, but it was also confirmed by Jesse Jane Vieira in her book. Vieira was a member of the National Association of Professors of History (Associação Nacional dos Professores de História, or ANPUH) and had access to the inventory of theses and monographs since 1965. Jesse Jane Vieira de Souza: *Círculos operários: a Igreja Católica e o mundo do trabalho no Brasil*. (Rio de Janeiro: Editora UFRJ. 2002).

⁶⁴ Astor Antônio Diehl, *Círculos operários no Rio Grande do Sul*. EDIPUCRS (Porto Alegre - 1990)

⁶⁵ Jesse Vieira, *Círculos Operários: A Igreja Católica e o Mundo do Trabalho no Brasil*.

the State allowed for Catholics to implement its social doctrine amongst the state-controlled unions, the Church offered spiritual legitimization to Vargas' authoritarian regime.⁶⁶

Nonetheless, not all studies are aware of the significance of the Dom Vital Center as part of the Catholic social doctrine. One the example is the seminal work of Scott Mainwaring⁶⁷ which describes the relationship between the Church and State in XXth century Brazil. The author makes a point of mentioning the lasting importance of the Dom Vital Center and the great influence that the members of this institution had in redefining the position of the Catholic Church in Brazil, but refrains from pursuing a detailed analysis of their corporatist ideas.

Another example that more historiographical work is necessary is the Ph.D. thesis of the sociologist Guilherme Ramalho Arduini, which is focused on analysing the role that the Dom Vital Center played in the intellectual development of Brazil between 1920-1940. The author makes a good effort in connecting the positions taken by the intellectuals of the DVC and their biographies. However, the last part of his thesis dedicated to the political writings of the Center is lacking in context. In many occasions the author does not connect the ideas and decisions of the members of the DVC to the international guidelines of the Church. For example, while criticising the fact that Alceu Lima avoided taking political positions despite many invitations to do so, the author ignores that such action could have dire consequences for the leader of the Brazilian Catholic Action. As demonstrated in the example of Charles Maurras and the

⁶⁶ *ibid.* 279.

⁶⁷ Scott Mainwaring, *The Catholic Church and politics in Brazil, 1916-1985*. (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press. 1986).

Action Française, taking part in politics could result in Lima's excommunication.⁶⁸ Moreover, while Arduini mentions the importance that Alceu Lima gave to unions and the organization of the sectors of society, he does not connect that to the directives of the encyclical *Quadragesimo Anno* or to a corporatist political project. While the author makes a good reading of his selected primary sources, he unfortunately falls short of a proper discussion of the Catholic corporatist project in Brazil and its connection to the Catholic social doctrine.

On the other hand, the work of historian Cândido Moreira Rodrigues not only elaborates on the specific objectives of the Brazilian social Catholics of the DVC, but also connects its roots to the international anti-liberal thought, founded in the ideas of Edmund Burke, Louis-Ambroise De Bonald, Joseph de Maistre, Henri-Louis Bergson, and others. Rodrigues analyzed the articles of *A Ordem* through their own Catholic rhetoric, and is aware of the responsibilities of the Brazilian Catholic Action as part of the Church's hierarchy. Furthermore he also successfully links the corporatist thought of the DVC to the guidelines from Rome.

Nonetheless, his work still leaves some questions unanswered. The focus of the author in intellectual history and the fact that his work is more descriptive than analytical prevents his work from analysing how the socio-economic context of Brazil led the intellectuals of the DVC to make specific choices in structuring their corporatist thought. Furthermore, his focus on the example of Brazil blinds the author to the existence of different forms of corporatist institution amongst Catholics around the

⁶⁸ Guilherme Ramalho Arduini, "Os Soldados de Roma Contra Moscou: A atuação do Centro Dom Vital no cenário político e Cultural Brasileiro (Rio de Janeiro, 1922-1948)" (Ph.d. diss, Universidade de São Paulo, 2014), 171.

world, such as the social corporatism defended by Belgian and French Canadian Catholics.

Differently from Brazil, Canadian historiography has long been aware of the complexities of the corporatist movement and the different forms that its institutions can assume. Furthermore, considering that the majority of the corporatists in Quebec between 1930 and 1945 drew their inspiration from the Catholic social doctrine, it is not surprising that French Canadian scholars studied the corporatist project of the Catholic Church much earlier than their Brazilian counterpart.

In 1974, André Bélanger published one of the most controversial studies with regards to the intellectual history of French Canada, whose conclusions are often mentioned by French Canadian historians. According to the author, the most important characteristic of the conservative French Canadian thought was its denial of action in politics, and its insistence in supporting mystical nationalist theories that were built to function on the margins of the State. The author famously called this tendency *apolitisme*.⁶⁹ While much of his thought is developed around the ideas of Lionel Groulx, with regards to the École Sociale Populaire, Bélanger stated:

Ni indépendantisme, ni plus nationaliste qu'il le faut, le corporatisme lancé par l'École sociale populaire reproduit par contre la même dynamique apolitique que le nationalisme mystique de Groulx. Réplique de l'unanimité suscitée par ce dernier, cette pensée sociale dissout le politique selon un esprit analogue, à peine plus préoccupé de structure que ne l'était le chanoine⁷⁰

While the theory of *apolitisme* exerted considerable influence in the intellectual history of French Canada, it has also been subject to heavy criticism. His explanation of the ESP's corporatism as apolitical is problematic and must be addressed to prevent the

⁶⁹ André Bélanger, *L'apolitisme des idéologies québécoises le grand tournant de 1934-1936*. (Chicoutimi: Bibliothèque Paul-Émile Boulet de l'Université du Québec à Chicoutimi, 2011)

⁷⁰ *ibid*, 388.

reader from arriving to similar conclusions. Bélanger's theory is based on the correct observation that the French Canadian traditionalists were fierce critics of the partisan politics of parliamentarism, and that many of them were restricted from taking part in politics given the restraints that the Catholic Church imposed on those who belonged to the apostolate.⁷¹ However, to conclude that their ideas were apolitical would be an misinterpretation even by Bélanger's own definition of "*politique*":

En gros le politique est le phénomène auquel donne lieu la résolution de conflits assumée par une autorité. Pour plus de précision nous devrions nuancer en disant qu'il est le phénomène auquel donne lieu la tentative - réussie ou ratée - de régler un ou des conflits par le truchement d'une autorité.⁷²

As it will be demonstrated throughout this thesis, one of the strongest arguments put forth by those who defended the instauration of corporatist institutions in Canada was the need to create mechanisms to better resolve class conflicts. In the corporatist project of the French Canadian traditionalists, such conflicts would be resolved by establishing independent places for discussion, and if necessary, an arbitration body under the administration of the State. Therefore, under the very definition of *politique* proposed by Bélanger, the ideas of Catholic corporatists cannot be called apolitical.

Regardless of these problems, many scholars have utilized the concept of *apolitisme* to study the corporatism of the ESP. Raymond Laliberté stated in his article that "L'École n'élève jamais [son corporatisme] à la dimension totalement politique, qu'elle ravale plutôt, au bénéfice de la gouverne catholique."⁷³ Likewise, discussing the social corporatism of Catholics, Clinton Archibald concluded that the Church aimed to

⁷¹ The prohibition of political action by members of the apostolate was a result of the inclusion of the writings of Charles Maurras in the index of forbidden books by Pius XI in 1926. This event had major repercussions around the world, and warned Catholics against the ideas of *politique d'abord*. This matter will be better discussed in the second chapter of this thesis.

⁷² André Bélanger, *L'apolitisme des idéologies Québécoises*, 24.

⁷³ Laliberté, *Dix-huit ans de corporatisme militant*, 91.

become an intermediary body between society and the State, in a society where there would be “deux puissances, l’État et les corps intermédiaires, formant la corporation sociale chrétienne, en marge du politique.”⁷⁴

On the other hand, more recent historiography has shied away from characterizing French Canadian ideologies as apolitical. Historians such as Pierre Trepanier, Xavier Gélinas, Michel Bock and Dominique Foisy-Geoffroy all agree that, while the corporatism of French Canadian traditionalists leaned towards transferring the authority over social and economic matters to corporative institutions, this effort should be considered as a move towards the decentralization of the State, and not as apolitism.⁷⁵

These authors argue that the decentralizing ideas of French Canadian traditionalists were a reflection of their acculturation to the British institutions of the parliamentary system.⁷⁶ Even right wing intellectuals whose main ideas relied on the defense of a French Canadian nationalism, such as Lionel Groulx, saw the federal system as a tool to protect the cultural rights of the French Canadians in Quebec.⁷⁷

As it will be clear throughout this thesis, we share this belief, and agree not only that the ideas of the ESP were political in nature, but its members had also become

⁷⁴ Archibald: *Un Québec corporatiste?*, 60-61.

⁷⁵ Pierre Trepanier, *Quel Corporatisme?*; Xavier Gélinas. *La droite intellectuelle québécoise et la Révolution tranquille*. (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 2007); E-Martin Meunier et Michel Bock, “Essor et déclin du corporatisme au Canada français (1930-1960): une introduction” in Olivier Dard, *Le corporatisme dans l’aire francophone au XXème siècle*, Bern: Peter Lang, 2011; Dominique Foisy-Geoffroy, *Les Idées Politiques des intellectuels Traditionalistes Canadiens-Français 1940-1960*, Ph,d, Thesis, Université Laval, 2008.

⁷⁶ Pierre Trepanier makes an interesting connection between the French Canadian political thought and the ideas of the Irish philosopher Edmund Burke, where the democratic British institutions would be guardians of traditional values. For more information on how French Canadian historians justify the *theorie de l’acculturation*, I highly recommend Foisy-Geoffroy’s thesis: Dominique Foisy-Geoffroy, *Les Idées Politiques des intellectuels Traditionalistes Canadiens-Français 1940-1960*, 19-22

⁷⁷ With regards to the École Sociale Populaire, this argument will be better developed later in this thesis. As for the ideas of Lionel Groulx on Canadian federalism, I recommend: Michel Bock: “Le Rapport des Groulxistes au Politique”, *Vingtième siècle*, n129 (Jan-Mar 2016).

accustomed the political organization established by the 1867 British North American Act.

Furthermore, André Bélanger also argues that the characteristics of the French Canadian corporatist ideas, notably those defended by the ESP, had its ideological roots on the “bias d’articles redevables à des européens, français ou belges pour la plupart.” He continues his argument by stating that the adaptation of the corporatist thought to the French Canadian realities only occurred after 1936, and that “avant l’été 1936, la corporation [...] appartient en propre aux Européens, et surtout de culture latine.”⁷⁸ However, Trépanier, Xélinas and Bock also refute this conclusion by the author. In an article published this year, Bock demonstrates how French Canadian corporatism appeared in Quebec not solely as a reflection European ideas, but also as part of a French Canadian tradition of thought. Bock argues that

Quoiqu’on n’éprouvât pas de difficulté à discuter des corporatismes mussolinien et salazarien et qu’on se référât, à l’occasion, à René de la Tour du Pin et à Albert de Mun, le corporatisme canadien-français puisait bien plus largement, en fin de compte, à la doctrine sociale de l’Église et au nationalisme groulxiste qu’aux corporatismes européens.⁷⁹

Apart from the discussions regarding the sources and the political character of the corporatism of French Canadian traditionalists, there is another discussion in historiography that is relevant to this thesis. It consists of whether or not should Catholic corporatism be considered as a “totalizing” theory, in the sense that it strived for objectives that surpassed those of the socio-economic sphere.

Jean Philippe Warren is an example of those who sustain that Catholic corporatism was indeed a “système total” as the author presents it not only as the

⁷⁸ André Bélanger, *L’apolitisme des idéologies québécoises*, 373.

⁷⁹ Michel Bock, “Le Rapport des groulxistes au politique”, 39.

answer to the socio-economic crisis, but also the key to a spiritual reformation, aiming to build an ideal society based on medieval values.⁸⁰ Frederic Boily also argues that in the view of the ESP's leader Joseph-Papin Archambault, corporatism was the answer to the socio-economic crisis, but its implementation would be in vain without spiritual reform. In Boily's reasoning, the institutional corporatist reform was tied to a deeper spiritual reform.⁸¹

Most of the older studies that we have already mentioned also carry a similar view. Raymond Laliberté, for example, shows the corporatist theory of the ESP as having a “finalité totalisante.”⁸² His conclusion revolves around the argument that while the objective of ESP's corporatism was to put an end to the economic inferiority of French Canadians and to better distribute the profits made within the province, the institution's rationale was not fundamentally materialistic. Instead, Laliberté describes the rationale of the ESP, as “essentiellement culturelle: modèle idéal, conception particulière du sacré (...) Domine la transcendance du bien spirituel éternel que l'Église seule est en mesure définir.”⁸³

Clinton Archibald also views all of the initiatives of the Catholic Church as part of one larger movement. In developing his idea based on the *apolitisme* of the ESP, Archibald believes that the Church aimed to become an intermediary corporation that would connect the people and the State. In one of his graphs, he sustains that the multiple fronts that the Church considered to be of interest, such as unions, education,

⁸⁰ Jean-Philippe Warren, “Le Corporatisme Canadien-Français comme “système total”. Quatre concepts pour comprendre la popularité d'une doctrine”, *Recherches sociographiques*, vol. 45, n. 2, (2004), 221-222.

⁸¹ Frédéric Boily, “Une figure du catholicisme social canadien-français de l'entre-deux-guerres: le père Joseph-Papin Archambault, s.j.”, *Mens: revue d'histoire intellectuelle de l'Amérique française*, vol. 1, n.2 (2011), 150.

⁸² Raymond Laliberté, *Dix-huit ans de corporatisme militant*, 90.

⁸³ *ibid*, 90.

general leisure and cooperatives, were part of the effort of the Church to become a co-manager of these various sectors at the margin of the State.⁸⁴

There is a lot to be criticized concerning Archibald's ideas. Again, we do not share his views that Catholic corporatism in Quebec was apolitical. Furthermore, while we agree that Catholics strived for the creation of intermediary institutions that would make the connection between society and the State, we disagree that the Church aimed to be such an institution, but instead favored organic corporatist organizations to perform such role. Lastly, it is not clear that Archibald fully understands the complexities of the Catholic social doctrine, given his comparison between Catholic corporatism as the representation of the body of Christ.⁸⁵ However, this thesis shares the beliefs of Archibald, Laliberté and Warren that the corporatism of the ESP can only be fully understood if read together with its other fronts as part of a larger totalizing project of the Catholic social doctrine.

More recently, Michel Bock's and E.-Martin Meunier's article on the corporatist movement in Quebec also touches on the totalizing aspect of the ESP's corporatism, differentiating it from the other types for being utopian and "davantage spiritualistes que réalistes".⁸⁶ In this work it is shown that the objective of the ESP was not only solve the social question, but to eliminate selfishness in society, which had spawn from bourgeois individualism and the French Revolution.⁸⁷

However, not all historians agree that corporatism was indeed a *système total*. Dominique Foisy-Geoffroy, for example, states that the interpretations of Warren and

⁸⁴ Clinton Archibald: *Un Québec Corporatiste?*, 71.

⁸⁵ *ibid*, 68-69.

⁸⁶ E.-Martin Meunier and Michel Bock, *Essor et déclin du corporatisme au Canada français (1930-1960): une introduction*, 183.

⁸⁷ *ibid*.

Archibald are “excessives”, arguing that corporatism was a movement that sought to act only on social and economic problems of society:

Nul besoin, à notre avis, d’aller si loin: le corporatisme est simplement une forme d’organisation de la société qui élève la profession organisée au rang d’institution de droit public autonome, mais néanmoins sujette à la surveillance de l’État. (...) Le corporatisme a une dimension économique plus restreinte et une dimension sociale plus large.⁸⁸

The author does not deny the existence of a strong spiritual drive in the ideas of most French Canadian traditionalists, but defends that these were not necessarily connected to their corporatist ideas, separating the corporatist ideology from the Catholic social doctrine.

The view that corporatism as an ideology was limited to the solving socio-economic problems is also defended by Pierre Trepanier, who criticises Archibald for having confused corporatism and the Catholic social doctrine.⁸⁹ After a detailed criticism of Archibald’s book, Trepanier continues by analysing corporatist movements in French Canada through an insightful study of the institutions they defended. The author separates them in two main movements: Those who followed Adrien Arcand and the “corporatisme d’État” and those who instead supported a “corporatisme d’association” as carried by the French Canadian traditionalists, including the ESP.⁹⁰

The importance of studying the institutions defended by different corporatist projects is undeniable, and we hope that this work reflects that by partaking in such method. However, when it comes to the corporatist ideas of Catholics between 1931 and 1945, labeling their different corporatist movements only by the institutions they defended can pose certain problems.

⁸⁸ Foisy-Geoffroy, *Les Idées Politiques des intellectuels Traditionalistes Canadiens-Français*, 192-193.

⁸⁹ Pierre Trepanier, *Quel Corporatisme?*, 167

⁹⁰ *ibid.*

In Trepanier's article, the author is surprised by the fact that Father Georges-Henri Lévesque proposed that in Quebec corporations should have representatives in the provincial parliament, following the models "qui fait la grande force de M. Salazar au Portugal."⁹¹ Trepanier's surprise comes from the fact that, following the institutional characterization he described, Salazar's state corporatism would be closer to the model proposed by Adrien Arcand and Mussolini than to that of the ESP.

However, while it is indeed rare to find French Canadian intellectuals that supported a transposition of Salazar's model to Canada, is very common to find French Canadian Catholic intellectuals who wrote kind words about Portuguese corporatism.⁹² This can be explained by the fact that, despite the obvious institutional differences, the corporatism of Salazar, was in fact more similar to the corporatism of the ESP than that of Adrien Arcand. This is because both Salazar and the ESP followed the Catholic directives described in the papal encyclicals, and represented the main effort of applying the Catholic social doctrine in their societies. As it will be argued throughout this thesis, this can only be understood if we take the corporatism of the ESP as a *système total*, where other fronts that are vital for the spiritual objectives of the Catholic Church are considered to be more important than the organization of corporatist institutions.

In term to Brazilian historiography, the present study continues the work of Angela Gomes, Jesse Jane Vieira and Cândido Moreira Rodrigues in demonstrating that the Catholic Church in Brazil was an independent institution that sought an alliance with Vargas' regime in order to achieve its own national and spiritual objectives.

⁹¹ *ibid.*, 200-201.

⁹² Examples are better explored in Chapter 1.

However, by utilizing the detailed work on corporatism performed by French Canadian historians such as Trepanier, Bock, Meunier and Geoffroy, this work also adds that the Brazilian Church also had its own corporatist ideology that was allied, but distinct, to that of Getúlio Vargas.

Canadian historiography has been very successful in analysing the many characteristics that made the movement so unique, and this work resonates the conclusion of the studies of the French Canadian historians mentioned above, notably by continuing to deny that the corporatism of the ESP was apolitical. However, this thesis also argues here that, with regards to the Catholic corporatism of the ESP, corporatist institutions must not be separated from the Catholic social doctrine, and should be studied as a *systeme total*. Furthermore, I believe that Canadian historians are often too quick in concluding that social corporatism is “the catholic model”, or the only corporatist project that was truly inspired by the papal encyclicals. As it will be demonstrated in this comparison with the Brazilian example, Catholic corporatism could in fact assume many institutional forms that molded to a number of social, economic and cultural variants, while at the same time being accepted by Rome as a legitimate effort in accordance to the Catholic social doctrine.

Throughout this study, it will be argued that the ESP and the DVC’s strong affiliation with the Roman Catholic social doctrine rendered them part of a worldwide Catholic Corporatist movement. It is also argued that the contrasting levels of industrialization in Brazil and Quebec and the distinct intellectual tradition of Catholics in these societies were the fundamental reasons that led the DVC and the ESP to support distinct corporatist institutions. More specifically, these two factors caused the

ESP and the DVC to express a different interpretation of liberalism. Catholics in Quebec, which by 1931 lived in a province with an increasingly industrial economy, argued that the abuses of liberalism described in the papal encyclicals were related to economic liberalism. On the other hand, Brazil's agricultural-based society had not yet faced an industrial revolution. This led the DVC to view liberalism through a political lense, and argue that the abuses of liberalism were connected to the spread of a secular republic.

Considering such differences, it becomes clear that the ESP and the DVC developed their corporatist thought as solutions to distinct problems, consequently relying on the development of distinct corporatist institutions. Catholic corporatism in Quebec aimed to offer tools that would empower French Canadian workers to gain control over the province's economy and society. In order to do so, the corporatist institutions proposed by the ESP relied heavily on the spread of the Catholic unions and the Catholic Action.

Conversely, Catholic corporatism in Brazil focused on establishing a strong State which ought to be guided by a Catholic elite. This would allow the Brazilian State to resist the advances of secular movements, and establish a nation-state that was based on the myth of a "Catholic Brazil".

The first chapter of this thesis begins with an analysis of the intellectual influences that guided the thought of the ESP and of the DVC. While the intellectual roots of the Catholic social doctrine were European, the transfer of these ideas to the contexts of the Americas resulted in considerable adaptation. This chapter proceeds by analysing how the ESP and the DVC related to European Catholic intellectuals, and

how these institutions adapted European ideas to their realities. Furthermore, another important source of influence considered in this chapter was the establishment of various corporatist regimes throughout Europe, which were assessed by the ESP and the DVC according to their own corporatist ideas.

Chapter II focuses on analysing the characteristics of the Catholic corporatist institutions as defended by the ESP and the DVC. The institutionalisation of the Catholic social doctrine was one of the main themes in the encyclical *Quadragesimo Anno*, which argued that the Catholic doctrine should not only be studied, but also needed to be applied. This chapter compares how Catholics in Brazil and Quebec interpreted Pius XI's call for institutional reform, notably in establishing the Catholic Action, Catholic unions and calling for a reform of the State. This chapter also seeks to identify how the distinct socio-economic contexts in Brazil and in Quebec influenced the institutional choices of Catholic corporatists.

The final Chapter focuses on the unique issues the ESP and DVC respectively sought to address with their corporatist theories. More specifically, it analyses how Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics expressed the relationship between Catholic corporatism and other industrial ideologies such as communism, liberalism and nationalism. This section analyses how the anti-liberal and anti-communist ideas present in the papal encyclicals were attached to local regional groups in Brazil and Quebec and how nationalism affected the ideas of the ESP and the DVC.

CHAPTER I: INFLUENCES

This chapter analyzes the influences that shaped the ideas exposed by the ESP and the DVC. Adhering to the Catholic social doctrine, both institutions drew their main inspiration from the papal encyclicals. For this reason, any effort that seeks to analyse their intellectual foundations ought to begin with a study of how their members interpreted these religious documents. While the encyclical *Rerum Novarum* was notably important for establishing the principles of the Catholic social doctrine, it is with the ESP and DVC's interpretations of *Quadragesimo Anno* that the differences between these corporatist organizations become evident. This chapter aims to demonstrate how the DVC utilized the 1931 encyclical to support the establishment of a corporative authoritarian state, while the ESP utilized the same encyclical to argue for a decentralized corporatism, which removed the authority over social and economic matters away from the State and towards an independent corporative chamber.

Furthermore, it will also analyse which Catholic intellectuals influenced the ESP and the DVC. One of the factors that led these institutions to have different interpretations of the papal encyclicals was the fact that by the time *Quadragesimo Anno* was published, both institutions had already established distinct intellectual traditions. These traditions had been evolving since their foundation and were largely influenced by the ideologies of different Catholic intellectuals. Both the ESP and the DVC valued the contributions of Catholic European intellectuals, and both institutions adopted parts of the European counter-revolutionary thought to their realities. In the case of the ESP, the only references found are connected to the social Catholics Albert de Mun and René de La Tour du Pin. In *A Ordem*, the conservative legacy left behind

by Jackson de Figueiredo led its authors to reference Joseph de Maistre as an influence for the development of DVC's corporatism.

Despite frequent reference to these European intellectuals, it would be mistaken to characterize the ESP and the DVC solely as continuators of their teachings. Rather, the importance of these institutions lies in the fact that they were able to adapt the teachings of these European intellectuals to their respective realities. In the case of the ESP, for example, much of this adaptation was based in ideas of French Canadian intellectuals, namely the priest Lionel Groulx. Similarly, while following the teachings of De Maistre, the DVC also proceeded to develop its own interpretations of the Catholic social doctrine.

Lastly, this chapter analyses how the ESP and the DVC assessed some of the corporatist experiences that were emerging worldwide. In this section, the distinct intellectual tradition of the ESP and the DVC will be more clearly defined, as they served as a basis for their members to form opinions on the other corporatist movements. Both the ESP and the DVC were particularly attentive of the European corporatisms, and both institutions used them as examples that demonstrated the growth of the corporatist movement. Moreover, these experiences also served to illustrate the wrongs and rights of how a corporatist regime ought to function.

While a number of different corporatist experiences were discussed in their publications, two examples stand out: those of Italy and Portugal. The opinions of Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics on the rise of Fascism in Italy are analysed in order to understand how these organizations viewed the relationship between corporations and the State. Moreover, it shall also be assessed how these institutions

saw the establishment of Salazar's regime in Portugal, notably its connections with the Catholic social doctrine.

While the authors of the DVC were more preoccupied in analysing corporatist models with a strong state, the ESP showed more interest in presenting its readers with the corporatist ideas of other places, such as Austria and Switzerland. Those examples will also be considered in establishing the ESP's view on Catholic corporatism. Finally, the Spanish Civil War that culminated in General Franco's regime was also a constant theme throughout the publications of both institutions. As it will be demonstrated, while Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics offered their support to General Franco, this must not be interpreted as support for the corporatist institutions that were established in Spain. Instead, the Spanish Civil War was mostly utilized as a tool for anti-communist and anti-liberal propaganda.

In short, this chapter argues that the ESP and the DVC interpreted the corporatist movement in different manners. The different influences of the DVC and the ESP shows that they had distinct interpretations of the Papal encyclicals, and that they adopted the corporatist movement as a solution to distinct problems. The ESP relied on the Catholic social doctrine as a way to solve the social question and to rebalance the influence over economic and social matters towards the French Canadian working class. The DVC on the other hand, saw corporatism a mean towards the resurgence of a Christian politics, and utilized Pius XI's directives as an argument against the secularization of the State.

1. The Papal Encyclicals

Rerum Novarum is arguably the most important document concerning the development of the Catholic social doctrine. By publishing this encyclical in 1891, Pope Leo XIII sought to increase Catholics' awareness of the social question and the problems created by the industrial revolution. It was the first encyclical to discuss the roles of workers, employers and the State in ameliorating the conditions of the working class.⁹³

To state that this encyclical influenced the ESP and the DVC is an understatement as the existence of these institutions is directly linked to the publication of this papal document. One of the main assertions of *Rerum Novarum* was that matters related to the "labor question" fell under the jurisdiction of the Church, which justified the existence of the DVC and the ESP as institutions that sought to extend the role of the Catholic Church to beyond that of liturgy. Arguing against those who believed that issues such as wages, strikes and working conditions were purely economic affairs, Leo XIII explained these factors as playing a central role in maintaining social justice, which should always be guided by Christian morals.

We approach the subject with confidence, and in the exercise of the rights which manifestly appertain to Us, for no practical solution of this question will be found apart from the intervention of religion and of the Church. It is We who are the chief guardian of religion and the chief dispenser of what pertains to the Church; and by keeping silence we would seem to neglect the duty incumbent on us. Doubtless, this most serious question demands the attention and the efforts of others besides ourselves - to wit, of the rulers of States, of employers of labor, of the wealthy, aye, of the working classes themselves, for whom We are pleading. But We affirm without hesitation that all the striving of men will

⁹³ Leo XIII, *Rerum Novarum* [On Capital and Labour], Vatican Website, May 15 1891, accessed October 4, 2015, sec. 1 http://w2.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_1-xiii_enc_15051891_rerum-novarum.html

be vain if they leave out the Church. It is the Church that insists, on the authority of the Gospel, upon those teachings whereby the conflict can be brought to an end, or rendered, at least, far less bitter.⁹⁴

From this quote, we can also extrapolate that for Catholics, solving the social question required the joint action of three main institutions: the Church, the State and the social classes. While the Church and the State were long established institutions, Leo XIII argued that in order to increase the participation of the social classes it was necessary that they became organized in unions. Thus, not only did *Rerum Novarum* confirm the right of workers and employers to unionize, but it also described unions as one of the essential institutions to help mitigate the problems stemming from the industrial revolution.

The argument favouring unions is vital to understand why Brazilian and Quebecois Catholics supported the development of denominational working associations. Before the First World War, five federations of Catholic unions had already been formed in Quebec, all of which claimed their legitimacy based on the teachings of Leo XIII in *Rerum Novarum*.⁹⁵ As for Brazil, despite Catholic unions being virtually nonexistent, *Rerum Novarum* was quoted by the DVC to criticize a Brazilian Labour law which prohibited working associations to follow any “ideological or religious structures”.⁹⁶

However, *Rerum Novarum*'s most significant contribution was the internationalization of the Catholic social doctrine. Leo XIII's remarks offered a religious answer to the social question in which its causes were explained to be of a

⁹⁴ *Rerum Novarum*, sec. 16.

⁹⁵ Jacques Rouillard, *Histoire du syndicalisme au Québec: des origines à nos jours*. (Montréal: Boréal, 1989), 99.

⁹⁶ “Monismo Sindicalista”, *A Ordem* n.16 (Jun 1931), 323.

spiritual nature, rather than of a material one. The publication of this encyclical popularized this explanation around the Catholic world, which was widely accepted even in societies such as Brazil and Quebec, whose characteristics were distinct from those of Europe. While the ESP and the DVC adapted the Catholic social doctrine to their own realities, the common belief in an existing social and spiritual crisis which had been created by the excesses of liberalism and had to be solved to avoid the development of socialism is largely explained by the influence of this encyclical.

Rerum Novarum encouraged Catholics to pursue the study of the social question, allowing for the development of a number of social Catholic experiences. In 1931, Pius XI sought to congregate these experiences and compile their conclusions in concise directives better suited to the post war scenario. To that objective, *Quadragesimo Anno* was published, marking another important step in the development of the Catholic social doctrine. Pius XI's approach was notably different from Leo XIII's. While *Rerum Novarum* focused on establishing the general principles of the Catholic social doctrine, *Quadragesimo Anno* was a direct call for institutional reforms focusing on the description of how the principal institutions of a Catholic society ought to be organized.

Pius XI's proposed reforms of the State and working organizations were the most significant directives in *Quadragesimo Anno*. Though Leo XIII acknowledged the importance of Catholic unions, Pius XI took his analysis a step further by stating that the organization of professional associations was to be done in a "corporative manner", including not only religious unions but all of society's' productive forces. He further argued that it was necessary to unify all professional associations of both employers

and workers into corporations that represented the entire economic sector. This new organization would allow for society to focus on achieving the common interests of all of classes, which would greatly diminish class conflict. Pius XI's exact description of union reform was:

The associations, or corporations, are composed of delegates from the two syndicates (that is, of workers and employers) respectively of the same industry or profession and, as true and proper organs and institutions of the State, they direct the syndicates and coordinate their activities in matters of common interest toward one and the same end. Strikes and lock-outs are forbidden; if the parties cannot settle their dispute, public authority intervenes. Anyone who gives even slight attention to the matter will easily see what are the obvious advantages in the system We have thus summarily described: The various classes work together peacefully, socialist organizations and their activities are repressed, and a special magistracy exercises a governing authority.⁹⁷

This directive led both the ESP and the DVC to become engaged in the creation of a national corporative organization of unions where the social classes would have a louder voice in the economic and social aspects of their society. In the DVC's publications, this role would be performed by a state integrated *Câmara Corporativa*, whereas the ESP's equivalent was an independent *Conseil National*. By contrasting the ways in which both institutions envisioned the organization of the corporative chamber, it becomes evident that the DVC and ESP had distinct interpretations of *Quadragesimo Anno*, especially with regards to the role of the State, and its authority over corporatist institutions.

The encyclical was used in Brazil to argue that the State should assume the role of coordinator in society, commanding an authority that outweighed that of the corporative chamber. Relying on the papal directive that it was "most necessary that economic life be again subjected to and governed by a true and effective directing

⁹⁷ *Quadragesimo Anno*, sec. 93-94-95.

principle”⁹⁸, Luiz Augusto do Rego Monteiro suggested in *A Ordem* in 1938 that “it is the State that shall implement such order in the organic groups of society.”⁹⁹

On the other hand, in Quebec, a different conclusion was drawn, based on another section of the encyclical:

Just as it is gravely wrong to take from individuals what they can accomplish by their own initiative and industry and give it to the community, so also it is an injustice and at the same time a grave evil and disturbance of right order to assign to a greater and higher association what lesser and subordinate organizations can do. For every social activity ought of its very nature to furnish help to the members of the body social, and never destroy and absorb them.¹⁰⁰

As explained by historian Dominique Foisly-Geoffroy, this section legitimised the principle of subsidiarity.¹⁰¹ According to this principle, groups that could solve their own problems ought to have the authority to self-regulate without the intervention of the State. In practice, this strongly favoured a decentralized form of government where a corporative chamber, capable of independently resolving the social and economic matters of society, would make its decisions independently from the State.

The ESP also relied on a different section of the encyclical as an additional argument against the State’s priority in economic affairs. As Pius XI warned:

Not only is wealth concentrated in our times but an immense power and despotic economic dictatorship is consolidated in the hands of a few, who often are not owners but only the trustees and managing directors of invested funds which they administer according to their own arbitrary will and pleasure”.¹⁰²

In the corporatist model described by the ESP, the State was considered to be

⁹⁸ *Quadragesimo Anno*, sec. 88.

⁹⁹ “Fixado o ponto de vista da necessidade de um princípio diretor para a justiça social, ao Estado incumbe a inserção dessa ordem no plano da vida organica da sociedade, não na vulgar deformação do monismo estatal, mas na função propria do Estado, de intervir para instaurar ou restaurar a justiça.” Luiz Augusto de Rego Monteiro, “O problema da pluralidade ou unidade sindical em face da coinstituição de 37”, *A Ordem* n.90 (May 1938), 465.

¹⁰⁰ *Quadragesimo Anno*, sec. 49.

¹⁰¹ Foisly-Geoffroy, *Les Idées Politiques des intellectuels Traditionalistes Canadiens-Français*, 162.

¹⁰² *Quadragesimo Anno*, sec. 105.

too easily manipulated by this economic dictatorship. In order to truly guarantee that the corporative chamber could represent the general interests of the social classes, it needed to function in conjunction with, but independently from political powers.

While seeking to achieve the same goal of applying the institutional reforms described in *Quadragesimo Anno*, the ESP and the DVC supported the development of institutions whose characteristics diverged in a number of aspects. The details and reasons for such discrepancies are better analyzed in the chapters to follow, but the existence of such differences reveals that the papal encyclicals were not the defining factor in determining the type of corporatist institutions supported by a given Catholic group. Instead, a number of other factors must be also taken into account, including the fact that the ESP and the DVC represented a traditional line of thought, which had already been well established before *Quadragesimo Anno*.

2. Catholic Intellectual Influences

In an effort to remain true to the ideas of Rome, the ESP's publications did not contain many references to foreign authors. Amongst the many European social Catholics that the institution could have referenced, only the partnership between Albert de Mun and René de La Tour du Pin was occasionally mentioned. While the occasional mention of these French social Catholics must not be overstated, the fact that these authors were the only influential reference to European social Catholicism in the publications of the ESP helps us to understand the type of corporatism this institution defended.

Albert de Mun and René de La Tour du Pin were two French Social Catholics who together founded *L'oeuvre des cercles catholiques d'ouvriers* in 1871. Despite

their cooperation on this initiative, it was La Tour du Pin who developed most of the intellectual basis of this organization. By doing so, LTDP became one of the first social Catholics to argue in favour of a corporative organization of society, describing a model whose influence can even be seen in the papal encyclicals.

References to Albert de Mun and La Tour Du Pin appear early in the publications of the ESP. In 1915, the ESP's first director Arthur Saint-Pierre dedicated an entire brochure to Albert de Mun with the objective of presenting him as an exemplary figure that French Canadian social Catholics should seek to emulate as they developed their own social actions.

En écrivant [...] cette modeste étude sur le comte Albert de Mun, nous nous sommes proposé un double but: à tous les catholiques de notre pays qui, ayant entendu l'appel du devoir social, ont répondu ou se préparent à répondre à sa voix, nous avons voulu fournir un modèle; à nos adversaires, qui affectent de croire et qui disent que le catholicisme ne peut produire que des hommes "amollis et débilités"[...], nous avons voulu opposer une réponse vécue. Aux premiers nous disons: regardez et imitez; aux seconds: comparez avec vos grands hommes et... ayez au moins la pudeur de vous taire.¹⁰³

Furthermore, after Archambault assumed St-Pierre's position as director of the ESP, the institutions continued to publish occasional references to these authors, notably in periods when their publications were particularly preoccupied with the theme of corporatist organizations. In 1934, the analysis of international corporatist regimes performed by the Belgian jesuit Albert Muller was published by the ESP and dedicated in honour of the 100th anniversary of LTDP's initiative.¹⁰⁴ A year later, LTDP's name was once again utilized by Paul Chiasson in order to demonstrate that the ideology of the founders of *l'oeuvre* served as a guiding basis of the French Canadian corporatism,

¹⁰³ Arthur Saint-Pierre, *Le comte Albert de Mun*, brochures n.42-43 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1915), 5.

¹⁰⁴ Albert Muller, *Essais d'Organisation corporative*, brochures n.247-248-249 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1934), 1-2.

which he characterized as “La Tour du Pin cent pour cent.”¹⁰⁵ Again, while we should not overstate the influence of LTDP to the ESP, these occasional references to his name can be explained by the similarities between the corporatist systems he proposed, and that of the ESP.

As described by historian Christopher Blum, “a sincere admiration for the Middle Ages is a keynote to La Tour du Pin’s thought.”¹⁰⁶ More specifically, La Tour du Pin believed that society should be organized according to professional groups, which he refers to as the *communes* or the *corporations*. LTDP was a counter-revolutionary intellectual, and his principal criticism of the French Revolution was the *Loi Chapelier*, which banned these organic professional groups.¹⁰⁷ Du Pin’s corporatist system consisted in re-establishing the corporations as a solution to the social question. Once these corporations were reorganized, he argued that they would be able to administer the social and economic aspects of society, becoming a social power parallel to the State. He defined this system stating:

La corporation est comme la commune, un Etat dans l’Etat. C’est-à-dire qu’elle est liée à lui par un contrat moral comportant des attributions et des obligations réciproques. Le pouvoir public ne lui dicte pas ses règles, mais il les homologue pour les maintenir dans la sphère d’une utilité propre que ne soit pas au détriment de l’utilité publique, en même temps qu’il en protège l’application contre des difficultés matérielles ou des oppressions du dehors¹⁰⁸

In analyzing the corporatist models proposed by LTDP and the ESP, the point of greatest convergence appears to be their views on the relationship between the

¹⁰⁵ Eugène Duthoit, *L’organisation corporative*, brochure n.256 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1935) 29.

¹⁰⁶ Blum, *Critics of the Enlightenment*, xlviii.

¹⁰⁷ René-Charles-Humbert Chambly de La Charce La Tour-Du-Pin. *Vers un ordre social chrétien : jalons de route, 1882-1907* (Paris: Nouvelle Librairie Nationale, 1917), 40.

¹⁰⁸ La Tour-Du-Pin, *Vers un ordre social chrétien : jalons de route*, 24.

corporations and the State. According to Du Pin, while the political power had the role of protecting and encouraging the development of the corporations, state influence on the decisions regarding social and economic matters was a serious threat to the independence of the corporations. To this matter, La Tour du Pin argued:

L'action du pouvoir public doit être pleine de sollicitude; son rôle est alors celui d'un tuteur vigilant, qui supplée par lui-même aux soins administratifs que ne peut encore prendre [les associations] et que prévot et prépare son avenir. Ont-elles atteint leur maturité, le pouvoir public ne se fait plus sentir que par la promulgation de lois qui coordonnent ces nouvelles forces autonomes avec l'ensemble des institutions sociales et politiques.¹⁰⁹

Similarly, the ESP believed that state influence over the Conseil National should be kept at a minimum, as the Canadian state model was prone to be influenced by business interests. This belief left the ESP with two options: to either deny the current state organization and defend its reformulation in a manner where it would be immune to an economic dictatorship, or to keep state organization intact, and argue in favor of transferring jurisdiction over social and economic matters to independent corporations. With a deep belief in the beneficial aspects of an organically organized society, the ESP chose to follow the latter path, defending a corporatist model that greatly resembled that of La Tour du Pin's.

Another factor that can explain the attention given by the ESP to La Tour du Pin was the fact his corporatist ideas aimed to solve two issues that were pertinent to French Canadian Catholics. Firstly, it aimed to solve the social question and the increasing inequality between the working and the employer class. Secondly, the identity conflicts in Canada led the Catholic Church and French Catholics in general to become suspicious of a powerful Federal State that could be used by English Canadians

¹⁰⁹ *ibid*, 24-25.

to deny the rights acquired by Quebec in the British North America Act. At the provincial level, the Church also feared that the empowerment of the State would lead to diminishing Catholic influence over social areas such as education and health. The corporatist model defended by La Tour du Pin was particularly attractive, as it contained a religious answer to the social question that did not rely on the establishment of an overpowering state.

However, it would be wrong to simplify the corporatist thought of the ESP exclusively as a continuator of LTDP. The similarities in their corporative systems helped the ESP to reinforce their arguments by attaching their ideas to the founders of *l'oeuvre*. However, most of the details and objectives of the ESP's corporatism were developed by French Canadian intellectuals that sought to solve the specific challenges of the French Canadian Nation. That is the argument raised by Michel Bock and E.-M. Meunier, who stated:

Si les artisans de l'Ecole sociale populaire marchent dans leurs (La Tour du Pin and Albert de Mun) pas, ils ne semblent pas véritablement faire oeuvres de continuateurs. Dans leurs écrits, les penseurs du corporatisme français semblent davantage jouer le rôle de *visa idéologique*, émaillant ça et là leurs textes, davantage, peut-être, pour faire valoir une référence savante que pour structurer axiologiquement leur propos.¹¹⁰

In order to determine the most fundamental influences in the thoughts expressed in the ESP's publications, one ought to look within French Canada, and more specifically at Lionel Groulx. Many of those that followed the national ideas of Lionel Groulx were recurrent authors in the publications of the ESP, and their influence can be seen in a number of the subjects that the institution considered to be of utmost importance.

¹¹⁰ E-Martin Meunier, and Michel Bock, "Essor et déclin du corporatisme au Canada français", 186.

The theme that was most central to Groulx was the attachment of Catholicism to French Canadian national identity. While he was far from the first French Canadian intellectual to draw this connection, Groulx's ideas offered French Canadian nationalists an opportunity to adopt a form of Catholic nationalism that sought to remain aligned with the Catholic directives regarding the delicate balance between nationalism and the Church.¹¹¹ As a priest and historian, Groulx believed that through the study of history one could identify the providential mission of an entire Nation, arguing that history was the “gardienne des traditions vivantes.”¹¹²

In the case of the French Canadian nation, Groulx believed that its mission was to guarantee the survival of Catholicism in North America. The close relationship between French Canada and Catholicism meant that the survival of French Culture would also assure the existence of a Catholic State. According to Michel Bock, “Dans l'esprit de l'abbé Groulx, le catholicisme était bien plus qu'une simple tradition culturelle; Il s'agissait de la force vive du Canada français, ce qui en avait toujours structuré l'existence nationale et qui en surplombait les autres caractéristiques.”¹¹³

Thought nationalism was at the forefront of Groulx's ideas, the author refused to reduce the connection between French Canada and Catholicism as a political issue, and often denied support of the separatist cause. With regards to the relationship between Quebec and the Canadian confederation, Groulx affirmed: “Nous acceptons de collaborer au bien commun de ce grand pays, mais nous prétendons que notre

¹¹¹ The rise of ultra nationalist regimes, such as *L'Action Française* of Charles Maurras, subordinated Catholic values as a way to achieve their national political goals. When *L'Action française* was condemned by the Pius XI in 1926, nationalism became a delicate issue amongst Catholic intellectuals. The impacts of these issues on the thought of the ESP and the DVC will be better explored later in this thesis.

¹¹² Michel Bock, “Le rapport des groulxistes au politique”, 27.

¹¹³ *ibid*, 27-28.

collaboration suppose celle des autres provinces et que nous ne sommes tenus de collaborer que si cette collaboration doit nous profiter autant qu'aux autres.”¹¹⁴ According to Michel Bock, “Le refus d’instrumentaliser le catholicisme et l’inféodation à la question nationale ou à toute autre considération politique est sans contredit l’un des traits les plus distinctifs du nationalisme groulxiste”.¹¹⁵

There were few direct mentions to Lionel Groulx in the publications of the ESP. Nonetheless, the connections between the ESP leader Archambault and the two main groulxist journals, *L’Action française* (1917-1929)¹¹⁶ and *L’Action nationale* (1933-) were strong both at the ideological and at the personal level. Archambault’s participation in groulxist initiatives is well demonstrated by historian Pascale Ryan, who shows that during Archambault’s time working in the *Société du Parler Français*, the Jesuit collaborated closely with intellectuals such as Joseph Gauvreau and Omer Héroux, and together with them, Archambault eventually became a founding member of *L’Action française*.¹¹⁷

To satisfy the recommendations of his ecclesiastical superiors, who feared that the league’s initiatives were too closely linked to politics, Archambault left *L’Action française* in 1918. However, he remained close to the group and after *L’Action française* came to an end, Archambault once again worked together with Lionel Groulx, Esdras Minville, and many others, becoming a founding member of a new league: *L’Action nationale*. This new league, directed by Esdras Minville, openly declared itself as a continuator of *L’Action française*, and many of their active members

¹¹⁴ *ibid*, 28

¹¹⁵ *ibid*.

¹¹⁶ Following the condemnation of the French *l’Action Française*, the Canadian review changes its name to *l’Action canadienne-française* in 1928.

¹¹⁷ Pascale Ryan, *Penser la nation: la Ligue d’action nationale, 1917-1960*. (Montréal: Leméac, 2006)

were familiar names amongst the ESP's authors, namely Esdras Minville, Hermas Bastien and Maximilien Caron.

As such, it is hard to argue against the importance not only of Lionel Groulx, but of the entire group of intellectuals that the historian and priest rallied to his national cause. Esdras Minville deserves notable mention, for he, together with Maximilien Caron and Father Richard Arès, were the authors of the most important articles regarding the relationship between corporatism and the State in the ESP.

Other themes of the ESP that were also influenced by the ideas of Lionel Groulx include the connection between Catholicism and French Canadian nationalism, the instrumental value of the Canadian confederation and the necessity for the Catholic Action to engage in national action. All of these are explored in greater detail in the following chapters.

While the ESP focused on national and economic questions, the DVC diverted its attention towards political issues, as they saw the secularization of the State as a bigger problem than the social question. For this reason, the corporatist ideas of La Tour du Pin were not as popular amongst the members of the DVC, who instead turned to other counter-revolutionary intellectuals that were more focused on a political dimension. During the early days of the DVC, still under the direction of Jackson de Figueiredo, the most influential European intellectual in *A Ordem* was Charles Maurras,¹¹⁸ whereas in the last half of the twentieth century the Center would become most known for its affiliation with Jacques Maritain and the Christian Democracy.¹¹⁹

¹¹⁸ Antonio Villaça, *O Pensamento Católico no Brasil*, 161-174.

¹¹⁹ Cândido Rodrigues, *A Ordem: uma revista de intelectuais católicos*, 99-112.

However, in the corporatist period running between 1931-1941, it was the DVC's interpretation of Joseph de Maistre that served as a larger influential factor.

Despite never engaging with corporatism directly, De Maistre exerted strong influence upon the Catholic conservative thought in the twentieth century, including the leader of the French version of *l'Action française*, Charles Maurras.¹²⁰ According to Christopher Blum, the central themes reflected upon by De Maistre's were "the governance of human affairs by Divine Providence, the radical evil of the French Revolution, the centrality of the Christian faith to European society, the insufficiency of written constitutions and the need to return to Europe's inherited institutions."¹²¹

An aversion to the French Revolution was the most notable aspect of Joseph De Maistre's political thought. He helped to propagate the belief that the Revolution was the source of the decaying Catholic morals in European society. In his words:

La révolution française ne ressemble à rien de ce qu'on a vu dans les temps passés. Elle est satanique dans son essence. Jamais elle ne sera totalement éteinte que par le principe contraire, et jamais les Français ne reprendront leur place jusqu'à ce qu'ils aient reconnu cette vérité.¹²²

In contrast with La Tour du Pin, who was focused on solving the social question, Joseph De Maistre's arguments were largely focused on the relationship between religion and the State, and more specifically, to the French State. He did not deny that some vices had been accumulated throughout the monarchy of Louis XVI. But he believed that the period of Terror during the Revolution had purged such sins, leading De Maistre to call for the return of a Catholic rule in France and the restoration

¹²⁰ Blum. *Critics of the Enlightenment*, xxxiv.

¹²¹ *ibid*, xxxi.

¹²² Joseph de Maistre. *Du Pape*, (Paris, Charpentier Librairie-Éditeur, 1841), xii.

of the divine right of the Bourbon dynasty.¹²³ According to De Maistre, this return would not be violent, and it would also not be a “révolution contraire, mais le contraire de la révolution.”¹²⁴

However, similar to the ESP, the DVC was not a direct continuator of of Joseph De Maistre, but rather, adapted his ideas to the Brazilian reality. The DVC’s interpretation of De Maistre becomes clearer in the early 1930s, when the center sought to explain the reasons that accounted for the 1930 coup that ended the First Brazilian Republic.

In 1930, Alceu Lima explained the coup by criticising the First Republic, daughter of the French “bloody Revolution” and its secular principles. According to Lima, it was necessary for Catholics to organize around the DVC in order to reinstate Catholic morals back in the State. Only such act would allow Brazil to return to its Catholic nature and avoid an endless cycle of revolutions:

If the Brazilian Republic is drowning in blood today, is because it forgot for 40 years the fundamental (catholic) norm. The only way to save our land from a diabolical succession of revolutions, and the eventual separation of our country that would happen in such case, is to restate Jesus in the Brazilian conscience and the Brazilian laws. Such is the purpose that led Jackson de Figueiredo to found the Dom Vital Center. Against the authority without Christ and against the bloody Revolution, our duty is to fight with our weapons of prayer, doctrinal organization and moral example.¹²⁵

Later in the same year, *A Ordem* continued its explanation of the 1930 revolution by drawing on the conference given by the Jesuit priest Camillo Torrend.

There he explained the resurgence of Catholics in Brazil, stating:

¹²³ Joseph de Maistre, “Réflexions sur le protestantisme dans ses rapports avec la souveraineté, in *Écrits sur la Révolution* (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1989), 219-239.

¹²⁴ Joseph de Maistre, *Considérations sur la France*, Version électronique (In Libroveritas), accessed 27 November 2016 at http://www.nation-francaise.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/10/JOSEPH_DE_MAISTRE-Considerations_sur_la_france.pdf, 107.

¹²⁵ Tristão de Athayde, “Palavras aos companheiros”, *A Ordem* n.9 (Oct 1930), 101.

Finally the prophecy of Joseph de Maistre will be fulfilled. When observing the proclamation of the rights of men by the ideologists of the French Revolution, the author wrote that the its conclusion would be the return to the Church and the proclamation of the rights of God.¹²⁶

Furthermore, in 1932, José Galvão, stated in *A Ordem* that “Utilizing Joseph de Maistre’s expression, the satanic French Revolutions of 1789 was the incarnation of the liberal-democratic ideas; Our sad revolution of 1930 was a consequence of the application of this same liberalism”.¹²⁷

Therefore, drawing a parallel between De Maistre’s assessment of the French Revolution and the Brazilian context, the DVC was able to put forward a Catholic explanation for Vargas’ coup of 1930. The adaptation of Joseph de Maistre’s rationale to the Brazilian context is a trademark of the DVC in the 1930s, which was initiated by the organization’s founder Jackson de Figueiredo. Much of the recent historiography regarding the DVC acknowledges de Maistre’s influence on the Brazilian Catholics’ view of corporatism as a modern Christian State. As stated by historian Candido Moreira:

In 1930s Brazils, the conservative and counter-revolutionary ideal was defended by Jackson de Figueiredo, and later, by Alceu Amoroso Lima. Their theoretical bases are decisively related to Joseph de Maistre. Without a doubt, the conservative thought is present in many (Brazilian) Catholics, notably those members of the Integralist movement and those connected to the journal *A Ordem* (In this case, until the 1940s). The majority agreed with the interests of Vargas’ authoritarian government, notably those regarding the defense of National tradition, National unity and criticism to liberalism.¹²⁸

¹²⁶ “Isso quer dizer emfim que se realizará então a profecia de Joseph Maistre, quando, no fim do seculo XVIII, ao assistir á proclamação dos direitos do homem pelos ideologos da Revolução franceza, escrevia que o desfecho fatal de semelhante loucura seria o regresso á Igreja, proclamando os direitos de Deus.” Camillo Torrend, “A Crise Actual”, *A Ordem* n.23 (Jan 1932), 30.

¹²⁷ “Assim, a satanica Revolução Francesa de 1789 – para empregar a expressão de Joseph de Maistre – foi a incarnação da idéa liberal-democratica; e a nossa tristissima revolução de Outubro de 1930, uma consequencia da applicação desse liberalismo” José Pedro Galvão de Souza, “Sobre o resurgimento da Escolástica” *A Ordem* n.30 (Aug 1932), 95.

¹²⁸ “No Brasil, o ideário conservador e contra-revolucionário receberá a filiação de Jackson de Figueiredo e, mais tarde, de Alceu Amoroso Lima, até fins da década de 1930. Entretanto, em ambos os intelectuais,

However the biggest modification of De Maistre's ideas made by Brazilian Catholics consisted on the fact that while the French intellectual was monarchist, the Catholic State desired by Brazilian Catholics was not to be founded on a monarchical government. The Brazilian Empire that preceded the Republic was portrayed in *A Ordem* as carrying an illusory and superficial Catholic character that only manifested itself for ceremonial purposes. Instead, the DVC argued that in the case of Brazil, the return of a true Catholic sentiment could only be achieved by establishing the "Ethic-corporatist State".

We must establish the Ethic-corporatist State [...] Up to a certain period in its history, Brazil experienced a type of Ethic corporative constitution [The monarchy]. But after a certain period, it began living under a liberal constitution, in which the individual, and not the group, was made the structural basis of society [the Republic]. As a result of this new political organization, the agnostic mentality, which carries no moral principles and professes religious neutrality, dominated the political organization of our country, eliminating religious principles of our education, politics and economy. Under these conditions, we should not strive for a return of the abolished institutions [the monarchy], but to prudently restore the Brazilian traditions of Christianity that were abolished by the liberal constitution.¹²⁹

a filiação teórica se dará em relação, mais decisivamente, a Joseph De Maistre. Sem dúvida, as idéias e posturas conservadoras estarão presentes entre inúmeros católicos, sobretudo aqueles próximos ao movimento Integralista e à revista *A Ordem* - nesse caso até princípios da década de 1940; e ainda dentro da própria hierarquia. Em grande parte das vezes, as posições de diversos intelectuais e militantes estarão de acordo com os interesses maiores do governo autoritário de Vargas, sobretudo por meio da defesa de tradição nacional, da unidade nacional e da crítica à liberdade." Candido Moreira, "Alceu Amoroso Lima: matrizes e posições de um intelectual católico militante em perspectiva histórica - 1928-1946". (PhD diss., Universidade Estadual de São Paulo, 2006), 63.

¹²⁹ "Temos de enveredar pelo Estado Ethico - Corporativo [...] O Brasil, até certa altura do seu desenvolvimento, como Nação independente, teve, em substancia, embora com outra denominação, uma Constituição até certo ponto Ethico-Corporativa. De certa phase em diante passou a viver sob o regime de uma Constituição liberal, na qual o individuo, e não o grupo, forma a base da estrutura social. Corollario logico desta transformação radical da sua Constituição, foi o predomínio, na organização política do paiz, da mentalidade agnostica, isto é, da que não tem finalidade de moral alguma expressa, e que cultiva a neutralidade religiosa, por força da qual é systematicamente excluida da actividade educativa, politica, e economica toda e qualquer base religiosa. Cumpre, nestas condições, não voltar a formas abolidas, pois é um err restaurar apenas o passado, mas reatar, com prudencia progressiva, e em obediencia á razão e á vontade da maioria da Nação brasileira, as tradições da nossa vida publica, tão imprudentemente rompidas pela Constituição Liberal." Tristão de Athayde, "Triplíce decálogo". *A Ordem* n.33 (Nov 1932), 340.

The distinct traditions of thought that guided the ideas of the ESP and the DVC were decisive in determining how French Canadian and Brazilian Catholics viewed the corporatist movement. For this reason, these thoughts also served as a base in which the DVC and the ESP portrayed the different corporatist regimes that were springing up over Europe, notably those of the Italian and Portuguese regime.

3. Italian Corporatism

A number of reasons led the members of the ESP and the DVC to play close attention to the Italian corporatist model. With Benito Mussolini becoming Prime Minister in 1922, Italy was amongst the first countries to have a government whose political objectives included the establishment of a corporatist regime. This pioneering example was viewed with hopeful eyes by corporatists around the world, including in the ESP and the DVC, who saw Italy as the first spark to ignite the corporatist movement into the twentieth century.

The Church's interest in Italian politics further contributed to the visibility of the fascist model to Catholics. The very fact that the Holy See was settled in Rome meant that Italian government affected the Church in a more direct way than any other government. This was best illustrated in the conflicts between Catholic and Fascist unions during the 1920s, which was well covered in the Catholic journal *Civiltà Cattolica*, of which the members of both the ESP and the DVC were assiduous readers.

An analysis of the ESP and the DVC's portrayal of the fascist movement confirms that Catholics in Brazil and Quebec had different perceptions of corporatism. By understanding corporatism as a new model of state that would come to substitute the liberal Republic, the DVC initially viewed the rise of fascism with enthusiasm. In the

early 1930s it was common to encounter articles in *A Ordem* that supported the fascist movement, describing it as a demonstration that the bourgeoisie had finally realized that there was no salvation in an atheist government.¹³⁰ Early publications described the Italian regime as an anti-individualistic system in which the State acted as a social coordinator, limiting its interventions only to matters that put the national interest in jeopardy.¹³¹ In 1931, San Tiago Dantas argued that the coordinator role performed by the Italian Fascist State was coherent with the descriptions of Pius XI in *Quadragesimo Anno*. He stated that “by comparing the Fascist State and the Christian Doctrine with regards to class conflict, I see great evidence that Fascism is closer to the Christian Doctrine than any other contemporary social system”.¹³² Despite such positive opinions, the author also recognizes that there were still some differences between fascism and the “Christian State”. He stated:

Private initiatives are narrowed in Fascism, while they are expanded in the Christian State. Unlike the Christian State, Fascism does not have the moral factor which harmonises and unifies [society]. The Fascist State has to compensate in political violence for what it fails to control with morals.¹³³

The careful optimism of San Tiago Dantas does not reflect the opinion of the DVC’s leader Alceu Lima, who criticized the fascist regime by describing it as a monopoly of the State over all institutions. Lima argued in 1931 that:

The philosophical foundation of Fascism is the Hegelian idealist monism. The same ideology that influenced the philosophy of Marx (...). In Fascism, the only

¹³⁰ Jonathas Serrano, “Pensamento e Acção”, *A Ordem* n.13 (Mar 1931), 139.

¹³¹ *ibid.*

¹³² “E é sobretudo aqui, comparando a organização do estado fascista com a doutrina cristã, em face do conflicto de classes, que eu sinto com uma evidencia enorme que o fascismo está mais perto dessa doutrina, que de nenhum outro systema social contemporaneo.” San Tiago Dantas, “Catholicismo e Facismo”, *A Ordem* n.11 (Jan 1931), 39.

¹³³ “Se o circulo da actividade privada se estreita mais naquelle, e neste se dilata, é que of fascismo não conta com o factor moral, unificador e harmonisador, na medida em que contaria o estado christão. E tem de compenar em violencia politica o que não está controlado pela força moral.” *ibid.*, 40.

social possibility is the State. Neither the individual nor the Church can exist, unless attached to the State.¹³⁴

Alceu Lima's negative opinions regarding fascist corporatism can be understood by considering two factors. First, in 1931, Pius XI published the encyclical *Non abbiamo bisogno*, where he condemned important aspects of the Italian regime, namely Mussolini's "attacks" on the Italian Catholic Action.¹³⁵ Second, in the early 1930s, fearing that secularist movements would continue to limit religious actions in Brazil, the DVC strongly opposed state control over school curriculums and the union system, both of which were employed in Italy. Lima argued that such state control was a sign of a harmful "monism" that had been condemned by Pius XI when the same actions were taken by the Italian government.¹³⁶ The influence of Alceu Lima over the Brazilian Catholic thought is fundamental to understand the decay of the Brazilian Catholic opinion towards fascism. These criticisms persisted even after the establishment of an authoritarian corporatist government in Brazil in 1937. The formation of an alliance between the Catholic Church and the Brazilian corporatist State led Luiz Rego Monteiro to differentiate in 1938 the Brazilian model from the condemned Italian fascism:

The legal-political organization of modern Italy is based on Totalitarian conceptions. In the social composition of the Italian State, there is no space for organic entities. Such entities should be under a government that not only coordinates and oversees them, but also protects their autonomy. (...) The unions according to the [Brazilian] Constitution, have a strictly professional

¹³⁴ "Ao passo que o fundamento philosophico do fascismo é o monismo idealista, derivado tambem de Hegel, como foi a principio o pensamento philosophico de Marx, mas alterado e convertido em neo-hegelianismo, pelos dois grandes philosophos da Italia moderna Croce e Gentile. Para este, a unica realidade social é o Estado. Nem o individuo nem a Igreja possuem existencia senão integradas no tronco do Estado." "Igreja e Estado, Catolicismo e Facismo" *A Ordem* n.18 (Aug 1931), 69.

¹³⁵ Pius XI, *Non abbiamo bisogno* [On Catholic Action in Italy], Vatican Website, June 29 1931, accessed October 4, 2015. http://w2.vatican.va/content/pius-xi/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-xi_enc_29061931_non-abbiamo-bisogno.html

¹³⁶ *Igreja e Estado, Catolicismo e Facismo*, 70-71.

character. They do not have the attributes of a political entity, as in the modern Italian legal system.¹³⁷

As the Brazilian government slowly sided with the allies during the Second World War, fascism was portrayed in *A Ordem* as another enemy to be fought in addition to liberalism and communism. During this time, Lima strengthened his critique of the Italian movement, stating:

In Nazi Germany, Soviet Russia and Fascist Italy, the governments have a fundamentally religious character, which awakens a religious zeal in men. However, these are fake and inferior religions (...) From the Christian point of view, there is no difference between Fascism and Communism.¹³⁸

In contrast to the shifting of opinions of the DVC, the ESP's characterization of Mussolini's regime was more constant throughout the period analyzed. The article by Father François Hertel published in the journal *L'Ordre Nouveau* in 1937 explained the establishment of fascism in Italy as a confirmation of that the corporatist movement was gaining momentum. However the author also exposed severe criticisms to Mussolini's regime for the inflated role it gave to the State, and its religion-like adoration of the nation.

Du point de vue catholique, il semble d'abord qu'il n'y ait rien que de légitime dans ce patriotisme [Italien] conquérant. [...] ce patriotisme raciste contient une large part d'exagération, une quasi-divinisation de la race qui menace la hiérarchie des valeurs. [...] Anti-individualiste, le fascisme est autoritaire. Le parti est roi, il est dieu. Il ne saurait admettre d'opposition. Toute démocratie politique est bien morte en Italie; [...] il y a là un abus, un caporalisme

¹³⁷ “As observações que acabam de ser feitas lembram imediatamente, que a organização jurídico-política da Itália moderna é modelada pelas concepções totalitárias do regime fascista. Não há lugar, na composição social do Estado na Itália, para entidades orgânicas e diferenciadas, sob um governo de coordenação e fiscalização, mas ressalvado a autonomia própria.(...) “Efetivamente, o sindicato, na constituição de 10 Novembro, tem a exclusiva função de grupo profissional, sem os atributos que lhe tornariam pessoa de Direito Público, como no Direito Italiano moderno.” Luiz Augusto de Rego Monteiro, “Em Defesa do Direito da Associação” *A Ordem*, n. 90 (April 1938), 433-449.

¹³⁸ “Tanto na Alemanha nazista, como na Rússia Soviética, como na Itália fascista, os regimes aí implantados têm um nítido caráter religioso a fundamentá-los e se sustentam despertando entre os homens um fervor religioso. São novas formas de religião, são falsas religiões inferiores.(...) Não há do ponto de vista cristão, nenhuma diferença entre os dois.” Afranio Coutinho, “O Cristianismo diante dos fascismos e do comunismo” *A Ordem* n.102 (May 1939), 470-474.

intolérable des consciences. Plus de liberté de parole. Une seule opinion. Tous doivent penser fasciste. [...] Toutefois, le fascisme mussolinien est, sans contredit, un remarquable effort vers cet ordre nouveau qu'annoncent comme un retour au moyen âge des sociologues éminents.¹³⁹

Criticism towards Italian fascism can be seen even in earlier publications of the ESP, such as in the 1935 article written by Belgian Jesuit Albert Muller. While Muller was not a member of the ESP, his defense of a *corporatisme d'association* granted him a number of appearances in the *École's* publications.¹⁴⁰ In his articles, Muller criticized the union organization of the Italian regime by stating:

On a reproché aussi au régime corporatif italien le monopole qu'il a crée en faveur des organisations syndicales affiliées au Parti fasciste. Le grief est sérieux [...] Un vrai et sincère régime corporatif est, à nos yeux, absolument incompatible avec la dictature au sens moderne du mot.¹⁴¹

Maximilien Caron further confirmed the distinctions between the corporatist model defended by the ESP and the one defended by the Italian régime, stating in 1942 that “Le corporatisme auquel nous adhérons n'a rien d'étatiste. On ne peut raisonnablement le comparer à celui de l'Italie.”¹⁴²

As a result of the Church's criticism of Mussolini, both the ESP and the DVC ultimately rejected the Italian model of corporatism. However, their initial reaction to the fascist movement reveals much of what they understood corporatism to be. The ESP denied fascism from the very beginning, since it contradicted their ideal of a decentralized state and organic associations. On the other hand, with the exception of Alceu Lima, Brazilian authors initially discussed the possibility that the Italian State

¹³⁹ François Hertel. “Ce qu'il est le Fascisme Ce qu'il vaut”, *L'Ordre Nouveau*, 5 Aug 1937.

¹⁴⁰ Albert Muller. *La politique corporative; essais d'organisation corporative*. (Bruxelles: Les Éditions Rex 1935).

¹⁴¹ Albert Muller. *Essais d'Organisation Corporative*, brochures n.247-248-249 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1934), 36-97.

¹⁴² Maximilien Caron. *L'Organisation Corporative au Service de la Démocratie*, brochure n. 347 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1942), 6.

might represent the “Christian State” they believed to be described in *Quadragesimo Anno*.

4. Portuguese Corporatism

In contrast to Italy, the Portuguese corporatist regime received strong support from the Catholic Church. As a result, both the ESP and the DVC dedicated many pages to positively portraying the regime of Oliveira Salazar. In 1937, Perillo Gomes first mentioned the regime in *A Ordem*, stating:

With regard to the establishment of a corporatist state and the organization of Nations on the basis of corporatism, one of the examples that merits a closer look is Portugal. More than the others, the Portuguese economic organization allows private initiatives and individuals to have a degree of autonomy.¹⁴³

Also in 1937, an article by Hermas Bastien that was published in *L'Ordre Nouveau* shared the same opinion of Perillo Gomes. It stated that “L’expérience que [Salazar] a tentée au Portugal mérite d’être médité par tous les peuples qui veulent maitriser leur destin.” In the same article the author argued that the Portuguese corporatist regime was “nettement spiritualiste”, characterizing it as an “instrument de civilisation inspirée par la foi.”¹⁴⁴

Both the ESP and the DVC portrayed Salazar’s regime as an example of *Quadragesimo Anno* in practice. The Catholic inspirations of the regime was further recognized in 1943 in one of the École’s monthly brochures, where a translation of one

¹⁴³ “Neste particular um dois países que merecem ser observados mais de perto é Portugal, porque mais do que os outros reserva á iniciativa particular e á liberdade individual uma parcela de autonomia, na reforma do aparelhamento da sua economia.” Perillo Gomes, “As Experiencias do Corporativismo” *A Ordem* n. 83 (Oct 1937), 388.

¹⁴⁴ Hermas Bastien. “L’Oeuvre de Salazar”, *L'Ordre Nouveau*, 20 Mar 1937.

of Salazar's speeches was presented as powerful argument in favour of the Christian social doctrine:

La réponse de président du Conseil (Salazar) est en tout point remarquable par sa manière élevée d'envisager le problème social, par sa magistrale définition des principes de l'organisation corporative et par son explication du bien-fondé apparent des revendications ouvrières. Elle constitue, à dire vrai, une haute leçon d'économie sociale et de sagacité politique.¹⁴⁵

However, despite their support of Portuguese corporatism, the ESP and DVC's different perceptions on the corporatist movement can still be noted in the different way in which the example of Portugal was used by these organizations. Perillo Gomes not only praised the Portuguese corporatist system, but also recommended a similar implementation in Brazil.

The Portuguese *Estado Novo* has aspects that, despite our aversion to totalitarian regimes, we cannot help but see favorably. (...) Considering that in Brazil we have the duty of promoting a social and political reconstitution, it is important for us to study the patriotic work of the Portuguese *Estado Novo*, which is a system focused on the familial society.¹⁴⁶

In contrast to the shifting perceptions of the Italian State, Brazil's support of the Portuguese regime persisted even after the coup of 1937 when President Vargas implemented its own version of *Estado Novo*. Preoccupied with distinguishing Brazilian corporatism from those of the Axis, Romeo Rodrigues Silva wrote an article in 1940 that differentiated Brazil from all European examples, with the exception of Portugal:

¹⁴⁵ Oliveira Salazar, *L'organisation corporative portugaise*, brochure n.355 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1943), 1.

¹⁴⁶ “Na elaboração do Estado Novo português ha aspetos que, a despeito de toda nossa aversão aos regimens ditos totalitarios, não podemos deixar de ver com a maior simpatia.(...) É pois de palpitante interesse para nós, no Brasil, que estamos no dever de promover uma obra de reconstituição politica e social, estudar as realizações do Estado Novo português, dado que como em Portugal, são as linhas configuradoras da sociedade familiar que terão de orientar esse trabalho patriótico.” Perillo Gomes, “Politica, Escola e Familia” *A Ordem* n. 85 (Dec 1937), 567-568.

Brazil is, without a doubt, a State with a corporative structure. Does it follow a Fascist model? No. Because it is through the State, and not by following moral and humanitarian principles that the Fascist unions aim to counter class struggle. Does it follow the German model? No, because in national-socialism there are no corporations, but rather an incorporation of the working class. If there is a model that is similar to ours it is the Portuguese, which stands for principles that are not far from the Catholic conception of State.¹⁴⁷

On the other hand, while showing support to the principles of the Portuguese system, the ESP did not wish to import this model to Canada, and as described in *L'Ordre Nouveau* in 1938, the École was adamant about preventing the installation of a dictatorial system in Canada:

Notre corporatisme n'est pas étatiste. Il ne s'accommoderait pas d'une dictature totalitaire. Sans doute, nous reconnaissons la nécessité d'un État fort, capable, quand il le faut, pour la sauvegarde du bien général, d'imposer sa volonté. Mais nous n'admettons pas qu'il se substitue à l'initiative privée, qu'il enlève aux particuliers et aux groupes d'hommes les attributions dont ils sont aptes à s'acquitter par eux-mêmes. [...] Notre corporatisme est exclusivement social. Il n'ambitionne aucune participation directe du gouvernement de l'État.¹⁴⁸

However, the aversion of the ESP towards a totalitarian regime in Canada did not mean that they opposed the establishment of dictatorships elsewhere, and in many instances, the ESP argued that the Portuguese context required the end of the liberal State. A publication that demonstrates such sentiment is that of Aubrey F. Bell's experience in Portugal, published in the journal *Rélations* in 1942:

Il y a un quart de siècle, le peuple portugais jouissait de toutes les formes politiques de la démocratie [...]. La corruption était générale; on avait, chaque

¹⁴⁷ “É nessa concepção institucionalista da sociedade que vamos encontrar os princípios inspiradores da nossa fórmula política, pois o Brasil já é, sem dúvida alguma, um Estado de estrutura corporativa. Segundo o modelo fascista? Não: porque ‘é por ser estatista, e não devido a razões morais ou humanitárias, que o sindicalismo fascista se pronuncia contra a luta de classes’ e se organiza corporativamente. Segundo o padrão germânico? Também não. Porque no nacional-socialismo não há corporação propriamente, mas incorporação das massas trabalhadoras ao novo regime, de forma mais exata - à Volksgemeinschaft. Se de algum modelo nos devemos aproximar intimamente, este é o de Portugal, cuja ordem corporativa, aliás, se ergue em linhas estruturais que não se distanciam demasiado da concepção católica de Estado.” Romeo Rodrigues Silva “O Problema Social no Brasil Contemporâneo” *A Ordem* n. 109 (Nov 1940), 406.

¹⁴⁸ “Corporatisme et démocratie”, *L'Ordre Nouveau*, 5 Dec 1938.

année, un gros déficit, le désordre des finances était inconcevable [...]. Le docteur Salazar et la nation portugaise ont rejeté une démocratie politique organisée de façon mesquine [...] et ils ont adopté une forme de démocratie véritable, [...] où l'objectif visé n'est pas une égalité dénuée de sens, mais une chance égale pour chacun, selon ses aptitudes, d'accomplir une fonction essentielle dans le grands corps de l'État.¹⁴⁹

5. Other Corporatist Models

Apart from Italy and Portugal a number of other corporatist systems were discussed in the publications of the ESP. While Brazilian Catholics mainly focused on studying the institutions of powerful states, for the ESP, it was essential to expose other corporatist examples in order to disassociate corporatism from statism. With this objective, the journal *L'Ordre Nouveau* published a series of articles on different models of Catholic corporatism in other nations.

The Austrian model headed by Engelbert Dollfuss was presented as a demonstration that a reform of the State was not the goal of Catholic corporatism *per se*, but only a first step in restoring corporative values in society. An 1937 publication put forward an opinion towards the Austrian experience that was similar to that of the Portuguese regime, that the corruption of the liberal institutions in Austria justified the end of the liberal State:

Si la réforme de l'État approche de sa fin, celle de la Société n'est que commencée, engagée par une réforme presque totalitaire de la constitution, réforme exigée par la mentalité autrichienne. Le système démocratique d'après-guerre avait conduit l'État au bord de l'abîme en permettant le développement libre des forces destructives; il aurait empêché toute réforme de la Société. [...] Le chancelier Dollfuss avait clairement compris le sérieux de la situation en créant, dans la constitution de 1934, une base légale pour la réforme idéologique et pratique de la Société dans le sens du corporatisme.¹⁵⁰

¹⁴⁹ Aubrey F. Bell, "Sous la dictature de Salazar", *Rérelations* (December 1942), 316-317.

¹⁵⁰ "L'Ordre corporatif en Autriche", *L'Ordre Nouveau*, 5 Jul 1937.

On the other hand, the example of Switzerland was published as a demonstration that not all forms of corporatism necessitated the end of the liberal State. In order to present the Swiss ideas on the movement, the *École* published a series of articles written by the Swiss corporatist Julien Lescaze, who exposed ideas that were similar to those of the ESP:

La Suisse “une et diverse” est placée à la croisée des chemins. Un “unitarisme”, un étatisme niveleur est contraire à son histoire, à ses traditions et à son esprit. Une seule solution s’impose: revenir à cet ordre naturel. [...] Que l’État détermine les cadres où naissent et se développent les corporations, qu’il surveille et contrôle leur activité pour qu’elles demeurent dans les limites de la loi, qu’il reste l’arbitre de la vie économique, le représentant indiscuté des intérêts généraux de la nation. Qu’à leur tour les corporations se donnent leur loi, règlent les modalités et les normes du métier, fixent leurs devoirs, qu’elles poursuivent le bien-être de leurs membres et se préoccupent du bien commun à tous.¹⁵¹

One last example that is worth mentioning is that of Franco’s corporatist regime in Spain. General Franco and the Spanish Civil War were a constant theme in the publications of both the ESP and the DVC. However, the support given by the Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics to Spanish nationalists should not be confused with a support to the corporatists institutions established by Franco. The ESP and the DVC did not evaluate the Spanish system based on how they organized their corporatist institutions, but rather by its positioning in the international struggle against communism.

For Catholics, the Spanish Civil War symbolized more than just a change in the Spanish government. Warned by letters of the Spanish clergy, one of which was published in its entirety by the ESP, Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics saw the conflict as a religious war against the enemies of the Catholic Church. The Spanish

¹⁵¹ Julien Lescaze, “L’Ordre Corporatif en Suisse”, *L’Ordre Nouveau*, 5th June 1937.

republican government was denounced in the publications of both institutions not only for denying Catholic rights but also for actively persecuting Christians and acting under the influence of the USSR. For this reason, both institutions saw Franco as a defender of Catholicism and suggested to its readers that “L’insurrection militaire a sauvé l’Espagne et suscité un levée en masse pour la défense de la foi et de la patrie”.¹⁵²

While the ESP became more attentive to Spain with the beginning of the Civil War, the DVC had been closely following the country’s political development even before the conflict ignited. As part of their resistance against a secularist republican movement in Brazil, the DVC used the Spanish conflict as an example of the dangers of living under liberal institutions:

The moderates, who unexpectedly rose to power [in the Spanish Republic] (...) paved the way for liberal demagogy. They come hand in hand with the red wave, which advances from all sides. On the horizon, one can already see the dilemma: a dictatorship of the military or of the proletariat.(...) The bourgeois liberal state conducts a *course à l’abime* in Spain.¹⁵³

On the other hand, instead of accusing liberal institutions for the terrors occurring Spain, the ESP directly blamed it on the influence of communism and the USSR and mostly used the Spanish civil war as anti-communist propaganda. After describing the hunger and destruction left by the defeated Spanish Republic, the account of Joseph Ledit published by the ESP in 1939 leaves as a lesson:

Ces tortures savantes on été le don que la Russie bolchevique a fait à l’Espagne. Depuis vingt ans, nous avons tous cru, hélas, que la Russie était loin, qu’il fallait la laisser à elle-même.(...) Ce qui est arrivé en Espagne arrivera ailleurs, et les [Juan] Négrin ne manqueront pas qui vendront leur pays à Moscou. (...)

¹⁵² Isidro Gomas Tomas, *La vérité sur l’Espagne*, brochure 278 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1937), 6.

¹⁵³ “Os moderados que receberam inesperadamente o poder, em 14 de abril, e que reabriram na Península a valvula da demagogia liberal, já se vêm a braços com a onda vermelha que de todos os lados avança. No horizonte já se esboça mesmo o dilemma: Sanjurjo ou Ramon Franco, a dictadura militar ou a dictadura proletaria.(...) Assim se opera, na Espanha, a ‘course á l’abime’ do Estado Burguez Liberal.” “Espanha Demagogica”, *A Ordem* n.19 (Sep 1931), 129-130.

Le mal est allé trop loin. Nous ne voyons qu'un seul remède, c'est la conversion de la Russie par l'apostolat des missionnaires catholiques, et, s'il le faut, leur emprisonnement (...), et même, si Dieu le veut, leur sacrifice suprême."¹⁵⁴

The contents of the Papal encyclicals were purposely broad because the popes were aware that their directives would have to be adapted to a number of different nations. Distinct interpretations of the Catholic social doctrine were not only permitted, but expected and addressed in a number of encyclicals.¹⁵⁵ Therefore, it is not shocking that distinct societies such as Brazil and Quebec developed different interpretations of the papal encyclicals. The coexistence of these variations within the Catholic corporative movement supports the argument that Catholic corporatism was more preoccupied with the acceptance of a spiritual explanation to the modern issues, than with a strict application of corporatist institutions. This argument is reflected in the assessment that the ESP and the DVC made of the distinct corporatist regimes.

The Italian regime was a clear example of corporatism put in practice, but it was criticised by the ESP and the DVC for not acknowledging the superiority of religious values over material ones. On the other hand, similar corporatist examples that also relied on a large role for the State, such as that of Portugal and Austria, were praised by both the ESP and the DVC for following the papal encyclicals and defending the restoration of Catholic morals. The differentiation made by Catholics between Portugal and Italy demonstrates that their focus was less on how institutions were organized, and more on their acceptance of the spiritual goals.

¹⁵⁴ Joseph Ledit, *L'Espagne au sortir de la guerre*, L'École sociale populaire 309 (Montréal: Imprimerie du Messager, 1939), 31-32.

¹⁵⁵ Encyclicals that dealt with specific situations are many, such as *Singulari Quadam* on working organizations in German, *IAMDUDUM* on family laws in Portugal, *Dilectissima Nobis* on Catholic persecutions in Spain, ect...

It is also clear that the support given by Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics to these corporatist systems varied according to their own beliefs. Based on the political thought of Joseph De Maistre, the Brazilian interpretation of *Quadragesimo Anno* argued in favour of the establishment of a powerful state which, guided by papal encyclicals, would be able to substitute the failed liberal institutions and reestablish Catholic morals. Under these assumptions, not only the DVC praised the Portuguese example, but also supported its implementation in Brazil. The belief in the necessity of a strong State even led some authors in the DVC to initially praise Italian corporatism, a support that disappeared thanks to the religious criticisms of Alceu Lima.

The ESP, on the other hand, argued that the State was too easily manipulated by business interests, and for that reason, interpreted *Quadragesimo Anno* as a call for the establishment of an independent corporative chamber. While denying the necessity of an authoritarian state in Canada, the ESP still praised the corporatist examples in Portugal and Austria, claiming that the specific circumstances of these nations required a stronger State.

An important factor that led Brazil and Quebec to interpret Catholic corporatism differently was the fact that they followed distinct intellectual influences. The adoption of La Tour du Pin by the ESP meant that the Catholic social doctrine in Quebec was focused on organizing union movements. Conversely, de Maistres' perception of the modern problems as having political roots led Brazilians to organize their corporatism around the state.

Nonetheless, as important as intellectual influences are in explaining the differences in the ESP and DVC's model of corporatism, an analysis of how their institutions were organized demonstrates that an understanding of the distinct social and economic contexts of their societies is vital to explain why these institutions followed distinct intellectual paths.

CHAPTER II: THE INSTITUTIONS OF CATHOLIC CORPORATISM

The defining characteristic that distinguished Catholic corporatism from other branches of the ideology was the belief that at its core, the social question was caused by a lack of religion and Catholic morals. However, despite professing a spiritual view of the world, Pius XI also proposed precise recommendations to reform temporal institutions. According to the Papal directives, three institutions were central to the Catholic doctrine: the Church, the unions and the State, each carrying primordial objectives: The State would protect society from liberal and communist abuses, the corporations would grant a larger voice to the different sectors of society, and finally the Church would be responsible for the reintroduction of Catholic morals. This chapter analyses how the different economic and social contexts in Brazil and Quebec led the ESP and the DVC to arrive at different conclusions regarding how these three institutions should be organized.

While most corporatist ideas focused on describing the roles of the unions and the State, the Catholic corporatists of the ESP and the DVC gave equal importance to the role of the Church and the Catholic Action. Leo XIII had already made clear that the Church and the Catholic community were critical pieces to solving the social question. Seeking to follow Leo XIII's path, Pius XI's *Quadragesimo Anno* reaffirmed the importance of the Church in a corporatist society. Furthermore, Pius XI sought to transform parts of the structure of the Church so that Catholics could better perform their renewed duties. The Pope's main contribution towards this goal was the reformation of the Catholic Action, which incorporated lay movements into the

Church's apostolate. The unprecedented enlargement of lay action within the Church led to a number of crucial questions, in particular with regards to what was its main purpose, who would be able to be a part of it, and what its relation would be to the Church and its role in politics. The ESP and the DVC had different answers to some of these questions, and as it is argued in this chapter, their distinct conclusions with regard to the Catholic Action are largely due to the differences in the resources available to the Catholic Church of each country, as well as how effectively the Church was able to promulgate the social doctrine among the population. The resourceful and largely popular French Canadian Catholic Church was able to transform the Catholic Action into a mass movement, while the highly elitist character of Brazilian Catholics led them to limit the size of the movement and focus solely on the formation of a Catholic elite.

Apart from the Church, Pius XI also proposed that unions ought to be organized in a corporative manner, putting corporatism at the forefront of Catholic policies. Both the ESP and DVC prioritized this point, yet opinions between the two diverged when determining the unions' ability to represent society as a whole. In this chapter, it is argued that Quebec's industrial background and the fact that by 1931 unions were already important in the province, set the stage for the ESP to envision a future where the province's entire productive sector could be represented by unions. As such, the corporative chamber would have the authority to fully represent the province's productive forces. In Brazil, on the other hand, the agricultural context created significant hurdles for the development of unions, leading Brazilian Catholic corporatists to diminish the power of the corporative chamber. For the DVC, the State was considered to be the only institution capable of fully representing society, leading

them to argue in favour of state intervention in national social and economic policies

Lastly, when comparing the corporatist models defended by the ESP and the DVC it also becomes evident that they supported contrasting forms of state. This is particularly noticeable when comparing the opposing opinions they had regarding democracy. In this section it is argued that the distinct amount of influence that Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics could exert in national politics led them to respectively favour and oppose an authoritarian State. As Brazilian Catholics were able to acquire strong political support for their corporatist ideas, DVC saw politics in the Vargas era as a reliable tool to implement its policies. Conversely, the strong opposition of English Canadians at the federal level led the ESP to disregard the possibility of a Pan-canadian corporatist movement. Furthermore, even at the provincial level, French Canadian Catholics were also wary of relying on the State for the establishment of corporatism, since a more powerful State could risk the dominance of the Catholic Church over areas such as education and healthcare.

Another important element that must also be considered in the explanation of why the DVC and the ESP respectively favoured and denied authoritarian forms of state is how these institutions evaluated their historical experiences with liberal governments. While the secularist policies of the old republic led the DVC to portray liberal governments as unfit for the Catholic Brazilian people, the ESP presented the traditional liberal institutions established in Canada as a shield against the imposition of secular-anglican culture in Quebec.

1. The Catholic Action

The reintroduction of Catholic morals in society was a central objective of Catholic corporatism. The Papal encyclicals were clear in stating that while the reorganization of unions and State were important, alone they were insufficient to achieve the spiritual objective sought. Therefore, in addition to the unions and State, the Church would also have to be reformed in order to accomplish its new objectives. At the center of this reorganization was the Catholic Action.

Pius XI asserted that the clergy alone was not enough to guarantee the development of a modern Christian society, and that laymen too had a vital role in applying the Catholic social doctrine. Although the idea of laymen collaborating in Church activities was far from novel, Pius XI's proposal integrated non-clerics as part of the apostolate, challenging the classic view of laymen as passive listeners and turning them into crucial collaborators of the clergy. Such a change required precise guidance from the Church, which was provided both through encyclicals as well as various open letters to the clergies of different nations.

Following the recommendations of the Holy See, Catholics in both Brazil and Quebec sought the creation of their own versions of the Catholic Action. However, by analyzing the way in which the ESP and the DVC described the lay organization, it can be observed that the distinct roles that the Catholic Church played in their respective societies lead these institutions to pursue different strategies.

The Catholic Action in Quebec was an initiative of the clergy designed to engage a large number of Catholics by creating tools that allowed for the participation

of the general public. Apart from popular movements, the Church was also preoccupied with creating smaller groups of elites with a more rigorous selection of members which, under the guidance of the clergy, were meant to serve as the lay leaders of the Catholic Action. In order to efficiently spread these groups across the province, the French Canadian Church made use of its well-developed infrastructure and of previously established lay associations, such as the l'Action Catholique de la Jeunesse Canadienne Française (ACJC) and the Ligues du Sacré-coeur.

This method and other characteristics of the Catholic Action in Canada were described by Father Archambault in a 1937 brochure. He stated that Quebec ought to take advantage of the existing parish structure in the province, not only to follow Pius XI's recommendations, but also because of the province's administrative setting.¹⁵⁶ Quebec was the only Canadian province that could rely on well-organized Catholic institutions to facilitate the propagation of the lay movements. According to Archambault, the privileged context of Quebec also justified the Church to initially focus on organizing corporatism and the Canadian Catholic Action in the province, so that it would serve later as a model for the rest of Canada.

A cet appel pontifical [former l'Action Catholique] (...) Il ne faut pas oublier combien est complexe notre situation: territoire immense, dont les besoins et les ressources varient suivant les régions, dualité ethnique qui rend presque impossible tout mouvement d'ensemble, multitude d'oeuvres qui, sans être toujours d'Action catholique, occupent cependant le terrain où celle-ci devrait déployer son activité. Aussi parut-il difficile d'établir du premier coup un plan général. On crut préférable laisser chaque diocèse appliquer à son état particulier les règles dictées par Rome. (...) L'organisation qui est la plus développée et sur laquelle les autres se modèlent peu à peu, [c'est] l'Action catholique du diocèse de Québec. Ici plus qu'ailleurs le terrain était préparé.¹⁵⁷

¹⁵⁶ Joseph-Papin Archambault, *L'Action catholique au Canada*, brochures n.287 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1937), 13.

¹⁵⁷ *ibid*, 8.

Organizing the lay movements within the Church's existing infrastructure also facilitated the French Canadian clergy's supervision over lay activities. While the Catholic Action was described by Pius XI as an action of laymen, the "adult" division of the French Canadian movement relied on the close guidance of the clergy, especially amongst its leadership.¹⁵⁸ The leader of the movement was the Archbishop of Quebec who in turn appointed a member of the clergy as director of the Catholic Action. The highest rank a non-cleric could achieve was to be a member of the Comité Central Permanent, whose purpose was to aid the director.¹⁵⁹

Not only did the clergy represent the upper echelons of the movement's hierarchy, but they also kept control over the local lay leadership, namely the Comité Paroissial. Despite the rigorous conditions imposed to those who wished to take part in the Comités, Archambault stated that these elite lay groups should only carry administrative roles as all decision-making was to be left to the clergy.

Composé de laïcs, le Comité [paroissial] dépend cependant de l'autorité ecclésiastique. En d'autres termes, il doit être entre les mains du curé, il doit constituer son état-major. (...) Le Comité paroissial est d'abord le conseil du curé. Il le renseigne sur chose qu'il devrait savoir. (...) Après l'avoir conseillé, le comité agit d'après les instructions du curé. Il met à exécution les décisions prises.¹⁶⁰

Even in smaller initiatives, where the laymen were permitted to make their own decisions, the clergy would maintain its supervision through the presence of the *aumônier*, whose role was guaranteed that the groups of the Catholic action would not deviate from their spiritual objectives. As described by Adrien Malo:

¹⁵⁸ The publications of the ESP makes a distinction between the young and the adult branches of the Catholic Action. While the term *jeunesse catholique* is often used, the adult branch is referred to simply as *Action Catholique*.

¹⁵⁹ Archambault, *L'Action catholique au Canada*, 19.

¹⁶⁰ *ibid*, 15-16.

L'aumônier revient un rôle précis (...) Les prêtres doivent diriger les laïcs afin que l'action de ceux-ci ne dévie pas du droit sentier qu'ils doivent suivre et qu'elle respecte toujours, avec la fidélité requise, les règles et directives donnés par la hiérarchie ecclésiastique. (...) [La] mission essentielle [de l'aumônier] est de garder l'âme de l'apostolat; c'est auprès d'eux que les militants viendront purifier, redresser, fortifier leur activité apostolique¹⁶¹

In short, two main features of the adult branch of the French Canadian Catholic Action between 1930 and 1945 can be remarked upon. First, the movement had a far reach that took advantage of an existing network of parishes to spread lay activity throughout Quebec. Second, it was closely supervised by the clergy at all levels, which was made possible by the large number of members in the French Canadian Catholic Church. Under these circumstances, no doubt the resources available to Quebec's clergy and the appeal that the Church's initiatives had for the population played a large role in defining the French Canadian organization of the Catholic Action. The influence of these factors becomes even more evident when comparing to the same movement in Brazil where the clergy did not enjoy the same level of infrastructure.

The Brazilian Catholic Action (BCA) was not initiated directly by the clergy, but by the influential laymen of the Dom Vital Center who, under the guidance of Cardinal Sebastião Leme, became the leaders of the movement. Unlike in Quebec, the BCA could not rely on a well-organized Church to spread its activities, and its leaders had to develop their own administrative infrastructure. The DVC's efforts to centralize the Catholic Action as a national movement led to the creation of the Brazilian Catholic Coalition (BCC). According to Alceu Lima, this congregation was necessary not only for administrative purposes, but also so that its otherwise isolated initiatives could achieve a sense of belonging to the same cohesive movement:

¹⁶¹ Adrien Malo, *L'Action catholique spécialisée*, brochure n. 279 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1937) 22.

[The different branches of the Catholic Action] needed a common denomination. While each can maintain their independence, they have a spiritual connection that unifies all of them into the same group. This is where the idea for the Brazilian Catholic Coalition came from, which today represents the unification of our practices and doctrinal studies.¹⁶²

The hierarchy of the Catholic Action in Brazil was much less rigid than in Quebec. The centralization measures established by the DVC never sought to control or supervise the different actions, but to create a mutually supportive system that would be attractive to other Catholic initiatives. The Secretariat of the Catholic Action was an example of this supportive spirit. Its goal was to assist the members of the BCC with services like a printing press, the collection and distribution of resources, and mail distribution.¹⁶³

In addition to providing administrative aid, being part of the Brazilian Catholic Action also granted the social prestige that came with being endorsed by the Church. With that, not only were members of the BCC able to rely on some assistance from the clergy and other religious orders, but could also draw support from the local elite and even the State. This last factor was notably important, as the connection that the DVC had with Brazil's political leaders was key in promoting Catholic initiatives within the government's infrastructure. An example that will be better analysed later in this thesis was the labour circles established by Father Brentano. With the help the Minister of Labour and DVC supporter Waldemar Falcão, the movement was able to grow from a local initiative in Rio Grande do Sul to a national confederation.¹⁶⁴

¹⁶² “Tudo isso exigia uma denominação commum, que mantendo a autonomia de cada nucleo explicasse o laço espiritual e constitutivo que reúne a todos num mesmo feixe de esforços concordantes. Dahi nasceu a idéia de darmos a esse grupo de associações o nome de Colligação Catholica Brasileira, que é o que actualmente designa a nossa concentração de estudos doutrinarios de acção pratica”. “Mais um Anno de Trabalho” *A Ordem* n. 33 (Nov 1932), 336.

¹⁶³ “Secretariado de Acção Social Catholica”, *A Ordem* n.35 (Jan 1931), 56.

¹⁶⁴ Waldemar Falcão had been a member of the Catholic Electoral League in 1934 and close collaborator

When comparing the manner in which the Catholic Action was organized in Brazil and in Quebec, a number of differences stand out. In French Canada, the Church maintained clerical control at all levels of the movement, while the leadership of the lay intellectuals of the DVC was primarily felt at the ideological level. The Catholic Action in Brazil and in Quebec also varied in terms of size. While there were sporadic mentions in *A Ordem* regarding the foundation of different branches of the DVC in other Brazilian capitals, Archambault stated in 1937 that the French Canadian Catholic Action had already established 84 Comités Paroissiaux all over the province.¹⁶⁵

2. The Catholic Youth Movements

According to the directives of Pius XI, age and gender ought to be the main factors to divide the various groups within the Catholic Action, and each division ought to have their respective duties in constructing a Catholic society. Youth groups received notable attention from the Catholic Church; their organizations were charged with the crucial role of guaranteeing the spread of Catholic social doctrine amongst future generations. However, regardless of pursuing this same objective, Catholic youth movements in Brazil and in Quebec developed very differently.

In the 1930s, Quebec saw a considerable growth of youth movements, which the Catholic Church sought to incorporate into the episcopate through the Catholic Action. The French Canadian Catholic youth groups would eventually develop massive proportions, marking what historian Louise Bienvenue characterizes as the birth of

with the DVC.

¹⁶⁵ The amount of Comités Paroissiaux is exposed in: Archambault: *L'Action Catholique au Canada*, 18; A summary of the Brazilian Catholic Action can be found in: Athayde, "Coligação Católica Brasileira", 2.

youth as a key social group in Quebec.¹⁶⁶

In the early 1930s, there were two main French Canadian movements of Catholic youth. The first was the Action Catholique de la Jeunesse Canadienne Française (ACJC), which became part of the Catholic Action by following the strategy of incorporating previously existent organizations. Founded in 1904 by a number of ecclesiastics, including Lionel Groulx and the Jesuit Samuel Bellavance, the ACJC was considered in the early 30s as the main youth organization in Quebec. However, following Jesuit traditionally elitist values, the influence of the ACJC was mostly restricted to colleges, and it never surpassed 3000 members.¹⁶⁷

The second was the Action Catholique Spécialisé (ACS). This movement, which was a French Canadian adaptation of a Belgian initiative of the same name, was much more inclusive than the ACJC and allowed the Catholic Action to become a mass movement in Quebec. As stated by Bienvenue:

Ces mouvements [spécialisés] de jeunesse d'Action catholique se révélèrent vite fort mobilisateurs. Leurs effectifs réunis dépassèrent non seulement tout ce qui avait pu exister jusqu'alors comme cercles et associations de jeunesse franco-catholiques, mais également ceux de la plupart des autres groupes de jeunes qui apparaissaient à la même époque.¹⁶⁸

The organization of the ACS was structured differently from the rest of the Catholic Action. Distinct sectors of society would each have their own “specialized” organization, congregating the Catholic youth of individual social groups. The most important of these specialized movements were the Jeunesse Étudiante Catholique (JEC, 1935) designed for students, the Jeunesse Ouvrière Catholique (JOC, 1932) for the working class, the Jeunesse Indépendante Catholique (JIC, 1936) for the

¹⁶⁶ Louise Bienvenue, *Quand la jeunesse entre en scène*, (Montréal: Boréal, 2003).

¹⁶⁷ *ibid*, 31.

¹⁶⁸ *ibid*, 16.

bourgeoisie, and the Jeunesse Agricole Catholique (JAC, 1935) for the rural class.

The groups of the ACS did not have their meetings within the established infrastructure of the Church. Instead, they were to congregate at the very place where the social group usually reunited, or as described by Adrien Malo in 1937, within the *milieu*:

Le milieu, c'est le bureau, l'usine, l'école, la faculté, le cercle de jeux, l'équipe, le syndicat, la chambre de commerce, c'est surtout la famille, la société et la profession. (...) L'Action catholique spécialisée se fait dans le milieu lui-même. Elle ne se fait pas à l'église où un nombre de plus en plus grand n'entrent plus, ni au cercle d'études qui ne groupe que dirigeants et militants, ni dans les oeuvres qui n'englobent pas d'ordinaire tous les individus. Elle exige donc que le militant reste avec ses camarades, ouvrier, étudiant, agriculteur, bourgeois comme eux.¹⁶⁹

The fact that the ACS' meetings occurred within the *milieu* reveals that these institutions had objectives that were distinct from the rest of the Catholic Action. In addition to spreading the Catholic doctrine amongst the youth, the specialized groups also served as a stronghold for the Catholic Church within the different sectors of society. The specialised action was an institutional expression of the belief that Catholicism was a way of life that surpassed liturgy and ceremony, and that a Catholic's duty to God was not confined within the walls of the church. Adrien Malo made such objective clear in 1937:

[L'Action Catholique Spécialisée] se fait pour le milieu. Aussi fait-elle comprendre qu'il est desséchant de vivre sa vie professionnelle et d'y juxtaposer sa vie chrétienne: être chrétien, puis être ouvrier sans que cela exerce une influence sur ceci. (...) ce qui est l'idéal, c'est d'insérer la profession dans le christianisme. Dans ce cas, le christianisme n'affecte pas seulement notre manière d'être ouvrier, étudiant, agriculteur, mais être ouvrier, être étudiant, être agriculteur deviennent autant de manières d'être chrétien.¹⁷⁰

Fearing that the enthusiasm over the ACS would result in various uncoordinated

¹⁶⁹ Malo, *L'Action catholique spécialisée*, 4.

¹⁷⁰ *ibid*, 5.

initiatives, the French Canadian clergy sought to unify the Catholic youth in one single hierarchy. With this objective in mind, Cardinal Villeneuve awarded in 1935 the leadership of the entire Catholic youth movement to the more experienced ACJC which would become “le cadre général dans lequel doivent prendre place tous les mouvements spécialisés de jeunesse catholique.”¹⁷¹

However, a series of conflicts between the ACJC and the ACS halted this unification and led to a “cultural shock” between the two initiatives. According to Bienvenue, out of all the different reasons that led to this conflict, the most important was the refusal of the ACS to acknowledge national actions as part of the duties of the Catholic Action. The argument raised by the members of the ACS was that the prohibition of Charles Maurras’ *Action Française* and the criticisms of Rome towards the nationalism of Hitler and Mussolini, all rejected the politicization of the Catholic Action, and encouraged limiting its actions exclusively to those related to religious purposes. Under these circumstances, national action would be permitted only at the individual level, and would not become an objective of the Catholic Action as an institution.

However, that was not the view of the members of the ACJC, who had traditionally been linked to the national ideas of its founder, Lionel Groulx. According to the leaders of the ACJC:

L’ACJC n’admet pas de mur étanche entre le patriotisme et la foi. Elle croit que ce qui est vraiment moral et social est aussi vraiment catholique. Elle se refuse à n’être qu’une institution nationale sans souci de formation religieuse; mais, en revanche, elle rejette la thèse d’un catholicisme étroit et exclusif qui négligerait la question nationale. Elle croit que les devoirs envers Dieu ne s’opposent pas aux devoirs envers la nation, mais qu’ils sont, au contraire, intimement liés.¹⁷²

¹⁷¹ Archambault, *L’Action Catholique au Canada*, 32.

¹⁷² Archambault, *La Jeunesse et l’Action catholique*, brochures n.319-320 (Montreal: École sociale

In the discussion over whether or not the Catholic Action should pursue a national mission, the ESP sought to offer arguments that supported the national cause as Archambault was also a supporter the national ideas propelled by Lionel Groulx. In a 1940 brochure, the director of the ESP stated that indeed some national actions did not enter the religious sphere. For instance, while the nomination of bilingual workers as public servants was a legitimate right of French Canadians, these were not religious actions in nature, and therefore should not be defended by the Catholic Action.

On the other hand, Archambault argued that in some situations national action could very well merge with religious duties. To illustrate this argument, Archambault mentioned the movement of *achat chez nous*: “Dans telle paroisse où un marchand canadien-français, dévoué à nos oeuvres, lutte seul contre la concurrence de marchands d’autre religion, son sort intéresse nos institutions religieuses et puisse déterminer une démarche de l’Action catholique.”¹⁷³

Archambault was careful enough to make clear that the ultimate decision of whether or not the Catholic Action should pursue a national mission ought to be left to the bishops. However, by presenting an argument in favour of the national duty for the Catholic Action, the ESP demonstrated their connection with the nationalist thought of Lionel Groulx and represented a large sector of the French Canadian Catholic Church that connected French Canadian identity and Catholicism.

This ideological conflict ultimately lead to the disassociations of the ACJC from the Catholic Action in 1941¹⁷⁴, and as a result, the self regulating ACS enjoyed

populaire, 1940), 51.

¹⁷³ *ibid*, 54.

¹⁷⁴ Bienvenue, *Quand la jeunesse entre en scène*, 47.

considerably more independence from clerical surveillance than any other lay movement in Quebec.¹⁷⁵ While the ESP had favoured the ACJC in the discussions of the national duties of the Catholic Action, its publications continued to support the ACS for the entire period studied, notably because of the important mission it carried.

While the *Jeunesse Catholique* in Quebec was open to most young Catholics, the Brazilian youth movement was much more restrained, directing its efforts towards university students. This severely hindered the movement's growth since access to higher education in 1930s Brazil was extremely limited. The first branch of the Brazilian Catholic Action dedicated to the youth was the Catholic University Action (CUA), founded in 1929 by the DVC. This organization aimed to “establish an association focused on congregating Catholic students that were not satisfied solely with a diploma, and that did not accept the growth of communism in the Universities.”¹⁷⁶

The CUA did not aspire to reach the massive numbers sought out by the Action Catholique Spécialisée. In fact, in 1935 the Brazilian youth movement consisted of a mere 40 to 50 students.¹⁷⁷ These small numbers corresponded with the DVC's view that the youth branch of the Catholic Action was not a tool for incorporating the entire population, but rather for educating a young elite who would continue the DVC's greater objective of “christianizing Brazilian intellectuals and intellectualizing

¹⁷⁵ *ibid.*, 41-53.

¹⁷⁶ “(...) fundar uma associação destinada especialmente a congregar os estudantes catholicos, que não se resignavam a passar pelas escolas apenas para ganhar o seu diploma, nem se resignavam com o espectáculo de ver os meios universitarios cada vez mais penetrados de communismo, theorico e pratico”. Athayde, “Colligação Catholica Brasileira”, 349.

¹⁷⁷ *ibid.*

religion.”¹⁷⁸

While the different amount of resources available to the Brazilian and French Canadian Church can explain the differences in the “adult” organization of their Catholic Action, the same explanation cannot be applied to the youth branch. The massive appeal of the Action Catholique Spécialisée was only possible due to the strong connection that the Catholic Church in Quebec had with the ordinary French Canadian population, which was in part a result of the important role that the Church played in defining French Canadian identity.¹⁷⁹

On the other hand, the highly elitist character of the Catholic Church in Brazil discouraged the DVC from establishing a direct connection with the people. Instead, the BCA adopted a strategy that focused solely on the elites, spreading their message in a language that was mostly inaccessible to the highly illiterate Brazilian population. The elite-driven strategy was supported by Pius XI, who wrote in his letter to the Brazilian clergy:

We recommend that you put the maximum amount of effort in the training of those who intend to fight in the ranks of the Catholic Action: religious, moral and social education are indispensable for those wishing to effectively exercise the work of the apostolate. Therefore, because of the strict education requirement, it will be indispensable not to start with large agglomerations in the initial phase, but with small groups, whose training in theory and practice, will be the evangelical ferment that will transform the entire mass.¹⁸⁰

Though the ESP also retained an elitist character – primarily in the leadership of lay movements – it also created tools that permitted a larger participation of the masses

¹⁷⁸ *ibid*, 348.

¹⁷⁹ This idea will be further explored in Chapter 3 of this study.

¹⁸⁰ “Antes de tudo vos recommendamos a maior solícitude possível na formação dos que desejem combater nas fileiras da A. C.: a formação religiosa, moral e social indispensável aos que quiserem exercitar com êxito o apostolado no meio da sociedade moderna. E justamente devido a esta absoluta exigência de formação, não se deve começar com vistosas aglomerações, mas lançando mão de grupos, que bem adestrados na teoria e na prática serão o fermento evangélico que fará levedar e transformar-se toda a massa.” Pius XI, “Acção Catholica Brasileira”, *A Ordem* n.66 (Jan 1936), 7.

by simplifying its messages and by establishing the Action Catholique Spécialisée. On the other hand, as explained in one of *A Ordem*'s editorials in 1932, the Brazilian State was seen by the DVC as the fundamental institution capable of leading the population. Given this belief, it was not necessary for the Church to embrace popular participation but to focus on the education of the Catholic political elite that could influence the State towards Catholicism:

[...] the Nation follows the [religion of the] State, so it is necessary to act on the latter to influence the second. England became protestant through Henry VIII, France defended itself from Protestantism thanks to Louis XIV, and today, Stalin intends to materialize Russia by imposing a materialistic State. We should also act on the State in order to conserve the original christian characteristics of our nation.¹⁸¹

3. Catholic Action and Politics

Of all the areas in which the Catholic Action was allowed to operate, none was more controversial than politics. The fact that laymen could now be part of the apostolate meant that the discussion of their role in political movements was directly connected to the heated debates regarding the relationship between Church and State. Nonetheless, the relevance of the Catholic Action's political role can be seen in the abundance of documents and encyclicals focused on demonstrating to Catholics the importance and the limits of direct religious action on the State.

Since the Holy See voiced their positions regarding this matter on numerous occasions, at the theoretical level, the ESP and the DVC mostly expressed similar opinions. Both organizations stated that it was a Catholic's duty to defend "the rights"

¹⁸¹ "(...) a nação segue o Estado, de modo que é preciso agir sobre este para influenciar aquela, pois um povo possui sempre a religião dos seus dirigentes. A Inglaterra se tornou protestante com a apostasia de Henrique VIII e a França se defendeu da Reforma com a opção de Luiz XIV (...), como hoje Stalin pretende materializar a nação russa impondo-lhe um Estado materialista. Deveríamos, nós também, agir directamente á nação as suas características christãs." "Dever Politico dos Catholicos", *A Ordem* n.25 (Mar 1932), 165.

of the Church against secular political movements, ensuring that the State would not forbid Catholics to act in areas that the Church believed to be of importance, such as education and unions.

However, as a result of the Church's previous experiences of mixing holy orders with political movements, Rome set limitations on clerical political action. The most important of these experiences was that of Charles Maurras' *Action Française*, which was seen by the Church as a submission of religious values to politics. Pius XI condemned Maurras' idea of the *politique d'abord*, reminding Catholics of the supremacy of religious values over political ones and that the loyalty to the Church ought to come ahead of the loyalty to any nation. In order to avoid the growth of this type of movement, the Church not only forbade the creation of a Catholic party, it also prohibited members of the clergy from favouring any specific political group.

Both the ESP and the DVC were preoccupied with explaining to their readers that while political action was important, it also had to be carried out carefully. But despite these similar preoccupations, an analysis of the publications of the DVC and the ESP reveals that the Brazilian Catholic Action placed more importance on direct political action than their French Canadian counterpart.

Such a statement should not be understood as an allegation that the ESP ignored the importance of the Catholic Action in politics. Their publications are emphatic in explaining that lay movements, as much as the Church, had the right to directly intervene in politics when necessary. That was the argument raised by Jean Fillion in 1938:

L'Action catholique possède le droit d'intervention directe dans le domaine politique, en vue d'assurer par l'emploi de moyens légitimes, l'application des

principes chrétiens et la protection des droits religieux des consciences. l'Église a le droit et le devoir de descendre sur le terrain politique pour assurer la réalisation de ses fins spirituelles et l'Action catholique, puisqu'elle poursuit les mêmes fins, devra suivre l'Église et étendre sa compétence aussi loin qu'elle"¹⁸²

However, while the French Canadian Catholic Action was allowed to take part in politics, the ESP stated that it should not be its primary goal. According to the argument of Léo Pelland in 1942, direct political intervention of the Church should only occur in order to guarantee that the Church could maintain its rights.

Lorsque la politique s'approche de l'autel et touche à la religion, il est naturel que le Pape, les évêques, le clergé et l'Action catholique se lèvent pour le combat. Il est vain alors de parler de politique, là où seulement la religion et la morale sont en cause. Les empiétements sont le fait des États qui contestent à l'Église l'exercice de sa juridiction prééminente et s'érigent en tyrans de la personne humaine.¹⁸³

In contrast, the political branch of the Brazilian Catholic Action was the most influential section of the movement. The Catholics of the DVC believed that the State had a fundamental role to play in the construction of the corporatist society and thus believed that political action was necessary in order to guide the State towards a corporatist form. In 1933, Oscar Mendes argued that the rights of the Church to act within education and unions were under direct attack by secularist movements, which legitimized Catholic political action in Brazil.

It would be a betrayal [to our country] if we allowed the materialists and their destructive ideas to disseminate their selfish and limited experiences. Therefore, it is our duty to act in the political sphere, through indoctrination and practice. [...] Republican agnosticism and the neglect of the Catholics were the most influencing factors in the moral misery of our political life. Therefore, only a restoration of Catholic morals in Brazil can slowly clean and reinvigorate our nation's battered politics [...] To achieve this objective, it is necessary to participate in politics, either in executive and legislative roles, or through an

¹⁸² Jean Filion, *Jeunesse et politique*, n. 292 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1938) 18.

¹⁸³ M. Léo Pelland, *L'Action Catholique et la Politique*, brochure n. 336 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1942).10.

intense catechism of public opinion.¹⁸⁴

The DVC was aware of the limitations imposed by Rome with regards to mixing the Catholic Action and politics, and they were adamant against the creation of a Catholic political party. Instead, they sought to act in politics by means of the Catholic Electoral League (CEL), described by Alceu Lima in 1932 as "one of the most active bodies of the Brazilian Catholic Action."¹⁸⁵ The league offered electoral support to any politician who vowed to defend the political platform of the DVC. By opening up membership to politicians of any political party, Brazilian Catholics believed they could support religious policies without directly favouring specific political groups.

The successes of the Catholic Electoral League were reflected in the Constitutional Assembly of 1934, whose outcome was described by historian Jesse Jane Vieira as a great victory for the Catholic Church.¹⁸⁶ There, Catholics were able to ensure several of its objectives, including religious education in state funded schools, the right to create denominational unions and even the inclusion of God as the source of state power.

In short, the Catholic Action in both Brazil and Quebec became influential actors in their societies between 1930 and 1945, and in both cases these lay movements were strongly supported by Catholic corporatists. The directives of Pius XI leave little

¹⁸⁴ "A Traição aqui seria deixar que os materialistas grosseiros, os ideólogos sem ideias ou de ideias destruidores, exercitassem a seu talento, no organismo patrio, as suas experiências egoísticas e limitadas. O dever, portanto, é agir no campo político, pela doutrinação e pela prática, afim de sustentar em tempo esse resvalamento para a animação total. (...) "No Brasil, vemos que o mal é perfeitamente este. O agnosticismo republicano e, porque não dizê-lo? a tibieza dos próprios católicos, foram os factores preponderantes na miséria moral da nossa vida política. De modo que, somente uma restauração da moral, e no caso do Brasil, nação católica, da moral católica, poderia ir, lentamente, (não devemos sonhar com resultados fulminantes) saneando, desentortando, revigorando, o combalido mundo político nacional. (...) "Mas para isso é mister que, ou aja elle directamente na política em postos de direcção e legislação, ou se entregue a uma catechese intensa da opinião publica." Oscar Mendes, "A Política dos Católicos", *A Ordem* n.39 (Jul-Aug 1933), 581-583.

¹⁸⁵ *Mais um anno de trabalho*, 334.

¹⁸⁶ Vieira, *Círculos Operários*, 210.

doubt that corporatism and the Catholic Action were meant to complement one another, and following the Papal directives, the publications of both the ESP and the DVC also shared such belief. However, by analysing the development of the Catholic Action in Brazil and Quebec, it is possible to note the considerable adaptation that the Catholic social doctrine suffered in these societies. That is notably true, considering that the theoretical ideas expressed by the ESP and the DVC were not necessarily reflected in their practice.

In the case of Brazil, corporatism became one of the main flags raised by the Catholic Action, and its members directed much effort to the development of Brazilian corporatism. However, the argument that the social question would be resolved if the State carried a Catholic character led the DVC to focus most of its actions in the political sphere. The social aspect of the Catholic doctrine, which encouraged Catholics to act directly on alleviating the dire conditions of the working class was, in turn, largely ignored by the BCA. Such a choice is explained by the highly elitist character of the Brazilian Catholic lay group, and the disconnection of its members to the realities and material needs of the Brazilian working class.

Meanwhile in Quebec, where the mass movements of the ACS the Catholic Action allowed more contact with the population, the social aspect of the Catholic doctrine was privileged at the cost of neglecting corporatist values. As demonstrated by Louise Bienvenue, the specialized groups' resistance towards adopting the national cause created an intellectual gap between the Catholic youth and the Catholic nationalist groups, the latter including Lionel Groulx and the ESP. As a result, the relatively autonomous ACS became more interested in supporting initiatives connected

to the social question, public leisure and religious education as opposed to promoting corporatist organizations and union movements.

In fact, as demonstrated by Louise Bienvenue, the corporatist ideals defended by the ESP were sometimes perceived by the ACS as a barrier to their objective of creating a unified youth movement:

L'institutionnalisation des divisions entre classes sociales, prévue dans la formule [de l'ACS] est une référence directe au modèle d'organisation corporatiste. [...] Le discours motivant des premières années cache mal les craintes associées à l'adoption d'une telle structure de regroupement de la jeunesse catholique. "l'Action catholique n'épaissit pas les murailles qui cloisonnent les classes", clame-t-on pour se convaincre. [...] Les mouvements reconnaissent généralement le caractère pratique de la division par milieu, mais ils se sentent souvent à l'étroit dans leur mission ciblée et aspirent à une représentation plus universelle de la jeunesse. [...] Malgré ces échappées, les mouvements sont fidèles au modèle de division inspiré du corporatisme.¹⁸⁷

While other Catholic movements would not become openly opposed to corporatism until after 1945, this example clarifies that the adoption of corporatism by all Catholics should not be taken for granted. Therefore, one must not confuse the successes of the Catholic Action in Brazil and Quebec with a general popular support for corporatism. The elitist barriers imposed by the BCA, as well as the insistence of French Canadian traditionalists in defending the national objectives were, in fact, detrimental to the spread of their corporatist cause.

4. Unions

Decades before the publication of *Quadragesimo Anno*, early social Catholics such as La Tour du Pin, Msgr. Ketteler and Frederic Le Play already argued that working associations were central institutions for tackling the social question. The

¹⁸⁷ Bienvenue, *Quand la jeunesse entre en scène*, 110-111.

initiatives taken by these Catholic intellectuals were influential in making denominational unions one of the pillars of the Catholic social doctrine. While *Rerum Novarum* referred to the importance of establishing Catholic unions directly, the Church came to realize over time that isolated Catholic confederations alone could not always effectively exert national influence.¹⁸⁸ As a result, *Quadragesimo Anno* acknowledged the importance of joining forces between Catholic and non-Catholic unions. To do so, unions would have to be organized in a corporative manner so that Catholics would be able to influence other labour and employer associations to follow Catholic morals. According to Pius XI, this would contribute towards greatly diminishing class conflict.

Side by side with [secular] unions there should always be associations zealously engaged in imbuing and forming their members in the teaching of religion and morality so that they in turn may be able to permeate the unions with that good spirit which should direct them in all their activity. As a result, the religious associations will bear good fruit beyond the circle of their own membership.¹⁸⁹

Given the importance that the papal encyclicals placed on Catholic working associations, it was only natural that the ESP and the DVC would support their development. Rome's influence in the establishment of denominational unions in Quebec can be traced back to the shoemaker's strike in 1900, when Msgr. Bégin directly quoted *Rerum Novarum* in his statement that workers had the right to unionize

¹⁸⁸ In the beginning of the twentieth century there were a number of situations where Catholics found themselves in too small numbers to be able to exert a strong influence in national union movements. An important example was that of Germany. Because protestantism prevailed as the most popular religion amongst German workers, German Catholics discussed the possibility of creating Christian unions, where both Catholics and Protestants would join forces against socialist unions. After studying the case, Pius X permitted such mixed unions in the encyclical *Singulari Quadam* in 1912. While the encyclical imposed conditions for mixed unions to be adopted, it represented a first step towards the collaboration of Catholic unions with other movements. For more: Marshall Dill Jr: "The Christian Trades Union Movement in Germany Before World War I", in *Review of Social Economy*, 1953, Vol.11(1).

¹⁸⁹ *Quadragesimo Anno*, sec. 35.

so long as they followed the directives of the Church.¹⁹⁰ Similarly, Alceu Lima also cited the encyclicals in 1932 to explain the DVC's effort to develop a network of Catholic unions in Brazil:

The directives of the Holy Priest Pius XI, brought to us by the memorable *Quadragesimo Anno*, which completed the teachings of Leo XIII in *Rerum Novarum*, recommend that Catholics do not abstain from the modern task of bringing the working classes, victims of economic liberalism, into a more equitable participation in the political and economic matters of our Nation.¹⁹¹

Another reason that let the ESP and DVC to pursue the development of denominational unions was to contain the growth of union movements that carried ideologies condemned by the Church. Brazilian anarchists, while small in number, had been able to incite a number of strikes during the Republic, including a general strike in 1917 which affected most Brazilian state capitals.¹⁹² As for Quebec, nationalist members of the Catholic Church were suspicious of the increase in activity of international labour federations, notably in the city of Montreal.¹⁹³ Given the increasing presence of the groups, more and more Catholics in Brazil and Quebec called for Catholic action in the working class movement.

¹⁹⁰ For more information on the shoemakers strike and the beginnings of the Catholic union movement, refer to Jean Hamelin, Nicole Gagnon, and Nive Voisine. *Histoire du catholicisme québécois: le XXe siècle*. Tome 1 Vol 3 (Montréal: Boréal Express 1984), 215-216.

¹⁹¹ "As directrizes de acção que o Santo Padre Pio XI nos traça em sua memoravel Quadragesimo Anno, com que completou os ensinamentos de Leão XIII, na *Rerum Novarum*, não são de molde a aconselhar aos catholicos a abstenção nessa tarefa consideravel do mundo moderno de trazer as classes trabalhadoras, victimas do liberalismo economico a uma participação mais justa na distribuição racional da economia e nas esferas da vida politica nacional." "Mais um Anno de trabalho", *A Ordem*, 328.

¹⁹² According to historian Robert J. Alexander, "Until the foundation of the communist party of Brazil in March 1922 (...), the leadership of the organized labour movement was principally in the hands of libertarians (anarchists and anarchosyndicalists)." His statement is supported by Angela de Castro Gomes, who argues that given the leadership of anarchists in the early Brazilian union movement, the movement played an important role in the development of a Brazilian working class identity. For more: Rober J. Alexander: "A History of Organized Labour in Brazil and Angela de Castro Gomes, "A Invenção do Trabalhismo."

¹⁹³ Jacques Rouillard estimates that by 1931 there were 55,000 workers connected to international unions in Québec, of which 75% were concentrated in Montreal. Rouillard also states that such estimates means that in the same year there were twice the number of French speaking workers connected with international unions than with Catholic unions in Quebec. For more: Jacques Rouillard, *Le Syndicalisme Québécois*, 40-44.

Despite both the ESP and the DVC acknowledging the importance of Catholic working associations, the Catholic labour movements of Brazil and Quebec developed very differently. The discrepancies between the Catholic union movement in Brazil and Quebec also influenced the different roles that the DVC and the ESP gave to unions in their corporatist models. One of the leading factors that explain such discrepancies is the different economic and social contexts of these societies, most notably their divergent levels of industrialization.

In the early twentieth century, the social effects of industrialization were already noticeable in Quebec and by 1930, the province was mostly urbanized. As industries played an increasingly important role in Quebec's economy, the relevance of the union movement also grew, ultimately turning working class movements into an influential social force in French Canadian society. Jacques Rouillard demonstrates that it was by being forced to address the conflict between unionized workers and industry bosses that the French Canadian clergy sought the Catholic social doctrine as an answer to the social question. Rouillard states that:

Alors qu'en Europe l'Église révisé sa perception traditionnelle des problèmes sociaux, les autorités religieuses québécoises, malgré l'encyclique *Rerum Novarum* de 1891, s'en remettent encore à l'esprit de justice et de charité des "classes supérieures" [...] Il n'est donc pas surprenant de voir, en 1901, l'archevêque de Montréal, Mgr Bruchési, recommander à ses curés d'aborder la question du travail sous l'angle des devoirs des serviteurs envers leur maître. [...] Au début du 20^e siècle cependant, les évêques de Montréal et de Québec s'intéressent de plus près au syndicalisme à la suite de grèves importantes déclenchées dans ces villes.¹⁹⁴

Thus, the adoption of a Catholic union movement in Quebec can be explained by the increasing impact of unions in the province combined with the emerging

¹⁹⁴ Jacques Rouillard, *Histoire du syndicalisme au Québécois: des origines à nos jours*. (Montréal: Boréal 1989), 94.

challenges brought about by an industrialized economy. Conversely, when the DVC proposed Catholic unions as a solution to the social question in Brazil, industrial problems were not yet a widespread reality. Industrialization in 1930s Brazil was limited and concentrated in the southeast states of Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo. The lack of interest in expanding industrial production was the result of the economic policies pursued by the First Republic, whose primary focus was to develop the country through an agrarian-exporter economy.¹⁹⁵ At this time, Brazilian politics were dominated by the coffee plantation elites, and the social question was largely neglected. A famous phrase attributed to the last Republican president, Washington Luis, encapsulates how unions were treated in the Old Republic. He characterized the social question not as a problem to be solved by politics, but by law enforcement, suggesting that the standard answer of the State towards strikes ought to be the violent repression.¹⁹⁶

Data from the 1940 national census reveals that 68.7% of the population in Brazil lived in rural areas. Even in the most industrialized regions, the urban population did not surpass 40%.¹⁹⁷ Brazilian union movements faced difficulties expanding due to Brazil's lack of industries. Historian Angela de Castro demonstrates that despite the policies implemented by Vargas' administration to encourage the growth of state-unions, they progressed at a much slower rate than anticipated.¹⁹⁸ Governmental

¹⁹⁵ Kenneth Paul Erickson, *The Brazilian corporative state and working-class politics*. (Berkeley: University of California Press 1977), 12-13.

¹⁹⁶ For more information on the subject of the Social Question in Brazilian Old Republic, please refer to Monica Santos Barison, "Caso de polícia: Reflexões sobre a Questão Social e a Primeira República", *Cadernos UniFOA*, Ed. 22 (Aug 2013), 43.

¹⁹⁷ Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística, "Tendências demográficas: Uma Análise da População com Base nos Resultados dos Censos Demográficos 1940 e 2000", *IBGE* (Rio de Janeiro 2007).

¹⁹⁸ Angela Maria de Castro Gomes. *A invenção do trabalhismo*. (Rio de Janeiro: FGV Editora 2005), 330-340.

surveys between 1936 and 1937 show that only 147,657 unionized workers existed in all of Brazil, with the vast majority being associations of artisanal workers.¹⁹⁹ By 1941, while roughly 1 person out of every 21 was unionized in Quebec, in Brazil the rate was approximately 1 unionized worker for every 273 people.²⁰⁰

Despite these low figures, the directives of the papal encyclicals dissuaded the Brazilian Catholic Action from disregarding Catholic unions altogether. Their initial approach to the movement was similar to that of the French Canadians, arguing that the development of Catholic unions was an important step towards building a corporative society. That was the view expressed by Alceu Lima in 1932. The leader of the DVC argued that following the directives from Rome, the organization of confederation of Catholic unions was “one of the most important objectives of our agenda.”:

The directives of the Holy Priest Pius XI in his memorable *Quadragesimo Anno*, which complemented the teachings of Leo XIII’s *Rerum Novarum*, advise Catholics to not abstain from this important role of the modern world. We must bring the working classes, the victims of economic liberalism, to a more just participation in the national distribution of national economy and to a larger participation in the national political life.²⁰¹

However, the DVC’s intention to develop a network of denominational unions can first be noted in *A Ordem* a year earlier, when analyzing its reaction towards the Vargas’ first attempt to organize Brazilian unions. Referencing the union law put forth by Minister Lindolfo Collor, Alceu Lima stated in 1931 that while he did not argue against the regulation of unions by the State, he vehemently opposed the clause that

¹⁹⁹ *ibid*, 332-333.

²⁰⁰ Jacques Rouillard. *Le syndicalisme québécois: deux siècles d'histoire*. (Montréal: Boréal 2004), 93.

²⁰¹ “Consideramos essa iniciativa do Centro D. Vital, como um dos pontos capitais do nosso programma.[...] As directrizes de acção que o Santo Padre Pio XI nos traça em sua memoravel “Quadragesimo Anno”, com que completou os ensinamentos de Leão XIII, na “Rerum Novarum”, não são molde a aconselhar aos catholicos a abstenção nessa tarefa consideravel, do mundo moderno, de trazer as classes trabalhadoras, victimas do liberalismo economico, a uma participação mais justa na distribuição racional da economia e nas esferas da vida politica nacional.” Mais um Anno de trabalho, *A Ordem*, n.33, 328

forbade Catholic unions to be created.²⁰² Basing his arguments on *Rerum Novarum*, Lima defended freedom of association and argued that the enforcement of lay unions was a *de facto* ban on the rights of Catholics to unionize:

Our union's legislation allowed the secularist movement to introduce a tool that denies the right of association to Christian workers and patrons. By forbidding the core of class organizations from engaging in all manifestations of a religious character, our labor legislation has brought to us the hateful ideology of union monism, which aims to congregate all economic powers in the hands of the secular State. (...) The State cannot impose a religion, but it also cannot impose secularism. Compulsory atheism is as hateful in the schools as it is in the unions.²⁰³

In order to proceed with the development of a network of Catholic unions in Brazil, the DVC founded the National Confederation of Catholic Workers in 1932 as a movement within the Brazilian Catholic Coalition. In an editorial in *A Ordem* written that same year, their objective was outlined as “to promote the corporative organization of all Brazilian Catholic workers, so that in the future they may be an effective power in the new political organizations that will emerge.”²⁰⁴ However, the slow growth of this confederation is exemplary of the limitations that Catholic unions had to face in Brazil. The confederation began with only two small organizations, and even though the Catholic Electoral League was able to remove the prohibition on Catholic unions, the movement was still unable to expand. In evaluating the different branches of the Catholic Action in 1937, Alceu Lima stated that the confederation existed “only on

²⁰² “Monismo Sindicalista” *A Ordem*, 323.

²⁰³ “E entretanto, a nossa ‘lei de sindicalisação’, deixou que o sectarismo de um fanático introduzisse em seu texto um dispositivo que vem negar o direito de associação aos operários e patrões católicos. Proibindo no seio das associações de classe as manifestações de carácter religioso, veio a nossa incipiente legislação do Trabalho crear entre nós o principio odioso do monismo sindicalista, com o fito de congregar toas as forças economicas nas mãos do Estado leigo. (...) Se o Estado não pôde impor uma religião, também não pôde impor uma irreligião. O ateismo compulsorio é tão odioso nas escolas como nos sindicatos.” *ibid*, 324-325.

²⁰⁴ “(...) promovemos essa organização corporativa de todos os trabalhadores catholicos do Brasil, afim de pesarem amanhã como força eficiente nas novas modalidades politicas que se estão preparando.” *Mais um ano de trabalho*, 328.

paper” and that “not much had been done to congregate the Catholic workers in Brazil.”²⁰⁵ Therefore, while the DVC had initially wished to create a network of Catholic unions, the minimal reach of the Catholic Action combined with the underdevelopment of unions in the country did not allow the movement to thrive.

In contrast, Catholic unions became a considerable force in the Quebecois working class movement, peaking at 1/3 of the working associations of the province in 1940.²⁰⁶ Part of their success is attributed to the fact that the tradition of French Canadian Catholic unions dated back to 1900.²⁰⁷ Moreover, throughout the first decades of the twentieth century, the French Canadian clergy was able to create a close relationship with the working class, not only through the creation of the Confédération des Travailleurs Catholiques du Canada (CTCC) in 1921, but also through study circles and the *retraites fermées* directed to union leaders.²⁰⁸ These early initiatives by French Canadian Catholics allowed for the message of the Catholic social doctrine to penetrate the working class movement more efficiently than in Brazil.

However, it is important to take note of the social and economic conditions that ultimately allowed for the significant success of religious union movements in Quebec. The industrial realities of the province meant that the Catholic social doctrine and its answers towards the social question were relevant to the problems faced by an increasing number of French Canadians. Conversely, the lack of an industrial context in Brazil meant that the message offered by the Catholic Church did not correspond to the

²⁰⁵ Tristão de Athaide, “Coligação Catholica Brasileira”, *A Ordem* n.58 (Jan 1937), 349-350.

²⁰⁶ Roulliard, *Le Syndicalisme Québécois*, 108.

²⁰⁷ *ibid*, 49-60.

²⁰⁸ Both the *cercles d'études* and the *retraites fermées* were initiatives of the clergy to educate union leaders in the social doctrine. It was organized by both the Oblates order, focused on the poor, and by the Jesuits, more focused on the elites. Joseph-Papin Archambault was a notable defender of the work of the *retraites fermées*. For more: Gagnon et al., *Histoire du Catholicisme Québécois*, 223-227.

country's socio-economic realities, severely limiting the possibilities for the growth of denominational unions in the country.

The differing degree of success that Catholic unions achieved in Brazil and in Quebec explains the distinct roles that the DVC and the ESP ultimately accorded to unions in developing their corporatist thought. While an expanding movement of unions across Quebec allowed the ESP to base their corporatist system in professional associations, the lackluster results of the same movements in Brazil forced the DVC to pursue different tactics. In comparing the roles that Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics gave to unions in their corporatist model, the main source of contention between their arguments is whether or not unions could represent society as a whole.

Esdras Minville²⁰⁹, who wrote the most comprehensible article detailing the corporatist institutions defended by the ESP, explained in 1936 that the corporative chamber in Quebec ought to have complete authority over the social and economic aspects of society with the legitimacy to independently decide on these matters without the interference of the State:

L'office national des forces productives serait indépendant de la politique. de l'État relèveraient les questions administratives, judiciaires, etc; qu'il est seul en position de régler. Mais tout ce qui touche à la vie économique et sociale serait de la compétence de l'Office, lequel verrait à dicter à la politique les solutions les mieux appropriées.²¹⁰

In order to justify a powerful and independent corporative chamber, it was fundamental to the ESP's corporatism that unions became representative of the entire

²⁰⁹ Esdras Minville was the most important corporatist in twentieth century Quebec. He was a professor at the École des Hautes Études Commerciales, and the high quality of the works he produced granted him the head chair of the Montreal Chamber of Commerce in 1947. Minville also actively participated in Lionel Groulx's journal *L'Action Française*, and was the director of the journal *L'Action Nationale*, of which Father Archambault was also a member.

²¹⁰ Esdras Minville, *Comment établir l'Organisation corporative au Canada*, brochure n. 272 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1936) 25.

population. For this reason, in the same article, Esdras Minville stated that the first step towards the establishment of a corporative society in Quebec was the “groupement de la masse entière de la population en associations professionnelles du type corporatif.”²¹¹ Furthermore, he argued that once established, the corporations would need to properly exert this authority over the entire professional sector, even over those who did not directly participate in unions. According to Minville, “l’autorité des syndicats professionnels s’étendrait à toute la profession d’un bout à l’autre de la province, soit directement par la présence dans les syndicats de toutes les intéressées, soit indirectement par le jeu des contrats collectifs”.²¹²

On the other hand, while the authors of *A Ordem* acknowledged that the corporations represented important sectors of society, the fact that union movements only reached a fraction of the Brazilian population lead their authors to argue that the corporative chamber could not represent all of the nation’s interests. This was the argument presented by Romeu Rodrigues Silva²¹³ in 1940. The author recognizes the importance of the corporations, stating they “represent the group of interests towards a common end. [The corporation] achieves such objective through collaboration, freedom, private initiative and responsibility.”²¹⁴ However, the author disagrees that the corporations could be representatives of the Brazilian society stating that only “the

²¹¹ *ibid*, 21.

²¹² *ibid*, 22.

²¹³ Romeu Rodrigues Silva was a Catholic intellectual who was appointed in 1938 to take part in Rio de Janeiro’s education ministry.

²¹⁴ “A corporação, isto é, grupo de interesses em torno de um fim, de um bem comum a todos, e que é o princípio da sua colaboração. Instituição, a corporação, porque, para atingir êste fim, apela para a liberdade, para a iniciativa, para a responsabilidade (...)” Romeu Rodriguez Silva, “O Problema Social no Brasil Contemporaneo” *A Ordem*, n. 109 (Nov 1940), 403.

State is the interpreter and manager of all the groups within the national community.”²¹⁵

According to Silva, that was the case due to the fact that “the institutionally powerful State is the political formula that is most coherent with our traditions and our national reality.”²¹⁶

Two years earlier, Luis Augusto Monteiro Rego²¹⁷ presented a similar argument. Because corporations could not achieve national representation, the author argued that Brazil’s corporative chamber, contrary to that of Quebec, could not have complete power over social and economic aspects. In order to guarantee that the common good of the entire nation was considered, and not just of the productive sectors, state intervention was necessary:

The Corporation has a partial social responsibility. Its actions are strictly technical and professional, exclusively related to national production. [...] If the corporative role is exclusively professional, it is necessary to affirm that corporatism in Brazil does not have the role of coordinating all of the economy, but only part of it. [...] In Brazil, the complete perception of social problems is a responsibility that belongs exclusively to the political power. The interests of national production are not the only ones in our complex social structure, so corporative actions do not have unrestricted power. State intervention is necessary to judge the corporative decisions, integrating and adapting them to the larger societal interests.²¹⁸

²¹⁵ “O Estado é o intérprete e o coordenador de todos os centros de vida da comunidade nacional em vista do bem coletivo, pois para todo país (...), há um bem comum.” *ibid*, 406.

²¹⁶ *ibid*, 407.

²¹⁷ Luiz Augusto do Rego Monteiro was a Catholic intellectual who worked in the Ministry of Labour under the direction of Minister Waldemar Falcão. Defender of the policies of the Catholic Action, he was one of the responsables for incorporating the Catholic Circles as part of Vargas’s policy towards workers.

²¹⁸ “Por sua vez a corporação tem uma função social parcial. A sua atividade é estritamente técnica e profissional e ligada sómente á produção nacional. (...) Si a função corporativa é exclusivamente profissional e logicamente integrada no mecanismo da produção, é necessário refletir que o corporativismo não tem no Brasil o papel ordenador do rito da economia, pois que apenas regulariza uma parcela da ordem económica. (...) A visão total dos problemas sociais, muito rigorosamente, cabe no Brasil ao poder político, sendo este de origem democrática. (...) Como os interesses da produção não são os únicos na complexidade da estrutura social, não será a atividade corporativa uma função final e sem restrições, com poderes soberanos. Intervém o Estado para valorizar o mérito das decisões corporativas, integrando-as ou mesmo subordinando-as aos maiores e totais interesses da sociedade” Monteiro, *Em defesa do direito de Associação*, 450-456.

The different perspectives that the DVC and the ESP had on the amount of authority that corporations ought to have were also reflected on the characteristics of the working class movements they supported. A powerful and independent corporative chamber required the French Canadian Catholic Church to exert direct influence over the union movement. As stated by Father Archambault in 1937, the independence of the French Canadian corporations would only have the desired effects if unions could avoid the influence of subversive ideologies and embrace instead directives that were based on Catholic morals:

La détermination de la classe ouvrière peut produire des bons ou de mauvais résultats, suivant l'orientation qui lui sera donnée. Le communisme est là, actif, insidieux, soufflant sur les passions et préconisant l'union de tous les ouvriers en un seul groupement qu'il espère arriver à dominer. Heureusement nous avons nos syndicats catholiques. Ils répondent à ce besoin d'association qu'éprouve plus que jamais la classe ouvrière. Ils lui ont obtenu par le passé et peuvent lui obtenir encore des avantages matériels appréciables. Ils garderont à nos ouvriers leur mentalité catholique et les préserveront des théories subversives. (...) Il semble donc qu'une des oeuvres les plus urgentes à l'heure actuelle soit une vigoureuse campagne en faveur de nos Syndicats catholiques.²¹⁹

Over the course of the period analysed in this study, the ESP supported the Confédération de Travailleurs Catholiques du Canada (CTCC), described by Archambault as a “parlement de l'unionisme catholique” where “Ils s'enforcent de régler les conflits et les intérêts du capital et du travail par l'application des principes de la morale, l'observance et la charité.”²²⁰ The objective of this confederation was to increase the presence of Catholic unions in Quebec and directly compete with other union movements that did not comply with the national and spiritual objectives sought by the French Canadian Church.

²¹⁹ *Le syndicalisme National Catholique*, brochure n. 285 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1937). 1.

²²⁰ Joseph-Papin Archambault, *Le syndicalisme catholique au Canada*, brochure n. 267 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1936), 18-19.

The characteristics that the Catholic unions ought to have according to the ESP were described by Archambault in 1936, and were marked by the strong presence of the Catholic Church. According to him, it was required that a union completely embrace the Catholic social doctrine both by declaring its allegiance to the papal encyclicals in its constitution and by admitting almost exclusively Catholic workers.²²¹ Furthermore, similar to the Catholic Action, Archambault argued that “tout syndicat catholique doit avoir un aumônier qui représente l’Église auprès de ses membres”²²², reinforcing the control of the Church over Catholic unions. These characteristics described by Archambault of Catholic unions reflect the need of the French Canadian Catholic Church to directly control the union movement in Quebec.

In contrast, the secondary role that the corporative chamber played in the DVC’s corporatist model meant that direct control of unions by the clergy would have only marginal impact. This allowed the Brazilian Catholic Action to eventually abandon its efforts to create Catholic unions, namely ending the National Confederation of Catholic Workers in 1937. From this date forward, there were no more mentions of Catholic unions movements in *A Ordem*. While the slow growth of the Confederation was one reason that led the Brazilian Catholic Action to abandon the project of establishing a network of Catholic unions in Brazil, the principal explanation for such change in tactics was the emergence of the State as a competitor for the control over the Brazilian unions.

²²¹ Non Catholic workers were also allowed to participate, but in order to maintain a purely Catholic environment, once non Catholics reached a certain number, they would be separated into different sections. For more details on the Catholic union movement: Archambault, *Le syndicalisme catholique au Canada*.

²²² Archambault, *Le syndicalisme catholique au Canada*, 6.

Having the urban working class as its main political support, the corporatist State of Getulio Vargas sought to absorb Brazilian unions within the State by registering them with the Ministry of Labour. While other unions were legally allowed to exist, only those that followed the rules established by the Ministry could receive welfare benefits and participate in the elections of the corporative chamber. As a result of Vargas' policy to spread political participation through the unionization of society, Brazilian Catholics opted to concede the direct leadership of unions to the *Estado Novo*.²²³

As of 1937, the main working class movement supported by the Brazilian Catholic Action was the Labour Circles, with Father Brentano as its leader. These served as a supportive institution working parallel to state unions, and had the objective of importing Catholic values to the working class. Historian Jesse Jane Vieira details how Vargas' administration and the Catholic Church established an alliance based on the union movement. According to Vieira, the Labour Circles were an ideal fit for the new political context as it allowed Catholics to educate the working class in the Catholic social doctrine, while avoiding conflict with the State for the control of unions. As Vieira states: "In the context [of the *Estado Novo*], circulism serves as an alternative for both the Church and the State. The State needed a sacred discourse to legitimize its actions in the working class area while at the same time, creating a discourse of national unity."²²⁴

Catholics of neither the DVC or ESP questioned whether Catholics should or should not develop tools to influence union movements towards the Catholic social

²²³ Gomes: *A Invenção do Trabalhismo*, 232-251.

²²⁴ de Souza, *Círculos operários*, 213.

doctrine. However, the decision as to whether or not unions would have complete authority over social and economic matters seems to have been highly influenced by the distinct levels of industrial development in their respective countries. While the ESP had reason to believe that unions could one day become the main representation of the province, Brazilian Catholics soon found this same objective to be unattainable. Instead, the DVC took advantage of the influence Brazilian Catholics had over political powers to shape the State rather than directly influence the working class.

4. The State

The Church's discussions regarding the social question not only changed the Catholic judgment of unions and working associations but also influenced an ongoing process of re-evaluation of the relationship between the Church and the State. Policies that favoured the secularization of the State had gained momentum in the western world since the French Revolution, forcing Catholics to determine a new position for the Church during society's transformation from the *ancient régime* to the nation state.

However, while this process advanced throughout the nineteenth and the twentieth centuries, the secularization of the State did not follow a linear path and in both Brazil and Quebec, the period between the 1929 crisis and the end of World War II witnessed a reapproximation of the Church and the State. Both the ESP and the DVC argued that the Church had the right – and in some cases the duty – to intervene in politics. Far from limiting these ideas to the intellectual level, the Brazilian Catholic Action sought to exert direct political influence through the creation of the Catholic Electoral League, an initiative which Alceu Lima characterized as the most active branch of the Brazilian Catholic Coalition. Likewise, the ESP issued a document with

political directives called the “Programme de restauration sociale,” which was adopted as the platform of the independent party L’Action Libérale Nationale. Given the above examples, it is hard to argue against the political character of the corporative ideas of both institutions.

However, when it comes to defining the role of the State in corporatism, the opinions of the ESP and DVC diverged considerably. As it has been demonstrated throughout this study, the ESP defended a corporatist model based on independent unions and corporations, whereas the DVC argued that the State was to be a main actor. To better understand their contrasting opinions regarding the role of the State in corporatism, one must first consider the different levels of independence that the institution of the Catholic Church had in these societies.

The amount of resources available to the French Canadian Church and the successful expansion of the Catholic Action to the masses were conditions that allowed for the ESP to believe that the Church could effectively influence the corporatist system with less State intervention. In fact, for the French Canadian Church, assuming state-like responsibilities was not uncommon. Nicole Gagnon and Jean Hamelin’s work demonstrate how the institution traditionally held control over important areas in society like education, healthcare and social services.²²⁵ Furthermore, these historians also show that such control was not dependant on State resources, as the Church’s initiatives in these areas were mostly self-funded. It was only in the twentieth century, when the social question became more openly debated, that the provincial government begin to dedicate funds to social sectors more directly.²²⁶ Nonetheless, rather than

²²⁵ Gagnon et al., *Histoire du catholicisme québécois*.

²²⁶ *ibid*, 265.

proceeding with the secularization of schools and hospitals, Quebec's provincial government increased the presence of the Church in these areas by increasing the funding of church-run initiatives by 1266% between 1901 and 1931.²²⁷

While this funding was certainly welcomed, the core of the Church's institutions remained financially independent from the State. The parish, the base of all Church activities, was economically self-sufficient thanks to a system that included charity, fundraising events, and most importantly the tithe.²²⁸ Therefore, the parish was capable of funding most of the Church projects by itself, including its Comité Paroissial and the basic needs for the branches of the local Catholic Action.²²⁹

The comfortable economic position was also reflected in the manpower available to the French Canadian clergy. Gagnon demonstrates that the ratio of priests to Catholics in Quebec in 1930 was of one priest for every 576 people, considerably surpassing most Catholic European countries like Spain, Italy and Holland.²³⁰ This high ratio was achieved primarily between 1901 and 1930, with notable increases in functions related to Catholic education, the Catholic Action and Catholic unions.²³¹

Conversely, the Brazilian Church entered the twentieth century under very different circumstances. With the end of the monarchy and the forced division of Church and State in 1889, the clergy had lost most of its traditional structure. While the first decades of the twentieth century in Quebec were a period of expansion for the Church, historian Scott Mainwaring describes the same period for the Brazilian clergy

²²⁷ *ibid.*

²²⁸ *ibid.*, 265-269.

²²⁹ *ibid.*, 267.

²³⁰ *ibid.*, 122.

²³¹ *ibid.*

as a time of stagnant restructuring.²³² The meager conditions of the Catholic Church in Brazil at that time were mentioned in a number of testimonies from contemporaries, of which the most important was the pastoral letter by Sebastião Leme in 1916. His writings were well summarized by Mainwaring:

[Dom Sebastião Leme] called attention to the weakness of the institutional Church, the deficiencies of popular religious practices, the shortage of priests, the poor state of religious education, the absence of Catholic intellectuals, the Church's limited political influence, and its poor financial situation.²³³

The diverging contexts of the Church in Brazil and Quebec were a crucial factor that influenced their corporative policies towards supporting or denying the necessity of state intervention. A powerful and independent Church in Quebec led the ESP to assume that the clergy and the Catholic Action alone could effectively carry the responsibility of guiding corporative institutions. That was the argument of Maximilien Caron in 1942, who stated that the only political reformations demanded by the ESP was that the State offered the necessary assistance to allow the corporations to independently govern social matters:

L'État aura le droit et l'obligation de surveiller et d'aider les corporations qui se formeront. Car il gère le bien commun. Il lui appartient d'empêcher que les professions, comme les individus, ne posent des actes qui contrarient l'utilité générale. Il a pour mission d'établir des conditions sociales qui permettent aux hommes et aux groupes dont ils font partie d'atteindre au perfectionnement que requiert leur nature. Mais là s'arrête son rôle.²³⁴

In contrast, the DVC could not rely on a resourceful Church to expand its objectives, and most of the objectives sought out by the Catholic Action required some level of state support. Such condition became particularly evident in the context of Catholic unions, when the DVC, failing to create a relevant confederation of Catholic

²³² Mainwaring, *The Catholic Church and politics in Brazil, 1916-1985*.

²³³ *ibid*, 25.

²³⁴ Caron, *L'organisation corporative au service de la démocratie*, 6.

unions by itself, proceeded to support the Labour Circles and spread the social doctrine to the working class by utilizing the infrastructure of state unions. Under these circumstances, the objectives of the DVC focused more on influencing State institutions than creating their own.

This dependency on the State can also be illustrated in the case of religious education, which was one of the most recurrent themes in *A Ordem*. The authors of the DVC, namely Alceu Lima and Leonel Franca, were adamant in reverting the prohibition of Catholic education which had been imposed by the lay policies of the Old Republic. However, not only did the DVC seek to guarantee the right of Catholics to pursue religious education in private schools, but also in public schools, which were run and funded by the State. That was one of the main arguments raised by Alceu Lima in 1932 with regards to education:

The State shall not halt in any way the development of private education, whether it is elementary, secondary, technical or superior. The State shall limit itself to overseeing them, without establishing an education monopoly. The education administered by the State shall be independent of any religious cult. However, religious education shall be integrated in the agenda and schedule of public school whenever required by more than 20 students of a given faith.²³⁵

It is revealing that the theme of religious education in public schools, which was so recurrent in the articles of the DVC, is barely mentioned by the ESP. Such discrepancy can be explained by the fact that while Brazilian Catholics relied on the State to spread religious education, the French Canadian Church had already established direct control over the French schools in Quebec. Therefore, the tactics

²³⁵ “O Estado não tolherá, de modo algum, o desenvolvimento do ensino particular, quer primario, quer secundario, tecnico ou superior, limitando-se a fiscalisa-lo sem caracter de monopolio, directo ou indirecto. O ensino ministrado pelo Estado será independente de qualquer culto religioso, mas o ensino da religião serpa integrado no programma e no horario das escolas publicas, sempre que o requererem mais de 20 alumnos, ou responsaveis de un determinado credo.” Tristão de Athayde, “Triplíce Decalogo” *A Ordem*, n.33 (Nov 1932), 344.

pursued by the ESP and the DVC with regards to the Catholic Action, Catholic unions and religious education, can be understood as resulting from the independence that their respective Churches enjoyed from the State.

However, while Brazilian Catholic leaders had less resources than their French Canadian counterpart, they were more successful in acquiring political support for their corporatist project. Throughout the political instability that ensued from the 1930 coup in Brazil, many of the emerging political forces sought the support of the Catholic Church in order to legitimize their projects. As argued by Jesse Vieira, the need for legitimacy is crucial in understanding why Brazilian politicians turned away from the secularist ideas of the old republic and gravitated towards defending the cause of the Catholic Church, ultimately leading to the successes of the Catholic Electoral League.²³⁶

As previously discussed, there were limitations imposed by Rome that impeded the Brazilian Catholic Action to directly support political parties. But while the DVC never demanded Catholics vote for a specific party, the Papal directives did not stop the authors of *A Ordem* from suggesting which political forces were “more adaptable” to the Church’s doctrine. In the period that preceded the dictatorship of *Estado Novo*, the articles of *A Ordem* show a clear preference for the Brazilian Integralist Action (BIA), lead by Plínio Salgado.

The ideas proposed by this political movement, which relied on a spiritual revolution and defense of traditional morals, attracted so many Catholics to its ranks that Alceu Lima dedicated two articles in early 1935 to disassociate the BIA from the

²³⁶ Jesse de Souza, *Círculos Operários*, 255-269.

Catholic Action. In order to follow Pius XI's directives that demanded the dissociation between Catholic Action and political forces, Lima stated:

A leading member of the Catholic Action must not take part in the Integralist movement [...]. This not only allows us to concentrate our efforts, but also helps us to maintain political neutrality towards our collaborators, which demands that no member of the Catholic Action should pursue political actions, even if in an anti-partisan movement as Integralism.²³⁷

However, in the same article, the leader of the Brazilian Catholic Action also stated that "if [a Catholic] truly has a political calling, I confess that I see no other political party, apart from Integralism, capable of completely satisfying the political demands of a Catholic conscience that has freed itself from liberal prejudices."²³⁸

Furthermore, the DVC's indirect support of Salgado's party can be seen not only through Lima's recommendations, but also from integralists like Julio Sá who were often allowed to publish articles in *A Ordem*. In November 1935, Julio Sá wrote:

Integralism accepts the interior revolution as a starting point, and for this reason, distinguishes itself from fascism and nazism by being the only christian revolution. (...) Integralism is above all of that as it is the end of pride and vanity. It is the re-christianization of men, the reduction of the individual to its fair proportions and the elevation of the person to the comprehension of its eternal goal. (...) Integralism is the christian social revolution naturally adapted to our national conditions.²³⁹

²³⁷ "Um dirigente da Acção Catholica, onde esta se encontre em via de organização ou já organizada, não deve ingressar no Integralismo. [...] Não só, pois, a necessidade de concentração de esforços, mas, ainda, a de imparcialidade politica, em face da justa liberdade dos seus companheiro, nesse assumpto, exige que os dirigentes da A. C. não façam politica, mesmo em um movimento anti-partidario como o Integralismo." Tristão de Athayde, "Catholicismo e Integralismo III", *A Ordem* n.55 (Feb 1935), 84.

²³⁸ "Se ha realmente vocação politica, confesso que não vejo outro partido que possa, como a Acção Integralista, satisfazer tão completamente as exigências politicas de uma consciencia catholica, que se tenha libertado dos preconceitos liberaes." *ibid*, 83.

²³⁹ "Pois bem, o Integralismo, que toma como ponto de partida para o seu movimento - a revolução interior, constitue actualmente a unica revolução totalmente christã, não se confundindo absolutamente com o fascismo e o nazismo, que são quasi puramente exteriores. (...) O Integralismo está muito acima de tudo isto porque, como já dissemos e repetimos, o seu eixo é a revolução interior, isto é, a morte do orgulho e da vaidade, a rechristianização do homem, a reduccão do individuo ás suas justas proporções e a elevação da pessoa á comprehensão da sua finalidade eterna. (...) O Integralismo é, portanto, o typo de revolução social christã naturalmente adaptada ás nossas condições nacionaes." Julio Sá, "Christianismo e Integralismo", *A Ordem*, n.64 (Nov 1935), 420-421.

However, the Integralist Action was not the only political movement willing to support the Brazilian Catholic directives. Getulio Vargas, who carried a personal friendship with the leader of the Brazilian Catholic Church, Cardinal Dom Sebastião Leme, was also eventually seen as an ally by the DVC. Once Vargas' dictatorship was established and the Integralist Action became illegal, the DVC shifted its support to the *Estado Novo*.

Due to the restriction that prohibited the Catholic Action to directly support a political movement, the DVC never officially supported Vargas. Nonetheless, the connections between the authors of *A Ordem* and the administration of the *Estado Novo* are evident in a number of occasions. Many of Vargas' ministers, such as the labour ministers Agamenon Magalhães and his successor Waldemar Falcão had worked with the DVC in the past and continued to do so after 1937.²⁴⁰ Another notable example was that of the minister of Education Gustavo Capanema, who had a personal friendship with Alceu Lima. By drawing on these influences, the DVC was able to achieve many of its objectives with the help of the *Estado Novo*, notably the creation of the Catholic University in the Capital, the appointment of members of the DVC to important education roles (including Sobral Pinto, Tasso de Silveira, Hamilton Nogueira, San Tiago Dantas and Everado Backheuser), and political support of the Ministry of Labour for the Catholic Circles of Father Brentano.²⁴¹

Resulting of the closer relations between Vargas and the Catholic Church, as of 1937, *A Ordem* abandoned its critic view of Brazilian politics and mostly analysed the

²⁴⁰ Agamenon Magalhães had been a close friend of Jackson de Figueiredo and appointed members of the DVC's branch of Pernambuco to take part in his government once he was appointed as governor of that state. Waldemar Falcão had been a congressman tied to the Catholic Electoral League in the Constitutional assembly of 1934

²⁴¹ Guilherme Arduini, *Os Soldados de Roma Contra Moscou*, 69-70.

political institutions of *Estado Novo* through a positive scope. Such change is particularly noticeable in the case of Brazilian union policies. As previously demonstrated, Alceu Lima had been a fierce critic of the monopoly of unions by the State in the early 1930s, and the defense of a plural union system had been one of the core points of the Catholic Electoral League in 1934. However, in 1938, when analysing the union system of the *Estado Novo*, which had clear authoritarian characteristics, Luis Augusto Monteiro concluded that “without a doubt, the Brazilian regime is democratic, and not totalitarian. It is pluritarian and not unitarian.”²⁴²

Besides supporting the political institutions developed by Vargas, it was also not rare to find from 1937 to 1944 messages of general support to the President, as demonstrated by Jaime de Barros Camara’s Pastoral letter published in *A Ordem* in 1943:

We have the honor to salute Getulio Vargas, who possesses the highest level of public power in our beloved country. In the great tempest that shakes our world, the overwhelming waves have not been able to spread anarchy in Brazil. While much of this fact we own to the benevolence of God, it is only fair that we recognize the grace He has given us by allowing [Vargas] to govern our country congregating all of the Nation’s powers.²⁴³

While the DVC was able to rely on the fact that powerful politicians were willing to adopt its ideas, the ESP had difficulty finding political forces that would support their corporatist project. In the Canadian bipartisan political tradition, neither

²⁴² “Não resta divida que o regime brasileiro é democratico e não totalitário, pluralitario e não unitário.” Monteiro, *Em defesa do direito de Associação*, 451.

²⁴³ “À Magistratura Suprema em nossa querida pátria, o Exmo. Sr. Dr. Getulio Vargas, detentor maximo do poder público, temos honra em apresentar agora as saudações mais atenciosas. Nesta gigantesca procela que sacode o mundo, as ondas avassaladoras da desordem não teem conseguido fazer sossobrar no vórtice caótico da anarquia este nosso estremecido Brasil. Se ha, por isso, razões sobejas de agradecermos a Deus tão assinalada mercê, justo é reconhecamos ser distinto favor do céu termos no Governo do País o “vir potens”, que congrega em torno de sua pessoa as forças viva da nação.” Dom Jaime de Barros Camara, “Carta Pastoral do Exmo. e Revmo. Snr. Dom Jaime de Barros Camara, ao tomar posse da Séde Metropolitana do Rio de Janeiro”, *A Ordem* n.132 (Oct-Nov 1943), 421.

Liberals nor Conservatives were particularly interested on rearranging the political system, and even less so to implement reforms that weakened the State. It was only with the emergence of a third party in Quebec, L'Action Libérale Nationale lead by Paul Gouin, that corporatism won some political support through the party's use of the ESP's publication, the "Programme de restauration sociale," as its political platform.

While the political party was able to quickly grow in popularity, its rapid rise is not explained by the general support of a corporative system. Instead, as historian Patricia Dirks demonstrates, the success of L'Action Libérales resulted from a general desire for reform and the frustration born out of the Liberal government's corruption scandals, most notably those connected to Premier Louis-Alexandre Taschereau.²⁴⁴ With the common objective of ending a 39-year Liberal rule in the province, the ALN and the Conservative party formed the Union Nationale, with the leader of the Conservative party Maurice Duplessis emerging as the Premier of Quebec in 1936.

Despite winning the provincial elections thanks to the strong support of the religious right, Premier Maurice Duplessis showed little interest in developing the ESP's corporatist organization. Duplessis' alliance with the Church was mainly connected to increasing Catholic authority over their existing initiatives, such as schools and hospitals, than to the establishment of an independent corporative chamber.²⁴⁵ Although French Canadian politicians empowered the Church, they did not do so in the manner desired by the ESP. While the Conservative party was in need of

²⁴⁴ Patricia G. Dirks, *The failure of l'Action libérale nationale*. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press 1991).

²⁴⁵ Despite not submitting his government to the corporatist ideas of the Catholic Church, Maurice Duplessis declared its allegiance to Catholicism in a number of occasions. For more information: Gagnon et al., *Histoire du Catholicisme Québécois*, 442-451.

the Catholic vote, unlike Brazil, it did not require the legitimization for a new political system.

5. Authoritarian and Democratic Rule

Another striking contrast between the state models defended by the ESP and the DVC was the opposing stances they took in evaluating democracy. Both institutions agreed that the liberal state had inherent flaws. However only the DVC utilized such criticisms to favor authoritarian institutions. The ESP, on the other hand, criticized the individualistic manner in which society was organized, but argued that their reforms could be achieved without the need of a dictatorship, thereby defending their “democratic” model.²⁴⁶

It becomes clear in the publications of the ESP that one of the reasons that led the institution away from an authoritarian form of corporatism was the fact that their authors did not desire an empowerment of the State, especially at the federal level. A suspicion towards any measure that empowered the federal government was one of the motives presented by Maximilien Carron in 1942 in his argument against the possibility of establishing a *corporatisme d'état* in Canada:

[Le corporatisme d'État] heurterait notre régime constitutionnel, il porte en lui trop de principes antihumains et antichrétiens, pour que nous songions un instant l'instaurer dans notre pays. Au surplus, il ne pourrait exister que sur le plan fédéral. Or, nous, de la province de Québec, nous avons trop de raisons de nous méfier de tout système politique ou social à tendances centralisatrices.”²⁴⁷

Caron was not the only one to present arguments against the interference of Ottawa in provincial matters. Louis de Léry also argued in 1944 that the interference of

²⁴⁶ Arguments could be raised that Canada was not under a democratic rule in the 1930s. However, the word “Democratie” is often used by the École in its publications to describe its own political system.

²⁴⁷ Caron, *L'Organisation Corporative au Service de la Démocratie*, 4.

the federal government was to be avoided at all costs, even if it came in the form of financial help:

Que l'argent consacré à l'éducation vienne du fédéral, du provincial ou du municipal, c'est le même contribuable qui débourse. Mais dans le premier cas, les provinces auront perdu en tout ou en partie, leur autonomie en matière d'éducation. [...] Même dans le cas extrême où une province semblerait incapable de subvenir aux nécessités de l'éducation, l'assistance permanente et directe à l'instruction dans cette province provoquerait des jalousies et une surenchère électorale. [...] Des subsides sans contrôle, c'est trop beau pour être vrai.²⁴⁸

On the other hand, as the political influence that the Catholics of the DVC could exert in the national government grew, so did their arguments in favour of authoritarianism. Between 1931 and 1936, when it was still unclear which political force would emerge victorious from the 1930 coup, the DVC leaned towards supporting liberal policies such as freedom of unionization and freedom of education. Such liberal directives were a result of the political uncertainty of the early 1930s, which guided the efforts of the DVC towards avoiding the return to the secular policies of the first Republic.

According Alceu Lima's directions in December 1930, avoiding the return of secular policies was the main objective that Brazilian Catholics should focus on, even in the case of the return of Republican institutions:

We have a serious duty to perform in this time of uncertain political transition. We must redirect the currents of politics towards social christianism. We must work so that the Republican apostasy, which is to blame for our current situation, comes to an end, allowing for the State to return to the true roots of our nationality. [...] We have two paths ahead of us: We either succeed in placing the Republic on its true path, which is that of the Christian social order [...] Or we fail in our objectives and have the Republic to continue with its

²⁴⁸ R. P. Louis C. de Léry, *Écoles nationales*, brochure n.368 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1944), 19-28.

apostasy, irradiating secularism, with divorce destroying or families and atheism corrupting our costumes [...].²⁴⁹

In 1932, Alceu Lima reinforced the same argument, stating that his only concern was to avoid the return of political secularism as an official State policy, regardless of what type of government Brazil would adopt after the coup:

We give no importance to having a Constitution. It is only important to us the contents of a possible Constitution. It does not matter which politicians will reorganize our Nation. What is really important is to know whether the Nation will continue to be divorced from the State, or if it will once again be able to exert the important role it should. It is important to maintain the Nation Catholic.²⁵⁰

These directives given by the leader of the DVC explain why the institution initially supported decentralized policies. The members of the Catholic Action sought to guarantee that Catholics could exert their “rights”, notably with regards to Catholic unions and education, even if the State returned to its Republican form.

However, the success of the Catholic Electoral League in 1934 was a clear indicator to the Brazilian Catholic Action that they were able to exert great influence over politics, and that political allies of the Church could effectively help in the achievement of their objectives. As a result, the authoritarian arguments in *A Ordem*

²⁴⁹ “Temos um grave dever a cumprir nesta hora de incerteza e transição politica. Temos o dever de encaminhar as aguas da subversão politica para o leito do christianisme social. Temos o dever de trabalhar para que a apostasia republicana de quarenta annos, que é até hoje a maior culpada de tudo por que estamos passando, venha finalmente a terminar de modo a permittir que o Estado e os seus governantes voltem às verdadeiras raizes da nossa nacionalidade. [...] Pois se abrem dois caminhos em nossa frente: Ou conseguimos repor a Republica no caminho da ordem social christã, que é o seu caminho natural e unico verdadeiramente salvador [...]. Ou não conseguimos realizar os nossos ideais, veremos a Republica perseverar na sua apostasia, o laicismo irradiante, o divorcio dissolvendo a familia, o atheismo corrompendo os costumes [...]” Tristão de Athayde, “Indicações”, *A Ordem* n.10 (Dec 1930), 193-197.

²⁵⁰ “Não nos interessa a Constituição. Interessa-nos que Constituição. Não nos interessa saber se são os politicos profissionaes ou os politicos amadores (...) que estão em vias de reorganizar a Nação. O que nos interessa é manter catholica a Nação, desenvolver, purificar, intensificar a consciencia desse catholicismo, tatas vezes deturpado por elementos estranhos, afim de que possa com efficiencia trazer o seu espirito á formação do Estado.” (No Author), “Dever Politico dos Catholicos”, *A Ordem* n.25 (Mar 1932), 161.

became more recurrent as their political allies became more powerful. By 1937, when Vargas gained dictatorial powers, *A Ordem* shifted its libertarian arguments and became a source of open criticism towards democracy. That was done through articles such as that of Bento Munhoz da Rocha Neto²⁵¹, published in January 1940.

[In a democracy] what we really see is the domination of the minority over the majority. The masses are unable to govern themselves. [...] the democratic view of reality is relative for it all depends on the acceptance of the majority. As explained by Berdiaeff, democracy is the extreme relativism and the denial of everything that is absolute. It does not carry an immutable point of reference. [...] The belief that the majority is always right is a result of Rousseau's optimism [...] This conclusion is close to the absurd, as it denies the existence of universal values such as conscience and justice.²⁵²

In the same year, the opening article of the March edition of *A Ordem* was a translation of a text of the French economist Maurice Byé, in which the author argues that authoritarianism is not a synonym for totalitarianism. By doing so, Byé separates the catholic authoritarian governments, such as that of Salazar (and implicitly that of Vargas), from the condemned totalitarianisms of Hitler and Mussolini:

A frequent and grave error is to confuse totalitarianism and authoritarianism. [...] No one would deny the omnipotence of the State in Portugal. That is a simple political fact. However, none of us would defend a State which carried a source of morality and justice without a superior justice that guides its rules and decisions. It is not contradictory for Salazar to define himself as anti-parliamentarist, anti-democratic, anti-liberal, or in other words authoritarian, and violently refuse to be totalitarian. To define someone as authoritarian is to make mention of its form of government. [...] The Church may prosper in the most diverse forms of government. However, to qualify as totalitarian touches the very notion of State. [...] The totalitarian State not only organizes its community, but confuses itself with the community through the concept of Nation, Race or Class.²⁵³

²⁵¹ At the time of the publication of this article, Bento Munhoz da Rocha Neto was the director of the Instituto Histórico, Geográfico e Etnográfico of the State of Paraná, and a professor at Paraná Federal University. After 1945, Bento Munhoz da Rocha Neto had a long political career as Minister of Agriculture and as a federal deputy.

²⁵² Bento Munhoz da Rocha Neto. "Divagações sobre a democracia", *A Ordem* n.99 (Jan 1940), p73-90.

²⁵³ "Catolicismo e Totalitarismo... Sem dúvida não é indispensável, aqui, definir o Catolicismo, mas o sentido de Totalitarismo está sujeito a confusão. Anted de tudo ha um erro particularmente frequente e grave: é o que consiste em confundir Totalitarismo e Autoritarismo. [...] Em Portugal, nenhum de nós

The different historical experiences faced by the Catholic Church in Brazil and in Quebec with regards to liberal institutions also influenced the DVC and the ESP on supporting or refusing a democratic State. As demonstrated, according to the authors of *A Ordem*, the liberal State was a threat to the rights of the Catholic Church since the policies of the First Republic had often been attached to secular ideals such as the separation of Church and State, the prohibition of religious education in public schools and the exclusion of the clerical service in the military.

Conversely, the ESP viewed the tradition of liberal democracy as a protection to the French Canadian culture and religious rights in Quebec. As presented by Maximilien Caron in 1942, it was not in the interests of the ESP to dismantle the structure that had served as a shield to the rights of the Church in Quebec.

Nous croyons que l'organisation corporative doit s'intégrer dans notre démocratie. Cette suggestion n'a rien de scandaleux. Si nous y regardons de près, nous la trouvons non seulement sage, mais opportune et utile. Quoi qu'on en ait dit, le Canadien, français surtout, est attaché aux institutions politiques qui le régissent depuis cent ans. Ils les considèrent comme la sauvegarde de ses droits, comme le plus efficace moyen de se protéger contre la tyrannie.²⁵⁴

By analysing the opinions of French Canadian and Brazilian Catholics on what would be the optimal state model to accommodate the Catholic social doctrine, it can be concluded that the Catholics in general were willing to accept any type of state, as long as they felt that Catholic institutions would have freedom of action. In Quebec, where

ousaria afirmar a onipotência do Estado em face da massa humana, simples realizações políticas. Nenhum de nós teria a idéia de considerar o Estado como fonte da moral e da justiça sem que os preceitos de uma justiça superior se lhe superponham às decisões e às regras. Nada se opõe, pois, a que um Salazar se afirme: anti-parlamentar, anti-democrático, anti-liberal, em outras palavras, autoritário, e se recuse violentamente a ser totalitário. Dizer autoritário ou não autoritário é, de fato, enunciar qualificativos aplicáveis a tal ou qual forma de governo. A Igreja [...] pode prosperar em Estados sujeitos às formas de governo mais diversas. [...] Dizer totalitário ou não totalitário é, de fato, qualificar a própria noção de Estado. [...] O Estado totalitário não se contenta de enquadrar a comunidade que informa, confunde-se com ela, quer essa comunidade se chame nação, raça ou classe.” Maurice Byé, “Catolicismo e totalitarismo”, *A Ordem*, n.101 (Mar 1940), 189-190.

²⁵⁴ Maximilien Caron, *L'Organisation Corporative au Service de la Démocratie*, 7.

the Church had enough resources to act for itself, the main requirement of the ESP was the protection of the Church's independence. In Brazil, where the Church needed the resources of the State to expand its projects, only a powerful State committed to the cause of the Church would allow for Catholic corporatism to be established.

The adaptive character of Catholic corporatism becomes evident when comparing the institutions supported by the ESP and the DVC. Despite being part of the same universal Catholic corporatist movement, the distinct resources available to the Church and the industrialization level of Brazil and Quebec led the ESP and the DVC to mold the directives of the papal encyclicals to their realities.

While it is clear that the Catholic Church was a major influence in these societies, the manner in which their Corporatist institutions were organized reveals two distinct characteristics of the Church in Brazil and Quebec. The French Canadian Church was a popular institution, which believed that corporatism should be established from the bottom up. The publications of the ESP argued that once the entire population was properly organized in a corporative manner, the State would have no choice but to adapt. The belief that authority should come from civil society led the ESP to focus the spread of corporatist ideas directly to the public via popular institutions such as unions and the Action Catholique Spécialisée. The strategy of relying on popular pressure is made clear by Esdras Minville in 1936:

Pour notre part, nous croyons à la force, non pas à celle qui dresse des barricades et tire du pistolet, mais à celle qu'un peuple conscient de ses droits et de ses intérêts trouve dans sa détermination à ne pas subir des cadres sociaux qui risquent de l'étouffer, mais à imposer, dans un large esprit de justice, les formes d'organisation sociale adaptées à son génie particulier, et les plus propres à assurer son existence et ses progrès. (...) Pour naître viable, s'établir sur des bases définitives, l'institution corporative ne doit pas être imposée d'autorité par un texte de loi ou autrement; elle doit jaillir de la réalité sociale

elle-même, surgir de la masse populaire comme la réalisation d'un désir, le fruit d'une conviction profonde et générale. (...) Il sera donc possible de dicter à nos gouvernants la politique que nous entendons faire prévaloir dans notre province, et, à travers la législation, les règlements auxquels les entrepreneurs étrangers devront se soumettre.²⁵⁵

Contrary to the ESP, the DVC believed that corporatism should be established from the top down, urging Brazilian Catholics to focus their activities on the formation of a Catholic elite. The lack of influence that the Brazilian Catholic Church had on the general population led to articles such as the one by Plinio Corrêa de Oliveira²⁵⁶, arguing that democracy is a lesser form of government:

According to St. Thomas and Leo XIII, while democracy is, in fact, a legitimate form of government, it is inferior to the others. That is not to say that given the correct circumstances, democracy would not be preferable, but it is indeed inferior. (...) Democracy draws its power from the people, and for that reason, it requires that all citizens have not only their own individual and private virtues, but also political virtues. (...) In a Monarchy, it would be sufficient that the Royal authority was Christian. In an aristocracy, it would be enough for the governing classes to be christianized. In a democracy, it would be necessary to christianize the entirety of the Nation. (...) Furthermore, the masses possess of much less ability, culture and firmness than a Monarch or an aristocrat. Therefore, the masses would need a high degree of moral virtues to compensate their intellectual deficiencies.²⁵⁷

²⁵⁵ Minville, *Comment établir l'Organisation corporative au Canada*, 9-13.

²⁵⁶ Plinio Corrêa de Oliveira was the deputy leader of the Catholic Electoral League during its entire existence (1934-1937). Strongly connected to the Catholic ideas of the DVC, Plinio Corrêa de Oliveira was also the founder of a number of Catholic initiatives connected to the Catholic Action, notably the Catholic University Action. After 1945, Plinio would distance himself from the DVC and the Catholic left, but would continue to be an important Catholic leader well into the period of the military dictatorship (1964-89).

²⁵⁷ “Não me litando a esta constatação, afirmo ainda que a democracia, ao sentir de S. Thomaz de Aquino e de escriptores catholicos, que Leão XIII parece approvar, é em si uma forma de governo legitima, mas inferior ás demais. Isto não significa que em circunstancias concretas determinadas a democracia não seja preferivel. Em si, porém, é inferior. (...) A democracia colloca nas mãos do povo o poder publico. Assim, pois, exige de todos os cidadãos, além das virtudes individuaes e privadas, grande somma de virtudes politicas. (...) Em uma monarchia, seria sufficiente que o poder real fosse christão, (...) Em uma aristocracia, bastaria que fossem christianisadas as classes dirigentes. Em uma democracia, é necessaria a christianização de todas as classes. (...) Aliás, as massas teem muito menos perspicacia, cultura e firmeza, do que aristocracias ou monarchias. De sorte que é necessario que ellas tenham um gráo sufficientemente alto de virtudes moraes que compensem a deficiencia das qualidades intelectuaes.” Plinio Corrêa de Oliveira. “A Igreja e a Republica”, *A Ordem* n. 25 (Mar 1932), 187-188.

In addition to the different resources and reach of the Catholic Church in Brazil in Quebec, we must also consider that the different socio-economic contexts in these societies led Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics to focus their efforts in resolving distinct problems. This is particularly evident as we analyse the DVC and the ESP's interpretation of the how communism, liberalism and nationalism influenced their societies.

CHAPTER III: IDEOLOGIES

The Catholic social doctrine was not the only movement to address the changes brought by the industrial revolution. The emergence of social democracy, national socialism and many other original ideologies reflected the need for society to restructure its institutions in order to accommodate new socio-economic contexts. This chapter compares the perceptions of Brazilian and French Catholics regarding the main ideologies which the Catholic Church interacted with: communism, liberalism and nationalism. While the Catholic Church in Rome produced the general guidelines describing how Catholics ought to view these movements, the DVC and ESP also had their own impressions on how these ideologies impacted their realities.

Anti-communism is often regarded as one of the main characteristics of the Catholic social doctrine, which is evidenced by the fact that anti-communist propaganda was a prominent theme in the publications of both the ESP and the DVC. However, out of all the aspects comprising Catholic corporatism, anti-communism was the one that varied the least between Brazil and Quebec. As it will be demonstrated, this is due to the fact that neither Brazil nor Quebec experienced significant communist threats. Because communist movements in these societies were rare, the anti-communist propaganda of the ESP and of the DVC was not directed towards dismantling communist mobilization. Rather, they were meant to increase the fear of communist activity, which would serve as an argument for the instauration of corporatist institutions. Because the ESP and DVC did not adapt anti-communism to their respective realities, this ideology had a minor influence on models of corporatism they adopted.

Conversely, the DVC and ESP's' different interpretations of liberalism were reflected in their proposed corporatist institutions. Chapter I argued that the ESP and the DVC had different understandings of liberal ideology, which reflected in their intellectual choices with regards to European Catholic intellectuals. By comparing the directives of the Catholic Electoral League in Brazil and the *Programme de Restauration Sociale* in Quebec, this section aims to demonstrate how the different perceptions of liberalism led the DVC and the ESP to develop corporatism as a means to achieve distinct goals. This will be illustrated by establishing that while the ESP focused on criticizing the power of Trusts and Anonymous societies, Brazilian Catholics were more preoccupied with the advancement of freemasonry in their country. This indicates that while the ESP aimed to combat the abuses of economic liberalism, Brazilians wished to halt the advances of political secularism.

Lastly, an analysis of the arguments presented by both the ESP and the DVC would be incomplete without mentioning the way in which these institutions adopted nationalism. Catholics in Brazil and in Quebec argued that in practicing their anti-liberal goals, they were performing a patriotic duty. The advancement of liberalism was shown by both the ESP and the DVC as a great problem for their respective nations. Furthermore, it will be demonstrated that both these institutions believed that Catholics had a major role to play in establishing and promoting the national identity of their countries. While the DVC aimed to create a new Brazilian nationality based on Catholicism, the ESP followed the ideas of Lionel Groulx and sought to protect the existing French Canadian identity in order to also protect the survival of the Catholic Church in Canada.

1. Communism

Prior to 1945, anti-communism was a cornerstone of the corporatist movement. The aversion to Marxist theories that is expressed in the papal encyclicals was embraced by the ESP and the DVC with much vigor and anti-communist propaganda was one of the main themes in the publications of both institutions.²⁵⁸

Historian Damião Duque Farias classified the anti-communist messages of the Catholic Church in two categories.²⁵⁹ The first was directed towards an educated elite of readers, and consisted of detailed intellectual discussions on various points of the Marxist philosophy. In the publications of the ESP and of the DVC, such articles demonstrate that Catholics in Brazil and Quebec had a solid understanding of the communist ideology and while the majority of Marxist arguments were explained with the objective of being refuted, this elevated level of discussion even permitted for certain agreements.

It was this type of analysis that led Perillo Gomes to state in *A Ordem* that “Marx was not wrong in foreseeing the end of individualism” and to acknowledge the role that Marxist theories played in raising awareness towards unions.²⁶⁰ Likewise, in one of the ESP’s brochures, Father Arduino d’Appolonia introduces *Das Kapital* stating that “il serait trop long de retracer la courbe historique du marxisme, d’analyser

²⁵⁸ St-Amand demonstrates that in its 4 years of existence, anticommunism was the most recurrent theme of the Journal *l’Ordre Nouveau* of the *École Sociale Populaire*. (St-Amant, *La propagande de l’École sociale populaire en faveur du syndicalisme catholique*, 211). Likewise, the anti communist messages in *A Ordem* were the main theme of a number of studies, such as that of Candido Moreira (Moreira, *Alceu Amoroso Lima: matrizes e posições de um intelectual católico militante em perspectiva histórica*).

²⁵⁹ Damião Duque de Farias. *Em defesa da ordem: aspectos da praxis conservadora católica no meio operário em São Paulo (1930-1945)*. (São Paulo: Hucitec, 1997).

²⁶⁰ “Uma das raras cousas em que se pode dizer que Marx não fracassou foi na previsão de que adviria uma época de colectivismo socialista. Em realidade estamos dentro dessa época. A tal ponto que o syndicalismo não constitue mais uma preocupação de classes. Temos visto o proprio Estado promovendo sua organização.” Perillo Gomes, “Os Precalços da syndicalização”, *A Ordem* n. 41 (Dec 1933), 891.

la part de vérité contenue dans cette critique des abus du capitalisme privée.”²⁶¹ These minor acknowledgements seem to support Gregory Baum’s argument that at its core, the Catholic thought of the twentieth century agreed with elements of the Marxist view of the world, notably by accepting a class-based organization of society, acknowledging the existence of class conflict and recognizing the inevitability of an eventual proletarian revolution if the social question was not properly addressed.²⁶²

However, the vast majority of anti-communist discussion belonged to a second category of publications which left no room to agree with Marxist ideas. This second type not only portrayed communism as an evil doctrine, but did so in a manner that was accessible to the masses by utilizing apocalyptic rhetoric and representing communist countries in a negative light. These messages were amongst the most common kinds of publications in both the ESP and the DVC, and can be illustrated by the article written by Frederico Muckermann in *A Ordem* in 1933.

Bolshevism is the end of freedom, end of the family, end of the european culture, end of christianism. An enormous abomination which men can barely reproduce even in fantasy. (...) It is Lucifer’s struggle against God. (...) The same actions that we believe to be heroism and holy are condemned and persecuted. We are living throughout a night of horrors: the blood of innocent Abel calls out to the skies, while wandering Cain roams away.²⁶³

²⁶¹ Louis Chagnon, *Cahier anticommuniste*, brochures n. 217-218 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1932), 4.

²⁶² Gregory Baum: “The Impact of Marxist Ideas on Christian Theology”, *Laval théologique et philosophique*, Volume 54, n. 3 (Oct 1998), 497-508.

²⁶³ “Bolchevismo quer dizer fim da liberdade, fim da familia, fim da cultura europea, fim do christianismo, uma enormidade abominavel que os homens das nossas regiões mal podem representar na fantasia. (...) Trata-se de Lucifer que combate contra Deus. As mesmas energias que em sentido positivo se chamam heroismo e santidade, aqui se tornam factores da aniquilação em sentido negativo. Estamos em uma noite em que mora o horror: a consciencia cauterisada, em que o sangue do innocente Abel brada aos ceus e Caim errante sem cessar, vagueia para longe.” Frederico Muckermann, “Por que tanta frouxidão no combate ao bolchevismo?”, *A Ordem*, n. 35 (Jan 1933), 10-15.

The ESP also employed the same tactic, as evidenced by its publication of an article written by the American Archbishop Msgr. Fulton Sheen, translated in *l'Ordre Nouveau* in January 1937:

Comme religion, [le communisme] n'est pas une hérésie au sein de la chrétienté, c'est le singe du christianisme, semblable dans tout ce qu'il a d'extérieur, mais différent par son esprit. Lui aussi a une bible, qui est le *Das Kapital* de Karl Marx; il a son péché originel, qui est le capitalisme; il a son attente messianique, qui est la société sans classes et la race sans Dieu; il a son sacerdoce, que est le haut commissariat. Il ressemble au christianisme en toutes choses, sauf une; il est inspiré non par l'esprit du Christ, mais par l'esprit du serpent. C'est le nouvel Israël, le nouvel élu, le corps mystique de l'Antéchrist.²⁶⁴

Given the recurrence of this message, it is undeniable that anti-communism was a vital component of the ESP and DVC's corporatist ideas. Comparing the anti-communist propaganda of these institutions reveals that Catholics in Brazil and Quebec made little effort to adapt anti-communism to their realities. This specific part of the Catholic social doctrine did not differ in these two societies because when studying their domestic communist movements, it becomes apparent that the contexts in Brazil and Quebec were similar, in that neither nation faced a significant communist threat.

The main communist movement in Brazil began with the foundation of the Brazilian Communist Party in 1922. However, despite their growth strategy focusing on infiltrating urban unions, communist working associations in Brazil were scarce.²⁶⁵ Historian Robert J. Alexander shows that in 1929, out of 116,600 unionized workers in Brazil only 3000 were members of communist controlled unions. Furthermore, Alexander argues that Brazilian communists were restrained not only due to fierce persecution by Vargas' regime, but also as a result of the competition that existed with

²⁶⁴ Fulton Sheen, "Le catholicisme en face du communisme", *L'Ordre Nouveau*, 20 Jan 1937.

²⁶⁵ Gomes, *A invenção do trabalhismo*, 214.

other anti-capitalist labour movements. In many instances, communists and anarchists found themselves spending much energy fighting each other for control of the small number of unions that were willing to adopt revolutionary ideas.²⁶⁶

Communist movements in Quebec were even more uncommon. According to historian Jacques Rouillard, at its foundation in 1921, the Quebec branch of the Canadian Communist party was comprised of a mere 120 members, 20 of whom were francophones. Rouillard states that “leur nombre augmente peu jusqu’en 1936; ils sont plus nombreux par la suite à joindre les rangs du parti (2500 approximativement en 1947).”²⁶⁷

Regardless of the fact that between 1931 and 1945 communist movements in Quebec and in Brazil were not a threat, anti-communism continued to be one of the most recurrent themes emerging from the publications of the ESP and the DVC. The importance that these institutions placed on anti-communist propaganda was not solely correlated with the surge of world-wide communist activity. One must also consider the legitimizing potential held by anti-communist messages and that avoiding a communist revolution was one of the most convincing arguments for the establishment of corporatist institutions. This was demonstrated in a number of publications, including Archambault’s 1934 pamphlet:

Des réformes radicales s’imposent donc si nous voulons empêcher le bolchevisme de pénétrer les masses encore saines et de les dresser dans un geste de révolte contre l’ordre social. Ces réformes - vrais remparts qui empêcheront l’erreur marxiste de se répandre chez nous - Pie XI les indique dans [Quadragesimo Anno].²⁶⁸

²⁶⁶ Robert Alexander, *A History of Organized Labor in Brazil*. (Westport, Conn: Praeger, 2003), 33-36.

²⁶⁷ Rouillard, *Histoire du syndicalisme Québécois*, 188-189.

²⁶⁸ *Journées anticommunistes*, brochure n. 251-252 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1934), 10.

Because the menace of communism served as a strong argument for the establishment of corporatism, it was crucial for Catholics in Brazil and Quebec to portray it to their readers as a real threat. To illustrate their arguments, both institutions made extensive use of foreign examples of communist activity, notably in Spain, Mexico and the USSR. By highlighting these international experiences, Catholics in Brazil and Quebec aimed to paint a picture of darkness and destruction over all the countries that were infiltrated by communists. The article published in *A Ordem* by Paulo Sa in 1936 is an example of how Catholics depicted the living conditions in communist Russia.

How does communist Russia treat their youth? According to the Pravda: The number of abandoned children in the official records is of 7 million. (...) And how do these abandoned children live? There are reports of 38 of them living in barrels that have been used to prepare asphalt! Another 10 were found sleeping in a large trash bins. In only one year, 29,527 crimes were registered and committed by abandoned children and 22 of these crimes were murders committed by children that had not yet reached 10 years old! Reports from Russian newspapers state that between 40 and 90% of the abandoned minors are addicted to cocaine.²⁶⁹

This same tactic can also be seen in the ESP's publications, notably in Joseph Ledit's 1936 report depicting the problems faced by those who were forced to live on the "red side" of the Spanish Civil war:

La première chose dont on vous parle à Madrid, c'est des kilos perdus, de la famine, et de ce qu'on mange aujourd'hui. Tout le reste a été éclipsé par cette situation élémentaire. (...). Le grand fait de Madrid est que, sous Négrin, on

²⁶⁹ "Como tratará a Russia comunista a sua juventude? É da viuva de Lenine e foi publicada no Pravda a seguinte afirmação: O numero de creanças abandonadas que constam dos registros officiaes é entre nós de 7 milhões. (...) De que maneira vivem, porem, estes abandonados? A senhora Kalinine esposa do presidente do Comité Central Executivo do partido, conta a visita que fez a um grupo de 38 delles, habitando todos um tambor de preparar asfalto! Um outro grupo de 10 foi encontrado dormindo num recipiente grande de recolher lixo das casas. E num só anno registraram-se na Russia exactamente 29.527 crimes praticados por creanças abandonadas sendo que delles 22 eram assassinatos, cujos auctores precoces não tinham attingido a idade de 10 annos! Não é isto de admirar si é verdade o que escreve o dr. Cholomovitch no jornal official da Russia comunista, quando affirma que dos menores abandonados (e são os 7 milhões da Sra. Lenine) 40 a 90% são viciados na cocaina!" Paulo Sa, "O communismo e os catholicos", *A Ordem* n.71 (Jul 1936), 66.

mourrait de faim, tandis que Franco a apporté du pain, et, avec le pain, les jambons, les pommes de terre, la saucisse, les oeufs et le reste. On m'a souvent répété à Madrid, que si Franco avait tardé encore un mois ou deux, des dizaines de milliers, des centaines de milliers de personnes, peut-être, seraient mortes de faim.²⁷⁰

While these descriptions of conditions in foreign countries were a recurrent form of propaganda, both the ESP and the DVC also emphasized the fact that communism was an international conspiracy from which their societies were not safe.

That was the main message put forth by Archambault in a 1943 publication:

Au Canada comme ailleurs, se trouve là, en effet, une des forces du Parti communiste. Il réussit à s'agréger de nombreux groupements dont les chefs lui sont absolument dévoués et qu'il mène à sa guise. (...) Le communisme que ces hommes professent n'est pas un communisme édulcoré, c'est le communisme pleinement révolutionnaire, organisé par Moscou dont il reçoit les ordres et qui ne vise qu'un but: la bolchévisation de notre pays, en d'autres termes, le renversement du régime actuel et son remplacement par un gouvernement soviétique.²⁷¹

With the objective of exposing communist activity in their own countries, the ESP and DVC also presented examples of domestic movements that they accused of harbouring socialist and communist influences. However, the revolutionary character of these movements were often overstated or misinterpreted. One example was the ESP's reaction to the foundation of the Co-operative Commonwealth Federation in 1936, whose influence, as stated by Rouillard, "souffre en particulier au Québec de l'opposition de l'Église catholique qui confond social-démocratie et communisme".²⁷² Despite the CCF's leadership denying any connection with the USSR, the ESP's arguments against the movement were based on describing its ideas as being inspired

²⁷⁰ Ledit, *L'Espagne au sortir de la guerre*, 11.

²⁷¹ Joseph-Papin Archambault, *Le plus grand péril*, brochure n.352 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1943), 6-8.

²⁷² Rouillard, *Histoire du syndicalisme Québécois*, 188.

by Marxism. This is best illustrated from the comments made by Msgr. Georges Gauthier which were published in one of the ESP's brochures:

L'un des Co-Ops nous annonce que Karl Marx est un "vieux ami", il vante "son génie" et "sa doctrine profonde". Mais Karl Marx c'est le déterminisme économique, et le matérialisme érigé en dogme. Comment ne pas affirmer que le programme de la C.C.F., en fait, sinon dans les intentions de ses auteurs, repose sur une conception matérialiste de l'ordre social et que c'est précisément ce qui constitue le caractère anti-chrétien du socialisme authentique?²⁷³

Brazilian anti-communist propagandists were also invested in painting leftist movements with a red brush. However, in Brazil, such practices resulted in larger political consequences. The effectiveness of Brazilian anti-communist propaganda should not be attributed solely to the DVC, as the propaganda disseminated by Vargas' administration was more successful in propagating this message. An important episode used by Vargas to publicize the existence of a communist conspiracy in Brazil was the *Intentona Comunista*, which consisted of a number of military revolts that occurred in November 1935 in the cities of Recife, Natal and Rio de Janeiro. These movements were portrayed by the government as being organized by the leaders of the Brazilian Communist Party aided by agents from the III International, as well as with direct assistance from Soviet agents. In December 1935, *A Ordem* responded to the movement stating:

There is now a smaller number of optimists who considered the communist movement in Brazil a simple scarecrow. This menace has recently become concretized with the events in Pernambuco, Rio Grande do Norte and in this Capital. (...) God's will was served as the revolutionary plot, which came from all sides, and required only some effort from the government to dispel it. We believe that the authorities have nobly carried out their duty in this emergency. (...) We must promote the re-education of our people according to the principles

²⁷³ Georges Gauthier, "La Doctrine sociale de l'Église", n. 242 (Montreal: Ecole sociale populaire 1934), 22.

of order and fulfill their ideological emptiness with the riches of Christian ideals.²⁷⁴

It is important to mention, however, that historians today still debate the degree to which the 1935 revolt carried out communist objectives. While it is largely accepted that the revolts were organized by the leader of the Brazilian Communist Party Luis Carlos Prestes, years later in an interview, Prestes stated that “the revolt of 1935 was not an exclusively communist movement. Its participants did not intend to establish a proletarian dictatorship, nor a communist government, contrary to what the reactionary forces stated.”²⁷⁵

While the *Intentona* was an important turning point in the persecution of revolutionary movements in Brazil, the tactic of overstating communist presence is better represented in the “Cohen plan”, which consisted of a false document that was used as “proof” of an imminent communist revolution. As explained by historian Celia Maria Groppo, the plan stated that:

There would be popular massacres, plunder of commercial establishments and fire in the government buildings and Churches. The alleged authorship of the *Plano Cohen* (a remarkably Jewish name), was given to the member of the Integralist Action Cpt. Olímpio Mourão Filho. This fictional work was used as an “official document”, and served as justification for the establishment of a political dictatorship in the country on the 10th of November 1937.²⁷⁶

²⁷⁴ “Já agora é menor o numero dos optimistas que consideravam um simples espantinho para naturezas pouco viris a ameaça de um movimento comunista no Brasil. Esta ameaça acaba de ter expressão concreta nos acontecimentos de Pernambuco, Rio Grande do Norte e desta Capital, nos ultimos dias de Novembro ultimo. (...) Deus foi servido que a trama revolucionaria tão sabiamente urdida, sem se saber como, se rompesse de todos os lados, de modo que um pouco de energia da parte do Governo bastou para inutilisa-la. Cremos que as autoridades, nesta emergencia, cumpriram nobremente o seu dever. Porem julgamos necessario pôr em relevo que (...) devemos mostrar um empenho particular em reeducar o nosso povo nos principios de ordem e em encher o vazio do seu pensamento com a riqueza dos ideaes christãos.” Perillo Gomes, “A Revolução comunista”, *A Ordem* n. 65 (Dec 1935), 576.

²⁷⁵ “A insurreição de 1935 não foi, porém, um movimento exclusivamente comunista, nem pretendiam os insurretos de 35 instaurar em nosso país a ditadura do proletariado, nem muito menos um governo comunista, como afirma a reação”. Célia Maria Groppo, “Ordem no céu, ordem na terra: A revista “A Ordem” e o ideário anticomunista das elites católicas (1930-1937)”. (Ma. diss. Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, 2007), 13.

²⁷⁶ *Ibid*, 15.

None of the episodes of the *Intentona* nor the “Cohen Plan” were directly orchestrated by the Catholics of the DVC. Nevertheless, they serve as examples that illustrate the potential of anti-communist messages to legitimize the establishment of corporatist institutions.

Given the amount of energy and resources that the DVC and ESP dedicated to producing anti-communist messages, to state that Catholics in Brazil and Quebec purposely misled the public into believing the eminence of the “spectre of communism” would be an unfair simplification of their intentions. The papal directives, the advance of international communist movements and the general availability of unverifiable information all contributed to the communist paranoia that took over much of the western world. However, it is also clear that the amount of anti-communist propaganda released by the ESP and the DVC was not proportional to the communist movements in their countries. Therefore, anti-communism served more to justify their establishment of corporatist institutions than to suppress local movements.

While the fight against communism was presented by the ESP and the DVC as one of the main factors that justified the instauration of corporatism, it was the distinct ways that Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics perceived liberalism that better explains the differences in the corporatist institutions they supported.

2. Liberalism

Both communism and liberalism were heavily criticised in the Papal encyclicals. However, instead of completely denial of liberal ideas, the Catholic social doctrine was focused primarily on rectifying what its abuses. The distinction between

the Church's position towards socialism and liberalism was clarified by Pius XI in

Quadragesimo Anno:

With all his energy Leo XIII sought to adjust this [liberal] economic system according to the norms of right order; hence, it is evident that this system is not to be condemned in itself. And surely it is not of its own nature vicious. But it does violate right order when capital hires workers, that is, the non-owning working class, with a view to and under such terms that it directs business and even the whole economic system according to its own will and advantage, scorning the human dignity of the workers, the social character of economic activity and social justice itself, and the common good.²⁷⁷

Pius XI's message was well understood by the intellectuals of the ESP and the DVC and while condemning the negative aspects of the liberal ideology, they also presented themselves as defenders of its basic principles, namely private property and individual rights. This was made clear by the most important corporatist in the ESP, Esdras Minville's 1933:

En soi, le régime [capitaliste] n'offre rien d'illégitime, d'intrinsèquement mauvais. Au contraire, et à la condition, (...) d'être organisé selon la justice, c'est le régime le plus propre à assurer l'épanouissement de la vie économique, support de la vie intellectuelle et morale et de la vie sociale.²⁷⁸

However, as mentioned in Chapter I, the ESP and the DVC had different understandings of what constituted the "abuses" of liberalism, and while both used the term in their publications, they were in fact making reference to distinct parts of the ideology. The ESP's criticism of modern society was directed towards economic liberalism, asserting that the introduction of individualism in the economy was responsible for the problems related to the social question in Quebec. Again, Minville serves as an example:

²⁷⁷ *Quadragesimo Anno*, sec. 101.

²⁷⁸ Minville, Esdras; Georges Lévesque and Loius Chagnon. *Pour la Restauration sociale au Canada*, brochure n. 232-233 (Montreal: École sociale populaire, 1933), 5.

Les caractéristiques du capitalisme contemporain [...] indiquent assez l'origine des abus qui ont fait d'un régime légitime en soi, un régime vicieux dans son application. Le capitalisme s'est inféodé au libéralisme économique, il s'est accroché aux postulats fondamentaux de la théorie libérale.[...] La loi du gain n'est pas la loi essentielle de la vie économique. La liberté est nécessaire, mais il ne faut pas la confondre avec la licence. Les lois économiques existent, mais elles n'ont pas la priorité sur la justice. Le capitaliste a mieux à faire que d'entasser de richesses. Il a un rôle social à jouer.²⁷⁹

In Brazil, the repercussions of economic liberalism was seen by Catholics as a secondary issue. The articles of *A Ordem* tended to prioritize the criticism of political liberalism, notably of its secular character. The conclusion exposed by Oscar Mendes in 1932, explained liberalism first as an evil philosophy, which contaminated primarily the political aspects, and secondarily the economic aspect:

The liberalism that we consider evil and corrosive is that which Léon Daudet called the female result of the Protestant Reform, of which the French Revolution is the male result. It is the liberalism that proclaims absolute freedom of individuals from society and authority. Freedom from the supreme principles of justice and moral, especially those of the Church. It is the liberalism [...] whose dissemination was characterized by Leo XIII in *Immortale*: It begins with the philosophy of Luther against the christian religion. This philosophy, then, poisons society's civil hierarchy, and from the political sphere, it finally descends to the economic order.²⁸⁰

Another revealing example is the 1938 article by Fernando Bastos Ribeiro²⁸¹.

More focused on the Brazilian reality, Ribeiro argues that countering the abuses of

²⁷⁹ *ibid*, 6.

²⁸⁰ “O liberalismo que apontamos, como nefasto e corrosivo, é aquele que Léon Daudet, o contundente e caustico planfetério francês chamou de ramo femea da Reforma de que a Revoluao Francêsa fôra o ramo macho. É o liberalismo que proclama a tese da liberdade absoluta, isto é, dos individuos em relação ás sociedades e ás autoridades, e das sociedades em relação aos principios supremos da justiça e da moral, e principalmente da Igreja. É o libalismo que, como uma mancha de azeite vem, desde o seculo XVI, se alastrando pelo espirito humano, e cuja disseminação Leão XIII, na sua imortal encíclica *Immortale*, caracterizou: primeiramente, com Lutero, ele investe contra a religião cristã e perturba. Por um declive natural, passa á filosofia. Da filosofia vai envenenar toda a hierarquia da sociedade civil. Das regiões da politica, desce afinal para a esfera da ordem economica.” Oscar Mendes, “O Liberalismo no Brasil sob o ponto de vista catolico”, *A Ordem* n.23 (Jan 1932), 32.

²⁸¹ Fernando Bastos Ribeiro was an ardent anti communist intellectual, who also served as the leader of the Civil Guard. After 1945, he would become an official in the police department.

capitalism in Brazil should not be a priority because it did not correspond to the country's context.

In order to counter a capitalist regime, it is necessary that our economic bases correspond to a scenario where workers and employers are constantly fighting each other due to capital accumulation and the enslavement of the working class. [...] Where is this capitalism in Brazil? In the North? The center? The South? [...] the truth might scare some, but we cannot deny that there is no such capitalism in Brazil.²⁸²

Instead, the great majority of the anti-liberal arguments present in *A Ordem* were targeted towards countering the spread of political liberalism. According to Brazilian Catholics, while republicanism was not condemned by the Church *per se*, this type of government was not well suited to represent the Brazilian people. As explained by Alceu Lima in 1932, the republican movement in Brazil had imposed a secular government over an inherently Catholic people, causing a rupture between the State and the population.

The national politics of the Republic produced a strong separation between the Nation and the public power. [...] Because of the secular characteristics of the Republic, there has been a radical separation between the State and the spiritual reality of the Nation. As a result, an even deeper abyss between law and reality, between the power and the people was created, which explains the surge of the 1930 Revolution.²⁸³

The different perspectives of the ESP and the DVC regarding liberalism had important repercussions for their corporatist models, as they saw the corporatist

²⁸² “Para se poder combater um regime capitalista faz-se necessario que a organização economica desse regime esteja enquadrada em bases tais, que se verifique estarem não só o trabalho como o trabalhador, constringido um, asfixiado outro, pela pressão crescente desses capitais, cujo aumento se verifique num ascendente, que tenha como base a limitação forçada dessa produção e a escravização dessa mão de obra [...] Onde o capitalismo no Brasil? No Norte? No centro? No Sul? [...] A verdade espanta, mas não ha nega-la: não ha no Brasil, capitalismo digno desse nome”. Fernando Bastos Ribeiro. “O Comunismo e o Brasil”, *A Ordem* n.88 (Feb 1938), 153-155.

²⁸³ “Tanto na Monarchia como na Republica, processou-se, quanto á vida politica nacional, um grave dissidio entre a nação e o poder publico. [...] Na Republica, em virtude da concepção laicista, que separou radicalmente o Estado de toda a realidade espiritual da nação, creand um abysmo ainda muito mais grave entre o direito e o facto, entre o Poder e o Povo, que acabou traduzindo-se na Revolução de 1930” “A Acção Catholica Brasileira”, *A Ordem* n.27 (May 1932), 390.

movement as means to achieve distinct goals. Struggling against the effects of economic liberalism in society, the ESP was determined to solve the social question. Conversely, struggling against the effects of liberalism in politics, the main issue identified by the DVC was the spread of secularism in governmental institutions.

The different objectives of Catholics in Brazil and in Quebec becomes clear when comparing the contents of the directives of the Catholic Electoral League (1933) and the *Programme pour la Restauration Sociale* (1933). As it was demonstrated in the previous chapter, both of these documents had significant impacts in their respective societies and are great indicators of the primary objectives held by these institutions.

With regards to the *Programme*, the creation of mechanisms to control the economy and the alleviation of social problems were the main subjects addressed. Of the thirteen points made in the document, four defended stronger national control over the economy, including stricter regulation over financial institutions and the nationalization of important economic sectors; four points were directed towards the establishment of social policies to alleviate the condition of workers, including the expansion of unemployment insurance and the establishment of the familial salary; two points defended the corporative organization of society; and the last two points reaffirmed the commitment of the Church towards free enterprise and the Canadian Constitution.²⁸⁴

In sharp contrast, out of the ten points raised by the DVC in the directives of the Catholic Electoral League, only one broadly mentions the social question by supporting “labour legislation inspired by social justice and by the principles of the christian

²⁸⁴ Minville, Lévesque and Chagnon, *Pour la Restauration sociale au Canada*, 62-64.

order”.²⁸⁵ However, as many as seven of these points aimed to give a Christian character to the Brazilian State, including the proclamation of the constitution in the name of God, the incorporation of religious education in the public school system, the recognition of clerical duty as equivalent to military duty.²⁸⁶

Further evidence that these institutions had different opinions towards liberalism can be seen in the ESP and DVC’s depiction of which groups ushered in the undesired liberal values in their societies. Esdras Minville argued that in order to halt the spread of (economic) liberalism in Quebec, it was vital that financial institutions of dubious character, such as Trusts and Anonymous societies have their activities restrained. These organizations were presented by Minville as the embodiment of economic individualism, utilizing their economic power to influence the press and the State in order to perpetuate the advancement of liberal policies.

C’est avant tout sur la politique intérieure que s’exerce la dictature des puissances d’argent, exigeant au besoin le bouleversement de la législation, imposant les lois d’exception que les trusts jugent nécessaires à la préservation de leur privilèges ou au succès de leurs entreprises, allant même jusqu’à faire légaliser par les parlements des actes accomplis en marge de la loi et en contravention du droit. Ainsi protégés contre l’intervention des pouvoirs publics qu’ils dominent et contre les dénonciations de la presse qu’ils gouvernent, les maîtres de la finance et des affaires peuvent tramer en paix leurs fructueuses combinaisons, procéder en toute sécurité au tripotage des fonds qu’un public mal averti ou faussement conseillé par des journaux asservis confie à leur administration.²⁸⁷

Conversely, the group blamed by Brazilian Catholics as causing the surge of (political) liberalism in Brazil was the Freemasons. Many authors of *A Ordem* accused these heretic groups of organizing an international conspiracy against Catholicism, and of being responsible for bringing secularism around the world, notably in Spain and

²⁸⁵ “O Programa de 1933 da L.E.C.”, *A Ordem* n.149 (Jul 1945), 85.

²⁸⁶ *Ibid*, 85-85.

²⁸⁷ Minville, Lévesque and Chagnon. *Pour la Restauration sociale au Canada*, 62-64.

Mexico. In many examples, such as the one from Perillo Gomes in 1932, *A Ordem* explains these movements as international enemies of the Church.

The news that we receive from Mexico is an example of the persistence of an anti-catholic campaign. (...) The diabolic work of Freemasonry never ends. Each time they surge, the need for a strong Catholic union capable of defending itself from the persecution of Russia, Mexico and Spain becomes more evident. Such persecution continues to spread throughout the poor western civilization that has been scarred by the [French] Revolution.²⁸⁸

According to *A Ordem*, the dangers of Freemasonry organizations were not just abroad. The Catholics of the DVC believed that they were also very active in Brazil. Such belief was a common theme in the first half of the 1930s and some publications in *A Ordem* sought to denounce movements which carried their secular ideologies. In February 1932, the journal dedicated its editorial article to exposing how the masonic groups in Brazil sought to unify all the enemies of the Church in order to impose a secular State:

The meeting of the 1st congress of the League pro Secular-State in Rio Grande do Sul came to highlight once more the dangers of compulsory secularism to national unity. [...] This Congress united in common hate all sects whose main objective has been to break the soul of our people.[...] In the participant list we see side by side protestant sects, jews and spiritists, all together with their own enemies, the Freemasons and Freethinkers. They only have one common belief: State atheism. They have only one common enemy: The Catholic Church. [...] We must denounce the coup that in being organized by our enemies, namely those of the Freemasonry, organizers of the National Colligation pro Secular State.²⁸⁹

²⁸⁸ “As notícias nos chegam do Mexico mostram que a campanha anti-catholica prosegue com a mesma brutalidade que no tempo de Calles. (...) Como se vê o trabalho da Maçonaria não cessa. E cada vez se torna mais necessaria a intima união entre catholicos para se defenderem da onda de perseguição que da Russo, do Mexico, da Espanha, continua a irradiar por todo este pobre occidente martyrisado pela Revolução.” Perillo Gomes “Mexico”, *A Ordem*. n. 24 (Fev 1932), 157.

²⁸⁹ “A Reunião do 1º Congresso da Liga rio-grandense pró-Estado Leigo, recentemente levada a effeito em Porto Alegre, veio mais uma vez pôr em foco o perigo que para a unidade nacional representa o laicismo compulsório [...]. Esse Congresso reuniu fraternalmente, no odio commum á religião do povo brasileiro, todas as seitas cuja obra mais patente até hoje tem sido quebrar a unidade de alma do nosso povo. [...] Vêem-se ahi, lado a lado, varias seitas protestantes e mais os judeos, os theosophos e os espiritas, de braço dado com os seus figadaes inimigos MAçons e Livres Pensadores. Só um credo commum os reúne - o atheismo do Estado. Só um inimigo commum os approxima - a Igreja Catholica. [...] Cumpre aliás, a esse respeito que denunciemos um golpe que os nossos adversários, e muito

It must be pointed out that not all of *A Ordem's* authors believed that the masonic secret orders of 1930 were still the same enemy that they once were. The Catholic historian Lucio José dos Santos, for example, wrote four articles in 1932 that sought to demystify Freemasonry groups, stating:

Freemasons exaggerate the merit, prestige and the strength of their sect. [...] Many Catholics also amplify the importance of Freemasonry and see their actions everywhere. By doing so, they collaborate with the enemy, attaching to them an importance that they do not have, making them more feared. I shall not sustain that Freemasons are harmless. [...] Freemasons can suddenly provoke a religious war, which we must avoid at all costs in order to save our religion and our nation. However, I do not believe that Freemasonry has today, as it once had in monarchical times, the conditions to unleash the same kinds of storms.²⁹⁰

While the actual force of masonic sects between 1930 and 1945 were up for debate, most of the Catholics in the DVC were of the opinion that secular liberalism in Brazil had masonic roots. Therefore, it was very common to find throughout the entire period analysed, the expression “maçonic liberalism” to make reference to the secularist tendencies of the enemies of the Church, as used in the article of Oscar Mendes, that defined liberalism in 1932:

The consequences of the masonic liberalism in the Constitution are out for all to see. By denying god, prohibiting religious education, disrespecting Christian matrimony, what have we achieved? Forty years of a lay republic that drowned in the most shameful moral decadence. [...] We must organize to fight the good fight against the masonic liberalism.²⁹¹

In order to understand why the DVC blamed political liberalism on freemasonry, some historical context is required. While masonic groups was not strong

especialmente os membros da Colligação Nacional pro-Estado-Leigo, obra da Maçonaria [...].”

“Separatismo Espiritual”, *A Ordem* n.24 (Feb 1932), 81-85.

²⁹⁰ “Os maçons exageram o merito, o prestigio e a força da sua seita. Por sua vez, [...] muitos catholicos ampliam a importancia da Maçonaria e quere ver-lhe o dedo em toda a parte. Collaboram assim, sem o querer, com os inimigos, attribuindo-lhes um valor, que não possuem, e tornando-os mais temiveis. Não sustentarei que seja inoffensiva a Maçonaria. [...] Quer dizer que, de subito, poderá ella provocar uma lucta religiosa, que devemos a todo custo evitar, por amor á religião e á patria. Não creio, porém, que tenha ella elementos, como na monarchia, e esteja nas condições de desencadear as mesmas tempestades.” Lucio José dos Santos, “A Maçonaria no Brasil”, *A Ordem* n.31 (Sep 1932), 176.

²⁹¹ Oscar Mendes, “O Liberalismo no Brasil sob o ponto de vista catolico”, *A Ordem* n.23 (Jan 1932), 44.

in 1930s Brazil, freemasonry had been at the center of heated debates in the last decade of the nineteenth century. By following Rome's instructions in the 1890s, the Bishop of Olinda Dom Vital (after whom the DVC was named), proceeded to excommunicate masonic politicians, causing direct a confrontation between the Church and the Monarchy. This event, which Brazilian historiography refers to as "the religious question", made the struggle against freemasonry an important part of the history of the Brazilian Catholic Church. It marked the independence of the Brazilian clergy from the control of the Monarchy and the increase of its ties with the Church in Rome.²⁹² Considering their legacy as a continuation of Dom Vital's actions the DVC saw in the surge of Freemasonry in the nineteenth century as the source of political secularism.

Throughout the period analysed, a number of myths and exaggerations were found in the publications of both the DVC and the ESP. Some of these, especially those connected with anti-semitism, were defended only by a minority. But others, such as the Freemasons in the DVC and the Anonymous societies in the ESP were more widespread. The presentation of "hidden enemies" were common practice in the Catholic rhetoric of the time, and while they do little justice to the realities of their societies, they serve as further evidence that the ESP and the DVC had different understandings of liberalism. The political conception that the DVC had of liberalism, in addition to a traditional struggle of the Brazilian Church with masonic groups, led the DVC to utilize Freemasonry and their secular ideals as a liberal scarecrow, in similar fashion to communist conspiracies. On the other hand, because the ESP was

²⁹² Antonio Carlos Villaça, *O pensamento católico no Brasil*. (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2006), 83-97

more focused on the economical aspects of liberalism, anonymous societies and foreign corporations were more fit to the same role.

Since the Catholic social doctrine was proposed by Rome as a way to halt the abuses of liberalism, it is natural to assume that different perceptions on the liberal ideology would result in different forms of corporatism. However, in order to fully understand the anti-liberal ideas of the ESP and the DVC, one must also analyse the national element that they carried.

3. Nationalism and the Catholic Church

As demonstrated throughout this study, most of the characteristics adopted by Catholic corporatists in Brazil and Quebec can be traced back to the papal encyclicals. However, the same cannot be said about the ESP and DVC's ideas on nationalism. None of the Papal directives required Catholics to stand for national values the same way they required anti-liberal and anti-communist action. Nonetheless, both the ESP and the DVC carried strong nationalist ideas and serving the nation became an important justification for the establishment of corporatist institutions.

While the Church did not specifically require national action, it did not remain silent on the subject matter either. The surge of nationalism amongst social Catholics was discussed by the Church in Rome in a number of documents that demonstrate the Church's preoccupation with Catholic movements adopting the ultra-nationalist models of Mussolini and Hitler. Both the ESP and the DVC sided with the papal directives in this matter, praising patriotism as a beneficial sentiment, but warning against placing the love for the Nation above the love for God. This is the opinion shown by Father Richard Arès in 1944 in his defense of the national character of the Church in Quebec:

Les Souverains Pontifes, personne ne l'ignore, ont dénoncé à maintes reprises et quelquefois avec véhémence, les nationalismes exagérés. (...) Mais c'est surtout dans sa condamnation de l'erreur raciste germanique que Pie XI s'est montré le plus intransigeant: L'Église, de même qu'elle n'admet pas les idoles, n'admet pas, non plus, le totalitarisme, que ce soit celui de la race, de la classe, de la nation, de la patrie ou de l'État.(...) Il est permis de conclure que, dans l'esprit de l'Église, l'amour de la patrie est une vertu chrétienne, vertu qui peut même aller jusqu'à l'héroïsme de la sainteté.²⁹³

Alceu Lima shared Arès' view when criticizing the Italian and German models of nationalism. In 1938, Lima strongly defended that Catholic interests should take priority over those of individual Nations and stated that ultra-nationalism falsely transformed the nation into a divine entity, substituting the worship of God for the worship of the Nation.

[In German nationalism] the Nation becomes a God, but only God is the beginning and end of all things. Therefore, German paganism is based on satanic logic. It denies God, corrupts moral values, and gives a mystic character to mundane things. This Neo-paganism could only lead to the transformation of the Nation in a God, which is an extreme case of false nationalism.²⁹⁴

However, after stating that exaggerated nationalism could lead to undesirable results, he also defended the beneficial aspects of a “true nationalism”, which placed the love for the Nation as second to the love for God:

Justice is the unbreakable lace of true nationalism, for we are born in debt with our parents, our nation and God. From them we receive life, education and all the habits that become part of our personality. This type of nationalism is philosophically unshakable. We can never stop serving our country, in the same way that we cannot stop serving our parents, and above all, God. God is infinitely deserving of all our love, and second to him, our parents and nation.

²⁹³ P. Richard Arès. *L'Église et le nationalisme*, brochure n.365 (Montréal: École sociale populaire, 1944), 2-25.

²⁹⁴ “A Nação é afinal divinizada, pois só Deus é o início e o fim de todas as coisas. O paganismo germanico está na sua logica satânica. Desconhecendo a Deus, invertendo toda ordem de valores, aplicando ás coisas relativas a riqueza mistica de um povo essencialmente religioso, o néo-paganismo só podia chegar a essa divinização da Nação, que é o extremo a que chega em nosso dias o falso nacionalismo.” Alceu Amoroso Lima, “O Nacionalismo Cristão”, *A Ordem*, n.95 (Oct 1938), 379.

[...] Christian nationalism is not a passion, but a virtue. It is not composed of a selfish interest, but a duty of gratitude.²⁹⁵

Therefore, both the ESP and the DVC agreed upon the general relationship between nationalism and Catholicism. Following the directives from Rome, both institutions sought to develop their nationalist ideas as subordinate to the Catholic social doctrine.

One of the ways that the ESP and the DVC utilized nationalist arguments was by transforming their anti-liberal objectives into a patriotic duty. In the case of the ESP, the thoughts of Lionel Groulx were particularly influential and touched all of the main ideas defended by the institution. Groulx's influence over the ESP's corporatist model was largely transmitted through the writings of Esdras Minville, the director of *L'Action Nationale*. Minville, who was the economist responsible for developing most of the ESP's corporatist institutions, argued in 1936 that finding answers to solve the problems brought upon by liberalism in Quebec directly benefited French Canadians as they formed the bulk of the working class. According to the author, the dominance of foreign employers over local workers not only impoverished working families, but also removed the control over Quebec's policies from the hands of the French Canadians. Therefore, the corporatist organization served a national cause:

La population française du Canada vit dans un état d'infériorité économique manifeste. Si elle est assez solidement établie dans l'agriculture, sa participation au commerce, à l'industrie, surtout la grande industrie, et à la finance est loin

²⁹⁵ “Eis aí o fundamento inabalavel do verdadeiro nacionalismo, a justiça é a base desse laço. Justiça que devemos [...] por sermos devedores daqueles dos quais recebemos alguma coisa. Ora, de nossos pais, de nossa patria e de Deus, recebemos o ser, a vida, a educação e todos os dons e os habitos que daí nos vieram para completar e aperfeiçoar nossa personalidade. O nacionalismo assim entendido é pois, filosoficamente, inabalavel. Não podemos deixar de servir á nossa patria, como não podemos deixar de servir a nossos pais e a Deus acima de tudo. [...] Deus é digno infinitamente, segundo seu Ser Infinito, da plenitude do nosso amor, como segundo a sua posição relativa são dignos os nossos pais e a nossa patria. [...] O nacionalismo cristão não é uma paixão mas uma virtude. Não é um interesse egoista, mas um dever de gratidão.” *ibid*, 386-388.

d'être proportionnée à son importance numérique. C'est à un point tel que la précarité de sa situation économique va jusqu'à compromettre sa stabilité sociale et son intégrité politique. Elle doit compter de plus en plus avec les grands employeurs de l'autre nationalité. Ceux-ci sont indiscutablement les maîtres de la vie économique du Canada. (...) Cette puissance économique, ils l'ont acquise sous un régime d'inspiration libérale, étroitement apparenté et comme dérivé de leur croyance religieuse elle-même. Le libéralisme économique est, peut-on dire, un produit de l'esprit anglais.²⁹⁶

However, considering the other publications of the ESP, it is clear that empowering unions through a corporatist organization would not suffice to achieve this national objective. It would also be necessary that the unions themselves, which were at the heart of the socio-economic decisions of a corporatist system, also followed such national ideals. It was this condition led Archambault to argue in 1936 that in addition to incorporating Catholic morals into economic policies, Catholic unions also had the objective of diminishing the prevalence of international working federations in Quebec. The author explained that this national role of unions was crucial in order to avoid foreign influence in the Corporative Chamber:

Au Canada, le syndicalisme fut longtemps et est encore pour une bonne part sous la domination d'étrangers. D'eux viennent les directions, les mots d'ordre, les décisions à prendre. Situation humiliante et dangereuse. [...] Les fondateurs du syndicalisme catholique au Canada, écrit le P. Maltais, prétendent que les travailleurs de chaque pays doivent avoir leur propre organisation et être conduits par des chefs ayant les mêmes principes et la même mentalité. [...] l'association ouvrière est un facteur très important de la vie économique et sociale des nations et il peut y avoir de graves inconvénients à ce qu'elle soit sous le contrôle d'influences étrangères. Les syndicats catholiques croient rendre service au pays en créant un mouvement ouvrier strictement organisé d'après les intérêts nationaux.²⁹⁷

Therefore, the emphasis that the ESP gave to the national objectives of the corporatist institutions it defended can only be understood if one considers the connection that the institution made between Catholicism and French Canadian

²⁹⁶ Minville, *Comment établir l'Organisation corporative au Canada*, 3-4.

²⁹⁷ Archambault, *Le syndicalisme catholique au Canada*, 9.

identity, notably through the ideas of Lionel Groulx, and the understanding of liberalism as a foreign ideology.

While the Brazilian context was different from that of the French Canadians, they also explained their anti-liberal cause as a patriotic duty. The DVC's resistance towards political secularism was based on the belief that Catholicism and the Brazilian nation were intrinsically connected. In their view, the application of the "masonic liberalism" and its secular ideas in the government denied Brazil's Catholic character, creating a separation between the people and the State. It is with this rationale that the Catholics of the DVC considered their fight against political secularism as a both national and Catholic cause, as Tenorio de Cannavieiras explained in 1931:

I am not sure that Brazilian Catholics are aware of the important responsibility that rest upon our shoulders. The virus of heretic liberalism, the doctrinal error of separation between Nation and State has poisoned our catholic intelligentsia more than once. [...] The future of our nation, and the future of the Church, is in our hands. We cannot escape this responsibility. We either fulfill this mission imposed by Divine providence upon us, or we will drag this curse to our sons.²⁹⁸

According to the ESP and the DVC, the national objectives of Catholic corporatism surpassed that of freeing their nations from "liberal abuses". Both institutions believed that Catholicism was a crucial element in solving the identity issues afflicting their societies. However in order to better explain the differences between Catholic nationalism, it is necessary to first contextualize the national identity conflicts in Brazil and Quebec.

By 1931, Brazil still lacked a widespread national sentiment. While there had been important efforts to develop the "Brazilian Nation" since the Paraguayan war (1864-1870), the nation projects that were propelled by the Empire and the Republic

²⁹⁸ Tenorio de Cannavieiras. "As Nossas Responsabilidades na hora que passa", *A Ordem* n. 14 (Apr 1931), 284.

failed to achieve popular success. With regards to the efforts in the Old Republic to attach Republican ideals to the Brazilian identity, historian José Murilo de Carvalho stated:

Republican movements in Brazil failed in their efforts to expand the legitimacy of the new regime beyond the confining borders delineated by the victors. They were incapable of creating a popular republican imagery. In certain respects, they attained some degree of success. However, these small gains resulted from compromises with imperial tradition or religious values. Their efforts were insufficient to overcome the barrier formed by the lack of popular involvement in the founding of the new regime. Lacking roots in collective experience, republican symbolism fell by wayside [...].²⁹⁹

The fact that in the the first half of the twentieth century Brazil still lacked national unity is also confirmed by many intellectuals at the time, including Manuel de Oliveira Sobrinho, who published in *A Ordem* in 1938:

It would be a mistake to suggest that the Monarchy consolidated our nationality, and the current generation deals with this reality today. As we face the crisis of creating a contemporary civilization, the fragility of our national ties becomes clear. (...) The immense size of our territory and its geography led to isolated groups and an atomic type of society,³⁰⁰ which has only achieved some cooperation in unintentional circumstances.

The absence of national unity was a strong source of preoccupation for the DVC. According to Brazilian Catholics, it could effectively lead to civil war and even the eventual dismemberment of the country. For these intellectuals, if Brazil was to remain united, it was imperative that a national sentiment was created and the editorial of *A Ordem* in May 1932 made clear that this duty belonged to Catholics. In the DVC's

²⁹⁹ José Murilo de Carvalho. *The Formation of Souls: Imagery of the Republic in Brazil*. (Notre Dame, Ind: University of Notre Dame Press, 2012), 151-152.

³⁰⁰ “É um erro dizer-se que o Imperio consolidou a nacionalidade. A nacionalidade não está consolidada. E a geração atual da Republica sente, principalmente hoje, essa verdade. E percebe, nos menores fatos, com a formidável crise da civilização contemporânea, a fragilidade de todos os laços nacionais.(...) A enormidade do território e a sua fisionomia geográfica, determinates do isolamento dos grupos, engendrou a nossa sociedade de tipo atomístico, que não conheceu a forma cooperativa sinão acidentalmente.” Manoel de Oliveira Franco Sobrinho. “Alberto Torres e o panorama do Brasil”, *A Ordem* n. 92 (Jul 1938), 47-48.

view, Catholicism was the sole characteristic that could unite the different regions of such a diverse country:

We firmly believe that it is the duty of Catholics to avoid, by all means, that the psychological, historical or social differentiations between the North and the South of Brazil degenerate in definite separation. (...) It is us Catholics, above anyone else, that carry such duty. (...) Our national unifying tradition is based on our Catholic characteristics, and this tradition alone can help us to counter any politic based in individualism, regionalism or partisanship, and substitute it for the benefit of the Christian principles that unite us.³⁰¹

With the goal of establishing a unified Catholic culture that would serve as a common identity for the entire nation, Catholic corporatism in Brazil was not only a religious and institutional reform, but also a Nation-State project.

While the DVC's goal was to establish a Brazilian nationality, Canada's national question spawned from the coexistence of two well defined identities. In the Canadian federation, national tensions were shaped by the development of an English imperial identity that clashed with the strong self-awareness of French Canadians. Contrary to Brazil, the context in Quebec did not require the ESP to create a French Canadian Catholic nationality. As explained by historians Jean Hamelin and Nicole Gagnon, by the twentieth century the Catholic Church was already a symbol of French Canadian identity:

l'Église est enfin le lieu naturel où la société québécoise se donne une représentation d'elle-même: une société catholique, française et rurale, dont la vocation est de répandre le catholicisme en terre d'Amérique. [...] En ce sens, l'Église québécoise est une Église nationale. Elle est l'incarnation d'une nationalité conçue comme un peuple élu de Dieu.³⁰²

³⁰¹ “Cremos firmement que o dever dos catholicos é impedir, por todos os modos, que essas diferenciações psicologicas, historicas ou sociaes entre o Norte e o Sul do Brasil, degenerem em dissociações definitivas. (...) Aos catholicis, mais que a quaesquer outros, cabe essa tarefa. (...) Essa tradição unitaria nacional baseada na propria unidade da formação catholica, só nos pode levar a combater qualquer velleidade politica individualista, regionalista ou partidarista, em beneficio da unidade de principios que nos reune em Christo”. “Norte-Sul”, 325-326.

³⁰² Gagnon, Hamelin and Voisine, *Histoire du catholicisme québécois*, 48.

Nonetheless, the fact that the Catholic Church was already a national symbol in Quebec did not mean that all of the Catholic's national objectives had been achieved. The ESP was also preoccupied with protecting the French Canadian culture against assimilation by the English Canadians. According to the ESP, the Catholic Church had an important role in maintaining such an identity, which allowed for the French Canadian Catholic Action to pursue an *action nationale*. The involvement of the lay movements in the national action is particularly evident in their mission of promoting the use of French language in Quebec. As explained by Archambault, the involvement of Catholics in language matters was justified by the deep connection between Catholicism and the French language in Canada:

Au Canada, il est hors de doute que la langue française sert à nos compatriotes de sauvegarde pour leur foi. La défendre, la cultiver, la faire enseigner aux enfants dans les écoles - action nationale,- est donc un moyen orienté, du moins dans tels cas déterminés, vers une fin religieuse. L'Action catholique peut alors l'employer. Elle fait de l'action nationale mais pas pour elle-même.³⁰³

Likewise, the DVC also believed that the Catholic Action was responsible for promoting an important national objective. With the goal of developing a Brazilian Catholic nationality, the DVC argued that it was up to the Catholic lay elites to develop a national mythology that could link Brazilian identity and Catholicism. Such a role was undertaken by a number of Catholic elite groups, such as the Christ Redeemer Congress, the Frequent Communion Apostolate, and even the DVC itself.³⁰⁴ This effort is illustrated in a series of articles in 1931, whereby Helio Vianna argued for a revision of Brazilian historiography criticizing “secular” Brazilian historians for ignoring the importance of religion in national formation:

³⁰³ Archambault, *La Jeunesse et l'Action catholique*, 54.

³⁰⁴ “Um Anno de Trabalho”, *A Ordem* n.21 (Nov 1931), 263.

In analysing the historians of the first three centuries of America, the result is the confirmation of a concerning fact: in choosing their materials, the influences of anti-religious prejudices and unfaithful republicanism are predominant. They prefer to silence the historical truth and ignore the abundance of materials that refer to the importance of morals and religion.³⁰⁵

However, as vital as the Brazilian elites were in creating the myth of a Catholic Brazil, this conception also required a mechanism through which Brazilian Catholics could spread the national message to the rest of the population. For this, the DVC relied on the support of the State, and the necessity of religious education in public schools became one of the most recurrent themes in *A Ordem*. More specifically, the DVC was a fierce critic of the education policies raised by the Pioneers of the New School led by Anísio Teixeira, which professed secular mandatory education based on the pedagogical theories of John Dewey.

The ideas contained in the [New School] manifesto are an aberration to national Christian free education. It represents the Masonic education philosophy, which serves as a violent opposition against any of the three principles of civilization: Christianity, nationalism and freedom of education. The manifesto is anti-Christian, because it denies the supremacy of the spirit; It is anti-national, because despite acknowledging a “care for the national unity”, it disregards any characteristics of Brazilian tradition.³⁰⁶

³⁰⁵ “Percorram-se os historiadores dos tres primeiros seculos da America e o resultado é a verificação de um facto bem grave e bem significativo: poderam mais na escolha dos seus materiais de narração as influencias dos preconceitos anti-religiosos do regalismo ou do republicanismo incréo, que a propria verdade histórica, abundantemente esparsa nos chronistas coévos, mas que referindo-se aos elementos moraes trazidos e incutidos pela religião, preferiram silenciar.” Helio Vianna, “Formação Americana”, *A Ordem* n.17 (Jul 1931), 27.

³⁰⁶ It is important to note that in this quote, when the author refers to liberalism, he is referring specifically to freedom of education, which as argued in Chapter 2, was one of the policies of the DVC in the early 1930s. “Pois é preciso ficar bem claro que as odéas desse manifesto aberram integralmente de toda concepção christão nacional ou liberal da educação. É a philosophia maçônica da educação posta ao serviço de uma opposição violenta contra tudo o que fôrma a base de uma civilização fundada em qualquer dos tres principios acima apontados: o christianismo, o nacionalismo e o liberalismo. Pois o manifesto é anti-christão, porque nega a supremacia da finalidade espiritual; é anti-nacional, pois, embora referindo-se ao cuidado da unidade nacional, não leva em seu racionalismo arido, nenhuma particularidade do temperamento e da tradição brasileira.” Tristão de Athayde, “Absolutismo Pedagogico”, *A Ordem* n.26 (Apr 1932), 320.

It becomes evident that communism, liberalism and nationalism had vital influences on the development of the Catholic social doctrine, and this is reflected in articles published by the ESP and the DVC. As demonstrated in this chapter, the DVC and the ESP mostly utilized anti-communism as an argument for the establishment of their corporatist ideals. Communism was presented as an inevitable apocalyptic if the anti-liberal reforms requested by the Catholic social doctrine were not taken seriously. Therefore anti-communism was used more as rhetoric, and played a lesser role in determining the the models of corporatism adopted by DVC and the ESP.

Conversely, it was the distinct views that Catholics in Brazil and Quebec had towards liberalism that led their intellectuals to support the establishment of distinct institutions. The fact that the ESP believed that liberalism affected their society through the economy led them to focus on unions. On the other hand the DVC's belief that liberalism was a political issue, led this institution to focus its corporatist model on the State. In short, Catholics in Brazil and Quebec developed their corporatist institutions as solutions to different problems.

This chapter also demonstrated that Catholics in Brazil and in Quebec were very engaged in nationalism, and linked their anti-liberalism with national objectives. This led the ESP and the DVC to argue that the spiritual goals of Catholic corporatism were intrinsically connected with the destiny of their nations. However, Quebec and Brazil faced distinct challenges with regards to their national identity, which led the ESP and the DVC to adopt different national goals. While the corporatist institutions of the DVC had the national goal of creating a Nation-State, the ESP's corporatism aimed to protect a previously established *Église-Nation*.

CONCLUSION

This comparative analysis was performed with the assumption that the study of corporatist movements should not focus uniquely on analysing the institutions they supported. If such methodology was applied in this thesis, the logical conclusion would have been to separate the corporatist models of the ESP and the DVC as part of distinct branches of corporatism. The subordination of the Câmara Corporativa to the State, would have aligned the corporatism defended by the DVC with the State corporatist movement, similar to those witnessed in Italy and Portugal. Conversely, considering that the ESP refused an authoritarian state, focusing instead on unions and the pursuit of a politically independent Conseil National, we would have concluded that this movement was part of the different movement of Social corporatism, such as that defended by Belgian and Swiss corporatists.

A study restricted to an institutionally-driven analysis would have overlooked the religious arguments of these two corporatist movements. Both the ESP and the DVC saw themselves as a “fourth” way out of communism, liberalism and fascism, denying the effectiveness of any alternatives that did not include Catholicism as a central part of their solution. According to both the ESP and the DVC, only a regime that accepted that the restoration of Catholic morals could offer a true solution to the the abuses of liberalism, and such a belief was held to a higher degree than any given form of institutional structure. That can be seen by the fact that Italy and Portugal, two countries that adopted a State centered form of corporatism, were distinctly evaluated by Catholic corporatists in both Brazil and Quebec. The fact that the ESP and the DVC agreed with the principles of the Catholic social doctrine and with the spiritual

explanation of modern problems reveals that despite their institutional differences, both belonged to the larger movement of Catholic corporatism.

In addition to recognizing the existence of an independent Catholic corporatist movement, it is also necessary that historians acknowledge that the Church did not seek solely temporal objectives, but subordinated material gains to its own spiritual view of the world. As sustained by Scott Mainwaring:

Religious organizations present complex problems for the social scientist, for they spring from nonrational inspirations [...] When an institution's fundamental end is nonrational, it may be willing to sacrifice some interests if it is convinced that it has a calling to do so. A Church will renounce financial benefits, prestige, institutional expansion, and other interests if it feels that its religious mission compels to do so.³⁰⁷

Too often Catholic movements are studied through a non-spiritual scope, evaluating their objectives and success based on political and material results. Such studies fail to see that the Church's spiritual objectives may or may not include temporal conduct. Those that do not acknowledge the religious logic of the Church fail to fully grasp the significance of the Catholic social doctrine. Ultimately, it is because the Catholic Church's objectives were spiritual as opposed to temporal that we can understand the malleability of its social doctrine, and its ability to adapt to various forms of political institutions.

On this note, by comparing the corporatist ideologies of the ESP and the DVC, it becomes evident that although they agreed in their foundational beliefs, they disagreed in how their institutions ought to be organized. The details of the corporatist institutions defended by the ESP and the DVC were highly influenced by their different intellectual traditions and levels of industrialization.

³⁰⁷ Mainwaring, *The Catholic Church and politics in Brazil*, 10.

By 1931 Quebec had become industrialized and French Canadians faced the economic and social problems typically related to the social question. Of those, the ESP was particularly preoccupied with deplorable housing conditions and the low salaries that forced women and children to work. Furthermore, the influence of the national ideas of Lionel Groulx are vital to understand the national aspect of the ESP and its preoccupation with the ever growing inequality between English and the French Canadians. Pressed with the challenge of finding an answer to the social and national question, the ESP sought out the assistance of the Catholic social doctrine, which directly addressed many of these problems.

On the other hand, Brazil's agrarian society was not struggling with the negative consequences of industrialization, causing the DVC to treat the social question as a secondary issue. It is undeniable that there were great economical inequalities in Brazil, notably resulting from restricted land access and the fact that by 1931, only 43 years had passed since slavery had been abolished in the country. Nonetheless, the fact that most of the Brazilian population lived in rural areas kept the social question at bay. In addition to that, the refusal of the separation between Church and State by sectors of the Catholic Church, namely the Catholic Action and Cardinal Dom Sebastião Leme, led the DVC to adopt a political approach to Catholic corporatism.

This different context not only determined the ways in which the DVC and the ESP interpreted liberalism, but it also meant that Brazilian and French Canadian Catholics had to work with very distinct forms of societal organization. Thanks to the advancement of industries and urbanization in Quebec, by the time the French Canadian clergy noted the importance of working class movements, unions were

already an important aspect of the social life in the province. Thus, establishing a union-based corporative society described, as the one described in *Quadragesimo Anno* was consistent with the French Canadian context.

On the other hand, Brazil's plantations were organized around the quasi-medieval *Coronelismo* model, where local leaders exerted more influence on the population than central authorities. Given this remote setting, union movements were severely restricted and all institutions, including the Church and the State, had little reach over the vastly dispersed population. Under these circumstances, the great events of Brazilian historiography such as the end of the monarchy and the beginning of the Republic, remained largely unnoticed by most of the Brazilian population.³⁰⁸ This context not only led Brazilian Catholics to think of the State as the only institution capable of exerting national influence, but also to argue for the necessity of its expansion.

1. The Legacy of Corporatism

The end of the Second World War brought a shift in the public opinion towards the corporatist movement, which was mainly due to a connection between corporatism and the axis powers. Institutions that had based their ideologies in defending the corporatist organization of society were forced to either change their terminology or abandon the movement all together.

As early as 1944, shifting ideas towards the Catholic social doctrine in Brazil can already be noticed in *A Ordem* as Alceu Lima would eventually become a supporter of Jacques Maritain's Christian Democracy. The change in Lima's ideology after the

³⁰⁸ Carvalho, *Formation of Souls*, 56.

war is quite striking. In the 1950s not only did he refuse the development of authoritarian regimes, but he also called for joint action between Catholics and communists. Lima joined forces with left-wing figures such as Anísio Teixeira, who had been one of his most criticized enemies in the past. In a televised interview in the early 1980's, surrounded by notable intellectuals such as Darcy Ribeiro and Lygia Fagundes Telles, Lima referred to his change of heart by stating that “the world had changed, and so did I”.³⁰⁹

In the 1950s the DVC became part of the movement that Scott Mainwaring categorizes as the “Catholic Left”. However, as the Brazilian Catholic movement grew, it also became more diverse, and the DVC became only a branch in the much larger Brazilian Catholic movement.

While a similar shift occurred in Quebec, notably a gravitation towards the ideas proposed by Jacques Maritain, it was not as evident in the ESP. In 1950, the *École* changed its name to Institut Social Populaire and, despite its decaying influence, it continued to defend the corporative organization of society. However, as the *jeunesse catholique* became more independent and the CTCC unions abandoned the corporatist ideals, the Institute's messages were received by a much smaller audience. In the words of Pierre Trépanier, “tous les efforts pour donner un second souffle, après 1950, à l'idée corporatiste se révèleront vains. Aucun parti, aucun gouvernement n'a fait du corporatisme son cheval de bataille.”³¹⁰

Despite losing the leadership role they exerted between 1931 and 1945, the long-term influences of the ESP and DVC should not be ignored. Both institutions

³⁰⁹ Memórias, Alceu Amoroso Lima. “Alceu Amoroso Lima (Tristão de Athayde) - Canal Livre”. Filmed [June 2012]. YouTube video, 1:20:12. Posted [June 2012]. <https://youtu.be/dy0893I0OrI>.

³¹⁰ Trépanier, *Quel corporatisme*, 211.

served as igniters for the development of a Catholic corporatist thought in their societies. By widely propagating their ideas, they influenced movements that played important roles in the historical development of Brazil and Quebec. The DVC was an important source of influence for Getulio Vargas' regime, helping to define the details of his legacy. The DVC was also responsible for establishing a number of Catholic movements and increasing the impact of Catholic policies in Brazil.

Likewise, the ESP was responsible for influencing the ideologies of Catholic institutions in Quebec. As stated by Clinton Archibald, the influence of the ESP "sera capitale car elle marquera le syndicalisme québécois et les comportements des dirigeants sociaux et politiques jusqu'à la disparition du duplessisme."³¹¹ By helping to define the general directives of the Catholic initiatives, the École helped to infuse corporatist ideals within French Canadian institutions, even after most of its members abandoned the corporatist cause.

Pierre Trépanier correctly stated that as of 1950 no political party in Quebec raised a corporatist flag. Yet, although the corporatist movement faded, the corporatist ideal survived. The Quiet Revolution in Quebec brought great changes to French Canadian society as the liberal government of Jean Lesage increased the role of the State and secularized sectors that had previously been placed under the jurisdiction of the Church. However, by analysing the new forms of Lesage's institutions, Clinton Archibald states:

L'on a tout bonnement changé l'appellation *organisation corporative* de la période précédente, par celle de *démocratie organique*. La conséquence majeure de ce langage [...] sera donc de faire changer les choses dans ce que nous appellerions une certaine continuité. Sauf, évidemment, qu'en faisant entrer, dans les mécanismes de participation (et planification), les syndicats

³¹¹ Archibald, *Un quebec corporatiste?*, 53.

directement et les autres corps sociaux, on se trouvait à établir un autre contrat de société. Et c'est l'État, non plus l'Église, qui définit les valeurs.³¹²

The persistence of intermediary institutions in the organization of the Quiet Revolution can be traced back to the influence of Catholic corporatism. In fact, historians such as Jean Philippe Warren, Michael Gauvreau and Louise Bienvenue demonstrate how the *jeunesse catholique* was responsible for developing a French Canadian sociology that would serve as the basis for the Quiet Revolution.³¹³

Other studies, such as that of Sociologists Denyse Cote and Etienne Simard, also argue that certain institutions in contemporary Quebec had its roots in corporatism.

In analysing the *modèle québécois* of regional governance, Cote and Simard stated:

Dans les régions québécoises, les mécanismes de gouvernance propres à ce que certains on nomme le “modèle québécois” ont permis un arrimage de ces organisations communautaires aux instances de planification du développement économique et social apparues subséquentement en région. [...] Issu de la Révolution tranquille, ce modèle de concertation entre les pouvoirs publics québécois et certaines organisations issues de la société civile renvoie aussi au corporatisme social québécois des années 1930, lorsque l'Église exerçait sa gouverne sur les composantes organisationnelles de la société civile.³¹⁴

By no means does this brief conclusion aim to illustrate all of the influences that corporatism exerted in modern Quebec. Such an undertaking would only be achieved with a much more detailed analysis. However, as stated by Dominique Foisly-Geoffroy, despite the great efforts of those who took part in the Quiet Revolution to distance themselves from the past,

Notre expérience en histoire nous a convaincu que, si les ruptures proclamées en grande pompe sont bien réelles, on en exagère souvent la portée. Les nouveaux

³¹² *Ibid*, 168.

³¹³ Michael Gauvreau. *The Catholic Origins of Quebec's Quiet Revolution, 1931-1970*. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005).

³¹⁴ Denyse Cote and Etienne Simard. "Gouvernance régionale, innovation, et mouvements sociaux dans le Québec contemporain: état de la situation." *Quebec Studies*, vol. 54, 2012, p. 111. Academic OneFile, go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?p=AONE&sw=w&u=otta77973&v=2.1&id=GALE%7CA329066295&it=r&sid=5aa3852703a06958e3f786468488f0fb. Accessed 15 Dec. 2016.

régimes poussent toujours leurs racines jusqu'aux époques antérieures. Celles-ci leur fournissent bon nombre d'éléments, d'idées, d'institutions, à partir desquels ils s'édifient, malgré leur prétention à faire table rase du passé.³¹⁵

While Pierre Trepanier demonstrates that the persistence of the corporatist idea should not be confused with a continuation of the Catholic corporatist institutions we have studied, such persistence demonstrates the long term effects of the corporatist propaganda of the École.

Likewise, the Brazilian corporatist movement also ended in 1945, but many of the characteristics that defined Brazilian corporatism persisted. Institutionally speaking, the corporatist organization of unions established under the *Estado Novo* remained a reality until 1964. As explained by historian Robert J. Alexander:

During the democratic interregnum from 1945 until 1964, the schema of labor relations and organized labor established in the *Estado Novo* was not fundamentally altered. The governmental control over organized labor that the *Estado Novo* had provided for continued to exist legally. Various administrations applied the *Estado Novo* rules with more or less leniency, but the basic framework persisted.³¹⁶

However, the resilience of Brazilian corporatism is arguably linked to the legacy left behind by Getulio Vargas. As demonstrated by historian Angela de Castro Gomes, by the end of *Estado Novo*, the ideas of the Brazilian corporatist movement survived and became known as *Trabalhismo*. This movement, symbolized by the *Partido Trabalhista Brasileiro*, did not advocate for the establishment of a corporative chamber, but continued to stand for the importance of strong state intervention in the economy for the benefit of the common good and the importance of intermediary

³¹⁵ Dominique Foisy-Geoffroy, *Les idées politiques des intellectuels traditionalistes canadiens-français*, 4.

³¹⁶ Alexander, *A History of Organized Labor in Brazil*, 135.

institutions, notably the unions, in the development of national economic and social policies.

Furthermore, Castro also argues that because of Vargas' efforts to create a Brazilian nationality based on the identity of the "Brazilian worker", symbols of the *Trabalhismo* movement became part of Brazilian political identity. For example, even today, Brazilian politicians refuse to alter the 1943 labour laws, *Consolidação das Leis de Trabalho* (CLT) for fear of losing political support.

Elected in 1994 with a neo-liberal agenda, President Fernando Henrique Cardoso, gave a speech to the Senate where he declared the "end of the Vargas era", which he described as "the authoritarian model of economic development that relies on the intervention of the State". Yet, since 2002, Brazil has been under the rule of the Labour Party, whose policies continue still support much of the *Trabalhismo*.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources

A Ordem, Editions 11 to 152.

Brochures of the École Sociale Populaire, numbers 216 to 383.

Newspaper *L'Ordre Nouveau*, from 5 Oct 1936 to 5 Dec 1940.

Journal *Rélations*, Editions 1 to 60.

L'Oeuvre des tracts, from 1931 to 1945.

Semaines Sociales du Canada, Editions VIII to XXIII.

Papal Encyclicals

Leo XIII, *Rerum Novarum* [On Capital and Labour], Vatican Website, May 15 1891, accessed October 4, 2015. http://w2.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_l-xiii_enc_15051891_rerum-novarum.html

Pius X, *IAMDUDUM* [On the Law of Separation in Portugal], May 24 1911, accessed May 21, 2016. http://w2.vatican.va/content/pius-x/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-x_enc_24051911_iamdudum.html

Pius XI, *Quadragesimo Anno* [On reconstruction of the social order], Vatican Website, May 15, 1931, sec 127, accessed May 21, 2016. http://w2.vatican.va/content/pius-xi/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-xi_enc_19310515_quadragesimo-anno.html

Pius XI, *Dilectissima Nobis* [On Oppression of the Church of Spain], Vatican Website, June 3, 1933, accessed October 4, 2015. http://w2.vatican.va/content/pius-xi/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-xi_enc_03061933_dilectissima-nobis.html

Pius XI, *Non abbiamo bisogno* [On Catholic Action in Italy], Vatican Website, June 29 1931, accessed October 4, 2015. http://w2.vatican.va/content/pius-xi/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-xi_enc_29061931_non-abbiamo-bisogno.html

Catholic Intellectuals

De Maistre, Joseph. *Du Pape*, (Paris, Charpentier Librairie-Éditeur, 1841)

La Tour-Du-Pin, René-Charles-Humbert Chambly de La Charce. *Vers un ordre social chrétien : jalons de route, 1882-1907* (Paris: Nouvelle Librairie Nationale, 1917).

Leme, Sebastião. *Carta pastoral de Dom Sebastião Leme, arcebispo metropolitano de Olinda, saudando os seus diocesanos*. Petropolis: Typ. Vozes de Petropolis, 1916.

Muller, Albert. *La politique corporative; essais d'organisation corporative*. (Bruxelles: Les Éditions Rex 1935)

Secondary Sources

Academic Articles:

Arès, Richard. "Le Père Joseph-Papin Archambault, S.J. et l'École Sociale Populaire: témoignage" *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, vol. 35, no. 4 (1982), 563-687, doi: 10.7202/304012ar.

Baum, Gregory: "The Impact of Marxist Ideas on Christian Theology", *Laval théologique et philosophique*, Volume 54, n. 3 (Oct 1998), 497-508.

Barison, Monica Santos. "Caso de polícia: Reflexões sobre a Questão Social e a Primeira República" *Cadernos UniFOA*, n. 22 (Aug 2013).

Barnes, Samuel H. "Quebec Catholicism and Social Change." *The Review of Politics* 23, no. 01 (Jan 1961), 52-76.

Benoit, Maude. "Qu'est-ce que le Corporatisme? Conceptualisation et Opérationnalisation du Méso-Corporatisme." *Social Science Information* 51, no. 2 (2012): 217-237.

Beozzo, José Oscar *A Igreja entre a revolução de 1930, o Estado Novo e a redemocratização*, in Fausto Bóris, *O Brasil republicano*. 2 (São Paulo: Difel 1983)

Bock, Michel, "Le rapport des groulxistes au politique", *Vingtième siècle*, n.129 (jan-mar 2016), 27-42.

Boily, Frédéric. "Une figure du catholicisme social canadien-français de l'entre-deux-guerres: le père Joseph Papin Archambault, s.j.", *Mens: revue d'histoire intellectuelle de l'Amérique française*, vol. 1, no. 2 (2001), 141-161. doi: 10.7202/1024447ar.

Capelato, Maria Helena Rolim "Populismo Latino-Americano em discussão" in Ferreira, Jorge Luiz. *O populismo e sua história: debate e crítica*. (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2001), 125-166.

- Carvalho, Adriana Duarte de Souza, “Liberalismo e Corporativismo: Uma Análise do Processo Constituinte de 1946”, *I Seminário Nacional Sociologia & Política UFPR 2009* (2009)
- Carvalho, José Murilo de, “República, democracia e federalismo, Brasil, 1970-1891”, *Varia História*, vol. 27, n. 45 (Jan-Jun 2011), 141-157.
- Da Mota, Ireni Soares and Eduardo Gusmão de Quadros, “Deus, Pátria e Liberdade: um estudo sobre o Partido Católico em Goiás (1881-1909)”, *Ciberteologia*, year VII, n.35, 33-44.
- Filho, Fernando Antonio Pinheiro, “A invenção da ordem: intelectuais católicos no Brasil”, *Tempo soc.* v. 19, no. 1 (Jun 2007), 33-49.
- Gomes, Angela de Castro, “Autoritarismo e corporativismo no Brasil: o Legado de Vargas”, *Revista USP* n.65 (São Paulo - Mar-May 2005) 105-199
- Instituto Brasileiro de Economia, Sociologia e Política, “O Que é o ademarismo?” *Cadernos de Nosso Tempo*, v.2, n.2, (Rio de Janeiro - jan/jun 1954) 139-149. in Simon Schwartzman: *O Pensamento nacionalista e os “Cadernos de Nosso Tempo”*, UnB; Câmara dos Deputados, (Brasília), 9-21.
- Kriscke, Paulo, “O nacionalismo e a Igreja Católica a preparação para a democracia no Brasil - 1930-19405”, *Revista de Cultura Contemporânea*, Vol 2. N.1 (São Paulo: Cedec/Paz e Terra, 1979)
- Laliberté, G.-Raymond, “Dix-huit ans de corporatisme militant. L’École sociale populaire du Montréal, 1933-1950”, *Recherches sociographiques*, vol. 21, no. 1-2 (Jan-Aug, 1980) 55-96 doi: 10.7202/055869ar
- Martins, Luis Carlos dos Passos, “Desenvolvimento econômico, autoritarismo e corporativismo no pensamento de Azevedo Amaral”, *XXVII Simpósio Nacional de História* (Jul 2013).
- Meunier, E-Martin et Michel Bock, “Essor et déclin du corporatisme au Canada français (1930-1960): une introduction” in Olivier Dard, *Le corporatisme dans l’aire francophone au XXème siècle*, Bern: Peter Lang, 2011
- Philippe Schmitter, “Still the Century of Corporatism?”, *The Review of Politics* 36, no.1 (Jan. 1974), 85-131 doi: 10.1017/S0034670500022178
- Routhier, Gilles, “L’ordre du monde. Capitalisme et communisme dans la doctrine de l’École sociale populaire, 1930-1936”, *Recherches sociographiques*, vol. 22, no. 1 (Jan 1981), 7-47, doi: 10.7202/055916ar.

St-Amant, Jean-Claude: “La propagande de l’École sociale populaire en faveur du syndicalisme catholique 1911-1949”, *Revue d’histoire de l’Amérique française*, vol. 32, no.2 (Sep. 1978), 203-228 doi: 10.7202/303690ar

Trépanier, Pierre. “Quel Corporatisme ? (1820-1965).” *Les Cahiers des Dix*. no 49 (1994): 159-212 doi: 10.7202/1015617ar

Warren, Jean-Philippe, “Le corporatisme canadien-français comme “système total”. Quatre concepts pour comprendre la popularité d’une doctrine”, *Recherches sociographiques*, vol. 45, no 2 (May-Aug 2004), 219-238

Books:

Alexander, Robert J., and Eldon M. Parker. *A History of Organized Labor in Brazil*. (Westport, Conn: Praeger, 2003)

Archibald, Clinton. *Un Québec corporatiste?: corporatisme et néo-corporatisme, du passage d’une idéologie corporatiste sociale à une idéologie corporatiste politique : le Québec de 1930 à nos jours*. (Hull, Québec: Editions Asticou, 1983).

Aubert, Roger, and David A. Boileau. *Catholic Social Teaching: An Historical Perspective*. (Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2003)

Azevedo, Thales de. *O catolicismo no Brasil: um campo para a pesquisa social*. (Rio de Janeiro: Ministério da Educação e Cultura, Serviço de Documentação, 1955)

Behiels, Michael D., and Matthew Hayday. *Contemporary Quebec: Selected Readings and Commentaries*. (Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2012).

Bélanger, André J. *L’apolitisme des idéologies québécoises le grand tournant de 1934-1936*. (Chicoutimi: Bibliothèque Paul-Émile Boulet de l’Université du Québec à Chicoutimi, 2011)

Bienvenue, Louise. *Quand la jeunesse entre en scène*. (Montréal: Boréal, 2003).

Blum, Christopher Olaf. *Critics of the Enlightenment: Readings in the French Counter-Revolutionary Tradition*, (Wilmington, ISI Books, 2004).

Carvalho, José Murilo de. *The Formation of Souls: Imagery of the Republic in Brazil*. (Notre Dame, Ind: University of Notre Dame Press, 2012).

Chenau, Philippe. *Entre Maurras et Maritain: une génération intellectuelle catholique (1920-1930)*. (Paris: Les Editions du Cerf, 1999).

- Dard, Olivier, *Le corporatisme dans l'aire francophone au XXe siècle*. (Berne: Lang, 2011).
- Diehl, Astor Antônio, *Círculos operários no Rio Grande do Sul: um projeto social-político (dos anos trinta a 1964)*. (Porto Alegre: EDIPUCRS, 1990)
- Dirks, Patricia G, *The failure of l'Action libérale nationale*. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press 1991).
- Erickson, Kenneth Paul. *The Brazilian corporative state and working-class politics* (Berkeley: University of California Press 1977).
- Ferreira, Jorge. *O populismo e sua história: debate e crítica*. (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2001). p.7
- Farias, Damião Duque de. *Em defesa da ordem: aspectos da praxis conservadora católica no meio operário em São Paulo (1930-1945)*. (São Paulo: Hucitec, 1997)
- Gagnon, Nicole, Jean Hamelin, and Nive Voisine. *Histoire du catholicisme québécois*. (Montréal: Boréal Express, 1984.)
- Gauvreau, Michael. *The Catholic Origins of Quebec's Quiet Revolution, 1931-1970*. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005).
- Gélinas, Xavier. *La droite intellectuelle québécoise et la Révolution tranquille*. (Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 2007)
- Germani, Gino. *Politica y sociedad en una época de transición: de la sociedad tradicional a la sociedad de masas*. (Buenos Aires: Paidós, 1968).
- Gomes, Angela de Castro, *Burguesia e trabalho no Brasil: política e legislação social no Brasil, 1917-1937*, (Rio de Janeiro: Campus, 1979)
- Gomes, Angela Maria de Castro. *A invenção do trabalhismo*. (Rio de Janeiro: FGV Editora 2005).
- Lenharo, Alcir. *A Sacralização da Política*, Papyrus (Campinas - 1986)
- Mainwaring, Scott. *The Catholic Church and politics in Brazil, 1916-1985* (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 1986).
- Musiedlak, Didier, *Les expériences corporatives dans l'aire latine*. (Bern: P. Lang, 2010).

Rocha, Zildo. *Helder. o dom: uma vida que marcou os rumos da Igreja no Brasil*. (Petrópolis: Editora Vozes, 1999).

Rodrigues, Cândido Moreira. *A ordem: uma revista de intelectuais católicos (1934-1945)*. (Belo Horizonte, MG: Autêntica, 2005).

Romano, Roberto. *Brasil, Igreja contra Estado: crítica ao populismo católico*. (São Paulo: Kairós Livraria e Editora, 1979).

Rouillard, Jacques. *Histoire du syndicalisme Québécois: des origines à nos jours*. (Montréal: Boréal, 1989).

Rouillard, Jacques. *Le syndicalisme québécois: deux siècles d'histoire*. (Montréal: Boréal 2004).

Ryan, Pascale. *Penser la nation: la Ligue d'action nationale, 1917-1960*. Montréal: Leméac, 2006.

de Souza, Jessie Jane Vieira. *Círculos operários: a Igreja Católica e o mundo do trabalho no Brasil*. (Rio de Janeiro: Editora UFRJ. 2002).

Villaça, Antonio Carlos. *O pensamento católico no Brasil*. (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2006).

Weffort, Francisco, *O populismo na política brasileira*, Paz e Terra, (Rio de Janeiro - 1980)

Wiarda, Howard J. *Corporatism and Comparative Politics: The Other Great "Ism"*. (Armonk: Sharpe, 1997).

Published Theses

Anduini, Guilherme Ramalho, “Em busca da Idade Nova : Alceu Amoroso Lima e os projetos católicos de organização social (1928-1945)” (Ma. diss., Universidade Estadual de Campinas, 2009)

Anduini, Guilherme Ramalho. “Os Soldados de Roma Contra Moscou: A atuação do Centro Dom Vital no cenário político e Cultural Brasileiro” (Rio de Janeiro, 1022-1948)” (Ph.d. diss., Universidade de São Paulo, 2014)

Foisy-Geoffroy, Dominique, *Les Idées Politiques des intellectuels Traditionalistes Canadiens-Français 1940-1960*, (Ph,d, Thesis, Université Laval, 2008).

Forget, Denis. “La Pensee Sociale de l’Église dans les Brochures de l’École Sociale Populaire au Québec” (Ma. diss. University of Ottawa, 1984).

Grosso, Célia Maria, “Ordem no céu, ordem na terra: A revista “A Ordem” e o ideário anticomunista das elites católicas (1930-1937)”. (Ma. diss. Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, 2007)

Moreira, Candido, “Alceu Amoroso Lima: matrizes e posições de um intelectual católico militante em perspectiva histórica - 1928-1946”. (PhD diss., Universidade Estadual de São Paulo, 2006)

Official Documents

“Tendências demográficas: Uma Análise da População com Base nos Resultados dos Censos Demográficos 1940 e 2000”, *IBGE* (Rio de Janeiro 2007).

Other Sources

Memórias, Alceu Amoroso Lima. “Alceu Amoroso Lima (Tristão de Athayde) - Canal Livre”. Filmed [June 2012]. YouTube video, 1:20:12. Posted [June 2012]. <https://youtu.be/dy089310OrI>.